

Multilevel Research in Transformational Leadership and Organizational Citizenship Behavior: Mediating Effects of Organizational Commitment, Organizational Justice, and Job Satisfaction

沈益如、童惠玲

E-mail: 9806507@mail.dyu.edu.tw

ABSTRACT

This research is aimed to discuss organizational level transformational leadership influence individual level organizational citizenship behavior by three mediation effects of individual level organizational commitment, organizational justice, and job satisfaction. A survey research was conducted using a sample from 50 school principals, 100 directors and 100 teachers collected from 50 primary schools in Chang Hwa County with 48 effective group data. The results of the study are as follows: (1) Transformational leadership in organizational level is not positively related to organizational commitment, organizational justice, job satisfaction, and organizational citizenship behavior in individual level, respectively; (2) Organizational commitment, organizational justice, and job satisfaction in individual level, respectively, is positively related to organizational citizenship behavior in individual level; (3) Organizational commitment, organizational justice, and job satisfaction in individual level, respectively, has no mediation effect on transformational leadership in organizational level to organizational citizenship behavior in individual level.

Keywords : transformational leadership、organizational commitment、organizational justice、job satisfaction、organizational citizenship behavior

Table of Contents

內容目錄 中文摘要	iii	英文摘要	iii
. . . iv 誌謝辭		v 內容目錄	v
. . . vi 表目錄		viii 圖目錄	viii
. . . x 第一章 緒論	1	第一節 研究背景與動機	1
第二節 研究目的	2	第三節 研究流程	3
第三章 文獻探討	5	第一節 組織公民行為	5
.	7	第二節 轉型領導	7
.	14	第三節 組織承諾	9
.	17	第四節 組織公平	14
.	22	第五節 工作滿意	17
.	22	第三章 研究方法	22
.	24	第一節 研究架構	22
.	30	第二節 研究設計	24
.	30	第三節 研究變數之操作性定義	30
.	40	第四節 資料分析工具	38
第四章 資料分析與結果	40	第一節 相關分析	40
第一節 差異分析	40	第二節 假設檢定	43
第二節 結論與建議	47	第一節 研究結果與討論	47
第三節 限制與建議	52	第二節 研究限制與建議	52
.	53	參考文獻	53
.	53	一、中文部分	53
.	70	二、英文部分	58
.	77	附錄A 問卷	70
.	25	附錄B 量表得分情形	77
.	26	表目錄 表 3-1 問卷抽樣層次分配表	25
.	29	表 3-2 問卷發放回收統計表	26
.	31	表 3-3 研究樣本基本資料人數統計	29
.	31	表 3-4 適配度指標	31
.	34	表 3-5 組織公民行為量表確認性因素分析	31
.	36	表 3-6 轉型領導量表確認性因素分析	34
.	37	表 3-7 組織承諾量表確認性因素分析	34
.	40	表 3-8 組織公平量表確認性因素分析	36
.	41	表 3-9 工作滿意量表確認性因素分析	37
.	42	表 4-1 描述性統計與相關分析表	40
.	42	表 4-2 教師基本資料變項對於個人層次組織公民行為、組織承諾、組織公平與工作滿意的知覺 差異情形	41
.	42	表 4-3 教師基本資料變項對組織承諾與組織公平事後檢定	42
.	43	表 4-4 校長基本資料變項對於轉型領導的知覺差異情形	42
.	44	表 4-5 校長基本資料變項對轉型領導事後檢定	42
.	44	表 4-6 組織層次轉型領導之內部一致性驗證	43
.	45	表 4-7 組織層次轉型領導對個人層次組織承諾、組織公平、工作滿意之迴歸分析	44
.	45	表 4-8 組織層次轉型領導對個人層次組織承諾、組織公平、工作滿意之迴歸分析	44
.	46	表 4-9 組織層次轉型領導、個人層次組織承諾、組織公平、工作滿意對組織公民行為之迴歸分析	44
.	46	表 4-10 假設驗證結果彙整表	46
.	4	圖目錄 圖 1-1 研究流程圖	4
.	23	圖 3-1 研究架構圖	23

REFERENCES

- 一、中文部分 王艾苓(2009), 組織公平研究對學校行政的啟示, 學校行政, 59, 96-112。王偉成(2008), 組織公民行為前置因素之研究 以台灣帷幕牆工程營建業為例, 國立東華大學高階經營管理研究所出版之碩士論文。王美慧, 唐資文, 曹秋蘭(2007), 公部門組織文化、員工工作滿足、全面品質管理與服務品質滿意度之研究, 品質學報, 14(1), 1-15。余鑑, 于俊傑, 廖珮玟(2008), 連鎖餐飲業員工人格特質、工作特性、工作滿意度之研究 以美式星期五餐廳為例, 臺北科技大學學報, 41(2), 83-110。李再長, 李俊傑, 鄭雅芬(2005), 大型企業組織生涯管理、個人生涯管理、個人人格特質、工作滿意度之關連研究, 人力資源管理學報, 5(1), 53-76。李雯智(2008), 教師組織公民行為研究之評析, 學校行政, 56, 95-106。汪昱(2005), 旅館領導行為與服務人員公民行為的關聯, 中華技術學院學報, 32, 253-271。吳明隆, 涂金堂(2005), SPSS與統計應用分析(二版), 臺北:五南。吳清基(1989), 教育與行政, 臺北:師大書苑。吳建財(2008), 轉型領導與組織公民行為:組織承諾與工作滿意之中介效果, 私立大葉大學人力資源暨公共關係學系研究所出版之碩士論文。林士奇(2001), 轉換型領導、組織承諾與組織公民行為相關之研究 以中華電信南區分公司為例, 國立中山大學人力資源管理研究所出版之碩士論文。林俊傑(2007), 組織承諾的理論與相關研究之探討, 學校行政, 51, 35-53。林鈺琴(2007), 跨層次觀點下印象管理動機與主管導向之組織公民行為的關係:社會互動與組織政治氣候的調節角色, 管理學報, 22(1), 93-111。林鈺琴, 陳心怡(2006), 組織公正對動機與信任及組織公民行為之影響, 亞太經濟管理評論, 9(2), 23-42。林鈺琴, 彭台光(2006), 多層次管理研究:分析層次的概念、理論和方法, 管理學報, 23(6), 649-675。林鈺琴(2005), 組織公民行為之跨層次分析:層級線性模式的應用, 管理學報, 22(4), 503-524。林鈺琴(2003), 以組織承諾及工作滿足為實徵切入分析組織公民行為與員工工作考績之結構模式比較, 人力資源管理學報, 3(2), 93-113。林淑姬, 樊景立, 吳靜吉, 司徒達賢(1994), 薪酬公平、程式公正與組織承諾、組織公民行為關係之研究, 管理評論, 13(2), 87-108。周昌柏(2007), 國小教師態度性與交換性組織承諾之調查研究, 花蓮教育大學學報, 24, 179-202。周昌柏, 范熾文(2006), 國小校長轉型領導、交易領導與教師工作滿意度關係之研究, 花蓮教育大學學報, 22, 255-282。范熾文(2005), 國小校長轉型領導與教師組織承諾關係之研究, 臺中教育大學學報, 19(2), 1-22。侯堂柱(2001), 轉換型領導、組織承諾與組織公民行為之關係 以台灣電子業為例, 國立中山大學人力資源管理研究所出版之碩士論文。徐文男(2008), 轉型領導與組織公民行為:組織公平與領導者部屬交換之中介效果, 私立大葉大學人力資源暨公共關係學系研究所出版之碩士論文。連俊智(2008), 學校領導實務的探究:應關注的對象層級與發展途徑, 新竹教育大學學報, 25(1), 53-78。陳韻如(2005), 企業主管領導風格、組織公平與員工生產力關係之研究—以台灣中小企業為例, 私立長榮大學經營管理研究所出版之碩士論文。陳學賢(2006), 高雄市國小校長轉型領導、學校願景發展與教師組織承諾關係之研究, 台東大學教育學報, 17(1), 77-106。張政治(2008), 高中職校長轉型領導與體育組長工作滿意關係之研究, 北體學報, 16, 269-278。張登聰(2008), 大專排球選手組織承諾之現況調查, 大專體育, 99, 65-72。張蘭芳, 莊淑惠, 廖厚翔, 張庭彰(2007), 工作特性與組織承諾對組織公民行為之影響, 勤益學報, 25(6), H-29-H-48。彭台光, 林鈺琴(2008), 組織現象和層次議題:非獨立性資料的概念和實徵, 組織與管理, 1(1), 95-121。黃永東(2008), 轉化型領導和創新產出之關聯性的探討, 品質月刊, 44(8), 18-24。黃品全(2005), 轉型與交易領導對心理賦能及服務導向組織公民行為之影響:模式建立及全職、部份工時餐飲人員比較分析, 觀光管理學報, 11(3), 233-258。黃英忠(1995), 現代管理學, 臺北:三民書局。黃柏勳(2003), 教師組織公民行為的意涵及其成因分析, 學校行政, 27, 63-79。楊濱燦, 謝庭華(2003), 工作滿意、組織公平與組織公民行為關係之研究, 文大商管學報, 8(1), 39-54。雷文谷, 熊婉君, 蕭勝豪, 宋威穎, 盧君偉(2008), 高中軟式網球選手知覺教練領導行為對選手滿意度影響之研究, 休閒產業管理學刊, 1(3), 29-43。蔡宗興, 曾瑞謙(2008), 雲嘉南地區國民中學教育人員知覺校長轉型領導與學校效能關係之研究, 學校行政, 57, 110-146。廖國鋒, 陳素子(2003), 領導者情緒智力對領導效能、部屬合作行為與組織承諾影響關係之研究, 人力資源管理學報, 3(4), 1-24。鄭仁偉, 郭智輝(2004), 個人與組織契合、工作滿足與組織公民行為關係之研究, 人力資源管理學報, 4(4), 85-104。賴明政(2004), 企業倫理行為、組織承諾、工作滿足與組織公民行為關係之研究, 企業管理學報, 60, 31-60。盧淵源, 鄭玉惠(2007), 內部服務品質因數、服務能力、工作滿意及外部服務品質關係之研究 以護理人員為例, 品質學報, 14(2), 161-179。戴有德, 陳冠仰, 陳偉仁(2007), 旅行業員工組織公平、工作滿意度、組織承諾與組織公民行為關係之研究, 第八屆管理學域學術研討會論文集, F-19-F-32。謝庭華(2003), 組織公民行為對顧客滿意關係之研究, 文大商管學報, 8(1), 79-89。蘇永富(2001), 轉換型領導、組織承諾與組織公民行為關係之研究 以派外人員為例, 國立中山大學人力資源管理研究所出版之碩士論文。顧為元(2008), 轉型領導對組織公民行為影響之研究 以組織承諾為中介變項, 教育與心理研究, 31(1), 205-231。
- 二、英文部分 Adams, J. S. (1963). Wage inequalities, productivity, and work quality. *Industrial Relations*, 3, 9-16. Alotaibi, A. G. (2001). Antecedents of organizational citizenship behavior: A study of public personnel in Kuwait. *Public Personnel Management*, 30(3), 363-376. Anna-Lena, A., & Leonard, V. C. (2005). A study of organizational citizenship behaviors in a retail setting. *Journal of Business Research*, 58(2), 151-159. Avolio, B. J., Bass, B. M., & Jung, D. I. (1995). Construct validation and norms for the Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire (MLQ-Form 5X). Binghamton, New York: SUNY Binghamton. Bass, B. M., & Avolio, B. J. (1995). *MLQ multifactor leadership questionnaire* (2nd ed.). Redwood City, California: Mind Garden. Bass, B. M. (1990). Bass & Stogdill's handbook of leadership: Theory, research, and managerial applications (3rd ed.). New York: The Free Press. Bass, B. M. (1985). Leadership and performance beyond expectations. New York: Free Press. Bateman, T. S., & Organ, D. W. (1983). Job satisfaction and the good soldier: The relationship between affect and "citizenship". *Academy of Management Journal*, 26(4), 587-595. Bies, R. J., & Shapiro, D. L. (1987). Interactional fairness judgments: The influence of causal accounts. *Social Justice Research*, 1(2), 199-218. Bliese, P. D. (2000). Within-group agreement, non-independence, and reliability: Implications for data aggregation and analysis. In K. J. Klein & S. W. Kozlowski (Eds.), *Multilevel theory, research, and methods in organizations* (pp. 349-381). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass. Bono, J. E., & Judge, T. A. (2004). Personality and transformational and transactional leadership: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 89(5), 901-910. Buchanan, B. (1974). Building

organizational commitment: The socialization of managers in work organization. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 19(4), 533-546. Bycio, P., Hackett, R. D., & Allen, J. S. (1995). Further assessments of Bass's (1985) conceptualization of transactional and transformational leadership. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 80(4), 468-478. Carmeli, A., & Colakoglu, S. N. (2005). The relationship between affective commitment and organizational citizenship behaviors: The moderating role of emotional intelligence. *Research on Emotion in Organizations*, 1, 77-93. Choi, J. (2008). Event justice perceptions and employees' reactions: Perceptions of social entity justice as a moderator. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 93(3), 513-528. Chu, C. I., Lee, M. S., Hsu, H. M., & Chen, I. C. (2005). Clarification of the antecedents of hospital nurse organizational citizenship behavior: An example from a Taiwan regional hospital. *The Journal of Nursing Research*, 13(4), 313-324. Cohen, A. (2007). Commitment before and after: An evaluation and reconceptualization of organizational commitment. *Human Resource Management Review*, 17(3), 336-354. Colquitt, J. A. (2001). On the dimensionality of organizational justice: A construct validation of a measure. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 86(3), 386-400. Donovan, D. T., Brown, T. J., & Mowen, J. C. (2004). Internal benefits of service worker-customer orientation: Job satisfaction, commitment, and organizational citizenship behaviors. *Journal of Marketing*, 68(1), 128-146. Folger, R., & Cropanzano, R. (1998). *Organizational justice and human resource management*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage. George, J. (1990). Personality, affect, and behavior in groups. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 75(2), 107-116. Greenberg, J. (1987). A taxonomy of organizational justice theories. *Academy of Management Review*, 12(1), 9-22. Hartog, D. D., Muijen, J. V., & Koopman, P. L. (1997). Transactional versus transformational leadership: An analysis of the MLQ. *Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology*, 70(1), 19-34. Hofmann, D. A. (1997). An overview of the logic and rationale of hierarchical linear models. *Journal of Management*, 23(6), 723-744. Hoppock, R. (1935). *Job satisfaction*. New York: Harper and Brothers. James, L. R. (1982). Aggregation bias in estimates of perceptual agreement. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 67(2), 219-229. Johnson, R. E., Selenta, C., & Lord, R. G. (2006). When organizational justice and the self-concept meet: Consequences for the organization and its members. *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes*, 99(2), 175-201. Judge T. A., Timothy, A., & Joyce E. B. (2001). Relationship of core self-evaluation self-esteem, generalized self-efficacy, locus of control, and emotional stability with job satisfaction and job performance: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 86(1), 80-92. Kent, A., & Chelladurai, P. (2001). Perceived transformational leadership, organizational commitment, and citizenship behavior: A case study in intercollegiate athletics. *Journal of Sport Management*, 15(2), 135-159. Kozlowski, S. W. J., & Klein, K. J. (2000). A multilevel approach to theory and research in organizations: Contextual, temporal, and emergent processes. In K. J. Klein & S. W. J. Kozlowski (Eds.), *Multilevel theory, research, and methods in organizations*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass. Koh, W. L., Richard, M., & Terberg, J. R. (1995). The effects of transformational leadership on teacher attitudes and student performance in Singapore. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 16(4), 319-333. Liao, H., & Chuang, A. (2004). A multilevel investigation of factors influencing employee service performance and customer outcomes. *Academy of Management Journal*, 47(1), 41-58. Medley, F., & Larochelle, D. R. (1995). Transformational leadership and job satisfaction. *Nursing Management*, 26(9), 64JJ-64NN. Meyers, L. S., Gamst, G., & Guarino, A. J. (2006). *Applied multivariate research: Design and interpretation*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage. Moorman, R. H. (1991). Relationship between organizational justice and organizational citizenship behaviors: Do fairness perceptions influence employee citizenship? *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 76(6), 845-855. Mowday, R. T., Porter, L. W., & Steers, R. (1982). *Employee-organization linkages*. San Diego, California: Academic Press. Mowday, R. T., Steers, R. M., & Porter, L. W. (1979). The measurement of organizational commitment. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 14(2), 224-247. Nguni, S., Slegers, P., & Denessen, E. (2006). Transformational leadership effects on teachers' job satisfaction, organizational commitment and organizational citizenship behavior in primary schools: The Tanzanian case. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 17(2), 145-177. Niehoff, B. P., & Moorman, R. H. (1993). Justice as a mediator of the relationship between methods of monitoring and organizational citizenship behavior. *Academy of Management Journal*, 36(3), 527-556. Organ, D. W. (1988). *Organizational citizenship behavior: The good soldier syndrome*. Lexington, Massachusetts: Lexington Books. Piccolo, F., & Colquitt, A. (2006). Transformational leadership and job behavior: The mediating role of core job characteristics. *Academy of Management Journal*, 49(2), 327-340. Pillai, R., Scandura, T. A., & Williams, A. (1999). Leadership and organizational justice: Similarities and differences across cultures. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 30(4), 763-779. Polat, S. (2009). Organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) display levels of the teachers at secondary schools according to the perceptions of the school administrators. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 1(1), 1591-1596. Porter, L. W., Steers, R. M., Mowday, R. T., & Boulian, P. (1974). Organizational commitment, job satisfaction and turnover among psychiatric technicians. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 59(5), 603-609. Podsakoff, P. M., Ahearne, M., & MacKenzie, S. B. (1997). Organizational citizenship behavior and the quantity and quality of work group performance. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 82(2), 262-270. Podsakoff, P. M., & MacKenzie, S. B. (1994). Organizational citizenship behaviors and sales unit effectiveness. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 31(3), 351-363. Podsakoff, P. M., & MacKenzie, S. B. (1989). A second generation measure of organizational citizenship behavior. Working paper, Indiana University. Purvanova, R. K., Bono, J. E., & Dzieweczynski, J. (2006). Transformational leadership, job characteristics and organizational citizenship performance. *Human Performance*, 19(1), 1-22. Reichers, A. E. (1985). A review and reconceptualization of organization commitment. *Academy of Management Review*, 10(3), 465-476. Robbins, S. P. (2005). *Organizational behavior* (11th ed.). New Jersey: Prentice-Hall. Roethlisberger, F. J., & Dickson, W. J. (1964). *Management and the worker*. New York: Wiley Science Editions. Shamir, B., Zakay, E., Breinin, E., & Popper, M. (1998). Correlates of charismatic leader behavior in military units: Subordinates' attitudes, unit characteristics, and superior's appraisals of leader performance. *Academy of Management Journal*, 41(4), 387-409. Smith, C. A., Organ, D. A., & Near, J. P. (1983). Organizational citizenship behavior: Its nature and antecedents. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 2(4), 653-665. Smith, P. C., Kendall, L. M. & Hulin, C. L. (1969). *The measurement of satisfaction in work and retirement*. Chicago: Rand McNally. Spector, P.

E. (1997). *Job satisfaction: Application, assessment, causes and consequences*. Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, Calif.

Stevens, J. M., Beyer, J. M., & Trice, H. M. (1978). Assessing personal, role, and organizational predictors of managerial commitment. *Academy of Management Journal*, 21(3), 380-396.

Tautum, B. C., Eberlin, R., Kottraba, C., & Bradberry, T. (2003). Leadership, decision making, and organizational justice. *Management Decision*, 41(10), 1006-1016.

Vroom, V. H. (1964). *Work and motivation*. New York: Wiley.

Wang, P., & Walumbwa, F. O. (2007). Family-friendly programs, organizational commitment, and work withdrawal: The moderating role of transformational leadership. *Journal of Personnel Psychology*, 60(2), 397-427.

Walster, E., Berscheid, E., & Walster, G. W. (1973). New directions in equity research. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 25(2), 151-176.

Walumbwa, F. O., Orwa, B., Wang, P., & Lawler, J. J. (2005). Transformational leadership, organizational commitment, and job satisfaction: A comparative study of Kenyan and U.S. financial firms. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 16(2), Summer.

Weick, K. E. (1995). *Sensemaking in organizations*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.

Weick, K. E. (1979). *The social psychology of organizing*. Reading, Massachusetts: Addison-Wesley.

Weiss, D. J., Dawis, R. V., England, G. W., & Lofquist, L. H. (1967). *Manual for the Minnesota satisfaction questionnaire*. Minneapolis, Minnesota: University of Minnesota Industrial Relations Center.

Whittington, J. L., Goodwin, V. L., & Murray, B. (2004). Transformational leadership, goal difficulty, and job design: Independent and interactive effects on employee outcomes. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 15(5), 593-606.

Williams, L. J., & Anderson, S. E. (1991). Job satisfaction and organizational commitment as predictors of organizational citizenship and in-role behaviors. *Journal of Management*, 17(3), 601-617.

Yammarino, F. J., Spangler, W. D., & Dubinsky, A. J. (1998). Transformational and contingent reward leadership: Individual, dyad, and group levels of analysis. *Leadership Quarterly*, 9(1), 27-54.

Yochi, C. C., & Spector, P. E. (2001). The Role of justice in organizations: A meta-analysis. *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Process*, 86(2), 278-321.

Yukl, G. A. (1989). *Leadership in organization*. (2nd ed.). Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.

Yukl, G. A. (2002). *Leadership in organization*. (5th ed.). Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.