

以混合多準則決策分析探討新產品開發之關鍵因素

廖呈璋、葉子明；黃開義

E-mail: 9806127@mail.dyu.edu.tw

摘要

隨著地球村時代的來臨，距離已不再是企業之間的隔閡、保護的屏障。當競爭在全球市場開始更為劇烈時，企業不得不正視新產品開發議題的重要性。

新產品開發是影響企業成功與維持競爭力的重要關鍵，而關鍵成功因素與績效衡量指標皆影響了新產品開發的成功與否。過去數年來，學術界莫不致力於探討影響新產品開發的關鍵因素，然而在實務界，多數企業與管理者之需求，還是在於提高新產品開發之成功率。

本研究以多構面因素來選取相關的關鍵成功因素與績效衡量指標。並且以多準則決策問題來看待影響新產品開發之關鍵因素。而後透過模糊決策實驗室分析法，探討關鍵因素間之關聯性，最後以模糊層級分析法，建立各準則影響新產品開發的權重。

研究結果提供了許多豐富且有價值的資訊，可以幫助管理者選擇適合的競爭策略，以便將有限的資源做最佳的分配，達到最高的效益增加，進而提昇新產品開發之成功率。

關鍵詞：新產品開發、關鍵成功因素、績效衡量指標、多準則決策分析、模糊決策實驗室分析法、模糊層級分析法

目錄

封面內頁.....	i
簽名頁.....	ii
授權書.....	iii
中文摘要.....	iv
英文摘要.....	v
誌謝.....	vi
目錄.....	vii
圖目錄.....	ix
表目錄.....	x
第一章 緒論.....	1
1.1 研究背景與動機.....	1
1.2 研究目的.....	5
1.3 研究流程.....	7
第二章 文獻探討.....	9
2.1 新產品開發.....	9
2.2 關鍵成功因素.....	14
2.3 新產品開發績效衡量.....	23
2.4 研發管理的績效衡量模式.....	35
2.5 決策實驗室分析法.....	42
第三章 研究方法與設計.....	47
3.1 研究架構.....	47
3.2 問卷調查流程.....	49
3.3 問卷內容設計.....	51
3.4 問卷架構.....	54
3.5 資料分析方法與步驟.....	57
第四章 研究結果分析.....	64

4.1 第一階段問卷樣本分析.....	64
4.2 因素分析.....	67
4.3 第二階段問卷樣本分析.....	71
4.4 模糊決策實驗室分析法之探討.....	72
4.5 模糊層級分析法之探討.....	88
第五章 結論與建議.....	96
5.1 研究結論.....	96
5.2 研究貢獻.....	99
5.3 研究限制與後續研究建議.....	101
參考文獻.....	103
附錄.....	115

圖目錄

圖1-1. 本研究流程圖.....	8
圖2-1. 新產品開發各活動階段之模式.....	13
圖2-2. 研發專案評估法之分類.....	37
圖3-1. 本研究架構圖.....	47
圖3-2. 問卷設計調查流程圖.....	50
圖3-3. Fuzzy DEMATEL三角模糊數對應之歸屬函數.....	55
圖3-4. Fuzzy AHP三角模糊數對應之歸屬函數.....	56
圖4-1. 構面間之因果關聯圖.....	76
圖4-2. 產品與顧客構面之因果關聯圖.....	78
圖4-3. 研發與技術構面之因果關聯圖.....	80
圖4-4. 財務構面之因果關聯圖.....	82
圖4-5. 品質構面之因果關聯圖.....	83
圖4-6. 管理構面之因果關聯圖.....	85
圖4-7. 主管構面之因果關聯圖.....	86
圖4-8. FAHP層級架構圖.....	89

表目錄

表2-1. 新產品開發關鍵成功因素之相關文獻整理表.....	18
表2-2. 新產品開發關鍵成功因素之相關文獻統計表.....	21
表2-3. 新產品開發績效衡量指標之相關文獻整理表.....	26
表2-4. 新產品開發績效衡量指標之相關文獻統計表.....	32
表2-5. Poh et al.之研發專案評估法特性彙整表.....	37
表2-6. Lin & Chen之研發專案評估法特性彙整表.....	39
表2-7. Brun et al.之研發專案評估法特性彙整表.....	40
表2-8. DEMATEL相關文獻研究特性彙整表.....	46
表3-1. 本研究調查之關鍵成功因素列表.....	52
表3-2. 本研究調查之績效衡量指標列表.....	53
表3-3. Fuzzy DEMATEL語意尺度及對應之三角模糊數.....	55
表3-4. Fuzzy AHP語意尺度及對應之三角模糊數.....	56
表4-1. 第一階段問卷回收情形表.....	64
表4-2. 第一階段問卷樣本結構整理表.....	65
表4-3. 第一階段問卷樣本敘述性統計整理表.....	66
表4-4. 因素分析合適性檢定表.....	67

表4-5. 因素分析結果.....	69
表4-6. 第一階段問卷信度分析表.....	70
表4-7. 第二階段問卷回收情形表.....	71
表4-8. 第二階段問卷樣本結構整理表.....	72
表4-9. 構面間之初始模糊直接關聯矩陣表.....	73
表4-10. 構面間之正規化模糊直接關聯矩陣表.....	74
表4-11. 構面間之模糊總關聯矩陣表.....	74
表4-12. 解模糊化後之總關聯矩陣表.....	75
表4-13. 構面間之列行值整理表.....	75
表4-14. 產品與顧客構面之總關聯矩陣表.....	77
表4-15. 產品與顧客構面列行值整理表.....	77
表4-16. 研發與技術構面之總關聯矩陣表.....	79
表4-17. 研發與技術構面列行值整理表.....	79
表4-18. 財務構面之總關聯矩陣表.....	81
表4-19. 財務構面列行值整理表.....	81
表4-20. 品質構面之總關聯矩陣表.....	83
表4-21. 品質構面列行值整理表.....	83
表4-22. 管理構面之總關聯矩陣表.....	84
表4-23. 管理構面列行值整理表.....	84
表4-24. 主管構面之總關聯矩陣表.....	86
表4-25. 主管構面列行值整理表.....	86
表4-26. 產品與顧客構面之模糊正倒值矩陣表.....	90
表4-27. 產品與顧客構面之模糊權重表.....	91
表4-28. 產品與顧客構面解模糊化後之權重表.....	92
表4-29. 解模糊化後各權重值整理表.....	93

參考文獻

- 1.Aaker, D.A., 1995, Strategic Market Management, 4th ed, New York: John Wiley & Sons Inc.
- 2.Afonso, P., Nunes, M., Paisana, A. and Braga, A., 2008, " The influence of time-to-market and target costing in the new product development success " , International Journal of Production Economics, Vol.115, pp.559-568.
- 3.Archer, N.P. and Ghasemzadeh, F., 1999, " An integrated framework for project portfolio selection " , International Journal of Project Management, Vol.17, No.4, pp.207-216.
- 4.Aronson, Z.H., Reilly, R.R. and Lynn, G.S., 2006, " The impact of leader personality on new product development teamwork and performance: The moderating role of uncertainty " , Journal of Engineering and Technology Management, Vol.23, pp.221-247.
- 5.Aya?, Z. and ?zdemir, R.G., 2009, " A hybrid approach to concept selection through fuzzy analytic network process " , Computers & Industrial Engineering, Vol.56, pp.368-379.
- 6.Blind, K. and Grupp, H., 1999, " Interdependencies between the science and technology infrastructure and innovation activities in German regions: empirical findings and policy consequences " , Research policy, Vol.28, pp.451-468.
- 7.Brun, A., Caridi, M., Fahmy Salama, K. and Ravelli, I., 2006, " Value and risk assessment of supply chain management improvement projects " , International Journal of Production Economics, Vol.99, pp.186-201.
- 8.Cai, J., Liu, X.D., Xiao, Z.H. and Liu, J., 2009, " Improving supply chain performance management: A systematic approach to analyzing iterative KPI accomplishment " , Decision Support System, Vol.46, pp.512-521.
- 9.Carey, C.C. and Lynn, W.E., 1997, " Balanced scorecards for new product development " , Journal of Cost Management, Vol.11, No.3, pp.12-18.
- 10.Chen, H.H., Kang, H.Y., Xing, X.Q., Lee, H.I. and Tong, Y.H., 2008, " Developing new products with knowledge management methods and process development management in a network " , Computers in Industry, Vol.59, pp.242-253.
- 11.Chen, H.H., Lee, H.I. and Tong, Y.H., 2006, " Analysis of new product mix selection at TFT-LCD technological conglomerate network under uncertainty " , Technovation, Vol.26, pp.1210-1221.
- 12.Chen, H.H., Lee, H.I. and Tong, Y.H., 2007, " Prioritization and operations NPD mix in a network with strategic partners under uncertainty " , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.33, pp.337-346.
- 13.Chien, C.F., 2002, " A portfolio-evaluation framework for selection R&D projects " , R&D Management, Vol.32, No.4, pp.359-369.
- 14.Chin, K.S., Tang, D.W., Yang, J.B., Wong, S.Y. and Wang, H.W., 2009, " Assessing new product development project risk by Bayesian network with a systematic probability generation methodology " , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.36, pp.9879-9890.
- 15.Chiu, Y.J. & Chen, Y.W., 2007, " Using AHP in patent valuation " , Mathematical and Computer Modeling, Vol.46, pp.1054-1062.
- 16.Chu, P.Y., Hsu, Y.L. and Fehling, M., 1996, " A decision support system for project portfolio selection " , Computers in Industry, Vol.32, pp.141-149.
- 17.Coldrick, S., Lawson, C.P., Ivey, P.C. and Lockwood, C., 2002, " A decision framework for R&D project selection " , IEEE Engineering Management, pp.413-418.
- 18.Chow, T. and Cao, D.B., 2008, " A survey study of critical success factors in agile software projects " , The Journal of Systems and Software, Vol.81, pp.961-971.
- 19.Clinton, B.D. and Chen, S., 1998, " Do New Performance Measures Measure Up? " , Management Accounting, October, pp.38-43.
- 20.Cooper, R.G., 1994,

“ Third-generation new product process ” , Journal of Product innovation Management, Vol.11, No.1, pp.3-14.21.Cooper, R.G., 1999, “ From experience: the invisible success factors in product innovation ” , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.16, No.2, pp.115-133.22.Cooper, R.G. and Kleinschmidt, E.J., 1987, “ New Products: what separates winners from losers? ” , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.4, No.3, pp.169-184.23.Cooper, R.G. and Kleinschmidt, E.J., 1996, “ Winning Business in Product Development: The Critical Success Factors ” , Research Technology Management, Vol.10, No.4, pp.18-29.24.Crawford, C.M., 1996, New Products Management, 5th ed., Homewood, :RD.25.Daniel, D.R., 1961, “ Management Information Crisis ” , Harvard Business Review, pp.111-121.26.Datar, S., Jordan, C.C., Kekre, S., Rajiv, S. and Srinivasan, K., 1997, “ Advantages of time-based product development in a fast-cycle industry ” , Journal of Marketing Research, Vol.34, pp.36-49.27.Debruyne, G., Rudy, M., Griffin, A., Hart, S., Hultink, E.J. and Robben, H., 2002, “ The impact of new product launch strategies on competitive reaction in industrial markets ” , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.19, No.2, pp.159-170.28.Driva, H., Pawar, K.S. and Menon, U., 2000, “ Measuring product development performance in manufacturing organizations ” , International Journal of Production Economics, Vol.63, No.2, pp.147-159.29.Dumaine, B., 1989, “ How managers can succeed through speed ” , Fortune, Vol.119, pp.54-59.30.Evans, H., Ashworth, G. and Gooth, D., 1996, “ Who needs Performance Management? ” , Management Accounting CIMA, Vol.12, pp.20-25.31.Ferguson, C.R. and Dickinson, R., 1982, “ Critical Success Factors for Directors in the Eighties ” , Business Horizons, Vol.25, No.3, pp.14-18.32.Gobeli, D.H. and Brown, D.J., 1987, “ Analyzing Product Innovations ” , Research Management, Vol.30, No.4, pp.25-31.33.Gonzalez, F.J.M., Palacios, T.M.B., 2002, “ The effect of new product development techniques on new product success in Spanish firms ” , Industrial Marketing Management, Vol.31, pp.261-271.34.Grant, R.M., 2002, Contemporary Strategy Analysis: Concepts, Techniques, Applications, 4th ed, Blackwell Publishers, Oxford.35.Griffin, A., 1997, “ PDMA research on new product development practices: Updating trends and benchmarking best practices ” , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.14, pp.429-458.36.Griffin, A. and Page, A.L., 1993, “ An interim report on measuring product development success and failure ” , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.10, pp.291-308.37.Hair, J.F., Anderson, R.E., Tatham, R.L. and Black, W.C., 1998, Multivariate data analysis, 5th ed, Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Prentice Hall.38.Hair, J.F., Black, W.C., Babin, B.J., Anderson, R.E. and Tatham, R.L., 2006, Multivariate Data Analysis, New Jersey: Pearson Education.39.Hartley, J.L., Zirger, B.J., and Kamath, R.R., 1997, “ Managing the Buyer-Supplier Interface on Time Performance in Product Development ” , Journal of Operations Management, Vol.15, pp.57-70.40.Henriksen, A.D. and Traynor, A.J., 1999, “ A Practical R&D Project-Selection Scoring Tool ” , IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management, Vol.46, No.2, pp.158-170.41.Hertenstein, J.H. and Platt, M.B., 2000, “ Performance Measures and Management Control in New Product Development ” , Accounting horizons, Vol.14, No.3, pp.303-323.42.Hill, C.W. and Johns, G.R., 2001, Strategic Management Theory: An Integrated Approach. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company Press.43.Hopkins, D.S., 1981, “ New Product Winners and Losers ” , Research Management, Vol.12, pp.12-17.44.Hsu, C.Y., Chen, K.T. and Tzeng, G.H., 2007, “ FMCDM with Fuzzy DEMATEL Approach for Customers ’ Choice Behavior Model ” , International Journal of Fuzzy Systems, Vol.9, No.4, pp.236-246.45.Kaiser, H.F., 1974, “ An Index of Factorial Simplicity ” , Psychometrika, Vol.39, No.1, pp.31-36.46.Kaufman, R., 1998, “ Preparing Useful Performance Indicators ” , Training & Development, Vol.80, No.1, pp.1-20.47.Kessler, E.H. and Bierly, P.E., 2002, “ Is Fast Really Better? An Empirical Test of the Implications of Innovation Speed ” , IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management, Vol.46, No.1, pp.2-12.48.Kuczmarski, T.D., 1992, Managing New Products: The Power of Innovation, 2nd ed., New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc.49.Kurtzman, J., 1997, “ Is Your Company off Course? Now You Can Find out Why ” , Fortune, Vol.135, No.3, pp.128-130.50.Lee, J., Lee, J. and Souder, W.E., 2000, “ Differences of organizational characteristics in new product development: cross-cultural comparison of Korea and the US ” , Technovtion, Vol.20, pp.497-508.51.Leenders, A.M. and Wierenga, B., 2002, “ The effectiveness of different mechanisms for integrating marketing and R&D ” , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.19, pp.305-317.52.Lester, D.H., 1998, “ Critical success factors for new product development ” , Research Technology Management, Vol.41, No.1, pp.36-43.53.Levitt and Pheodore, 1966, “ Innovative Imitation ” , Harvard Business Review, Vol.44, pp.63-70.54.Li, C.W. and Tzeng, G.H., 2009, “ Identification of a threshold value for the DEMATEL method using the maximum mean de-entropy algorithm to find critical services provided by a semiconductor intellectual property mall ” , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.36, pp.9891-9898.55.Li, R.J., 1999, “ Fuzzy method in group decision making ” , Computers and Mathematics with Applications, Vol.38, No.1, pp.91-101.56.Lin, C.J. and Wu, W.W., 2008, “ A causal analytical method for group decision-making under fuzzy environment ” , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.34, pp.205-213.57.Lin, C.L. and Tzeng, G.H., 2009, “ A value-created system of science (technology) park by using DEMATEL ” , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.36, pp.9683-9697.58.Lin, C.T. and Chen, C.T., 2004, “ New product go/no-go evaluation at the front end: a fuzzy linguistic approach ” , IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management, Vol.51, No.2, pp.197-207.59.Liou, J.H., Yen, L. and Tzeng, G.H., 2008, “ Building an effective safety management system for airlines ” , Journal of Air Transport Management, Vol.14, pp.20-26.60.Liu, P.L., Chen, C.W., and Tsai, C.H., 2005, “ An empirical study on the correlation between the knowledge management method and new product development strategy on product performance in Taiwan ’ s industries ” , Technovation, 25(6), pp.637-644.61.Lo, C.C., Wang, P. and Chao, K.M., 2006, “ A fuzzy group-preferences analysis method for new-product development ” , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.31, pp.826-834.62.Luu, V.T, Kim, S.Y. and Huynh T.A., 2008, “ Improving project management performance of large contractors using benchmarking approach ” , International Journal of Project Management, Vol.26, pp.758-769.63.Lynn, G.S., Abel, K.D., Valentine, W.S., Wright, R.C., 1999, “ Key factors in increasing speed to market and improving new product success rates ” , Industrial Marketing Management, Vol.11, pp.397-417.64.Ma, M.Y., Chen, C.Y. and Wu, F.G., 2007, “ A design decision-making support model for customized product color combination ” , Computers in Industry, Vol.58, pp.504-518.65.MacArthur, J.B.,

1996, " Performance measures that count: Monitoring variables of strategic importance " , Journal of Cost Management, Vol.10, No.5, pp.39-45.66.March-Chorda, I., Gunasekaran, A., Lloria-Aramburo, B., 2002, " Product development process in Spanish SMEs: an empirical research " , Technovation, Vol.22, pp.301-312.67.Matias, H.J.C., Vizan, A., Garcia, P.J. and Rios, J., 2008, " An integrated modeling framework to support manufacturing system diagnosis for continuous improvement " , Robotics and Computer-Integrated Manufacturing, Vol.24, pp.187-199.68.Matsui, Y., Filippini, R., Kitanaka, H. and Sato, O., 2007, " A comparative analysis of new product development by Italian and Japanese manufacturing companies: A case study " , International Journal of Production Economics, Vol.110, pp.16-24.69.McDonough, E.F., Kahn, K.B. and Barczak, G., 2001, " An Investigation of The Use of Global, Virtual, and Colocated New Product Development Teams " , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.18, No.2, pp.110-70.McGrath, M.E., 2004, Next Generation Product Development: how to increase productivity, cut costs, and reduce cycle time, McGraw-Hill.71.Mclvor, R. and Humphreys, P., 2004, " Early supplier involvement in the design process: lessons from the electronics industry " , Omega, The International Journal of Management Science, Vol.32, pp.179-199.72.Millson, M.R. and Wilemon, D., 2006, " Driving new product success in the electrical equipment manufacturing industry " , Technovation, Vol.26, pp.1268-1286.73.Monczka, R. and Trent, R., 1997, Purchasing and Sourcing 1997: Trends and Implications, Tempe, AZ: NAPM/CAPS.74.Naveh, E., 2005, " The Effect of Integrated Product Development on Efficiency and Innovation " , International Journal of Production Research, Vol.43, Nol.13, pp.2789-2808.75.Nijssen, E.J. and Frambach, R.T., 2000, " Determinants of the Adoption of New Product Development Tools by Industrial Firms " , Industrial Marketing Management, Vol.29, pp.121-131.76.Nunnally, J.C. and Berstein, I.H., 1994, Psychometric theory, NY: McGraw-Hill.77.Oliver, N., Dostaler, I. and Dewberry, E., 2004, " New product development benchmarks: The Japanese, North American and UK consumer electronics industries " , The Journal of High Technology Management, Vol.23, No.1, pp.371-388.78.Olson, E.M., Walker, O.C., Ruekert, R.W. and Bonner, J.M., 2001, " Patterns of cooperation during new product development among marketing, operations and R&D: implications for project performance " , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.18, pp.258-271.79.Ozer, M., and Chen, Z., 2006, " Do the best new product development practices of US companies matter in Hong Kong? " , Industrial Marketing Management, Vol.35, pp.279-292.80.Patanakul, P. and Milosevic, D., 2008, " A competency model for effectiveness in managing multiple projects " , Journal of High Technology Management Research, Vol.18, pp.118-131.81.Poh, K.L., Ang, B.W. and Bai, F., 2001, " A comparative analysis of R&D project evaluation methods " , R&D Management, Vol.31, No.1, pp.63-75.82.Poolton, J., Barclay, I., 1998, " New product development from past research to future application " , Industrial Marketing Management, Vol.27, pp.197.83.Pun, K.F. and Chin, K.S., 2005, " Online assessment of new product development performance: an approach " , Total Quality Management & Business Excellence, Vol.16, No.2, pp.157-169.84.Rockart, J.F., 1979, " Chief executives define their own data needs " , Harvard Business Review, Vol.57, No.2, pp.81-93.85.Roussel, P.A., 1991, Third Generation R&D: Managing the Link to Corporate Strategy, Boston: Harvard Business School Press.86.Ruekert, R.W. and Walker, O.C., 1987, " Marketing ' s Interaction with Other Functional Units: A Conceptual Framework and Empirical Evidence " , Journal of Marketing, Vol.51, pp.1-19.87.Saaty, T.L., 1989, " Decision making, scaling, and number crunching " , Decision Science, Vol.20, pp.404-409.88.Sands, S., and Warwick, L.M., 1977, " Successful Business Innovation: A Survey of Current Professional View " , California Management Review, Vol.20, No.2, pp.5-16.89.Santarelli, E. and Piergiovanni, R., 1996, " Analyzing Literature-based Innovation Output Indicators: the Italian Experience " , Research Policy, Vol.25, pp.689-711.90.Seyed-Hosseini, S.M., Safaei, N. and Asgharpour, M.J., 2006, " Reprioritization of failures in a system failure mode and effects analysis by decision making trial and evaluation laboratory technique " , Reliability Engineering and System Safety, Vol.91, pp.872-881.91.Sherman, J.D., Berkowitz, D. and Souder, W.E., 2005, " New Product Development Performance and the Interaction of Cross-Functional Integration and Knowledge Management, Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.22, pp.399-411.92.Sivadas, E. and Dwyer, F.R., 2000, " An examination of organizational factors influencing new product success in internal and alliance-based processes " , Journal of Marketing, Vol.64, No.1, pp.31-49.93.Song, M., Thieme, R.J., 2006, " A cross-national investigation of the R&D marketing interface in the product innovation process " , Industrial Marketing Management, Vol.35, pp.308-322.94.Song, X.M., Montoya-Weiss, M.M. and Schmidt, J.B., 1997, " Antecedents and consequences of cross functional cooperation: a comparison of R&D, manufacturing, and marketing perspectives " , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.14, pp.35-47.95.Song, X.M. and Montoya-Weiss, M.M., 1998, " Critical Development Activities for Really New versus Incremental Products " , Journal of Product Innovation Management, Vol.15, No.2, pp.124-135.96.Song, X.M. and Montoya-Weiss, M.M., 2001, " The Effect of Perceived Technological Uncertainty on Japanese New Product Development " , Academy of Management Journal, Vol.44, No.1, pp.61-80.97.Stephen, F.K. and Thomas, F.B., 2006, " Beyond critical success factors: A dynamic model of enterprise system innovation " , International Journal of Information Management, Vol.26, pp.59-69.98.Sun, H. and Wing, W.C., 2005, " Critical success factors for new product development in the Hong Kong toy industry " , Technovation, Vol.25, pp.293-303.99.Syamil, A., Doll, W. and Apigian, C.H., 2004, " Process performance in product development: measures and impacts " , European Journal of Innovation Management, Vol.7, No.3, pp.205- 217.100.Toor, S.R. and Ogunlana, S.O., 2008, " Critical COMs of success in large-scale construction projects: Evidence from Thailand construction industry " , International Journal of Project Management, Vol.26, No.4, pp.420-430.101.Topfer, A., 1995, " New product-cutting the time to market " , Long Range Planning, Vol.28, No.2, pp.61-78.102.Tsai, W.H. and Chou, W.C., 2009, " Selecting management systems for sustainable development in SMEs: A novel hybrid model based on DEMATEL, ANP, and ZOGP " , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.36, pp.1444-1458.103.Tseng, M.L., 2009, " A causal and effect decision making model of service quality expectation using grey-fuzzy DEMATEL approach " , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.36, pp.7738-7748.104.Tseng, M.L., 2009, " Using the extension of DEMATEL to integrate hotel service quality perceptions into a cause-effect model

in uncertainty ” , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.36, pp.9015-9023.105.Tzeng, G.H., Chiang, C.H. and Li, C.W., 2007, “ Evaluating intertwined effects in e-learning programs: A novel hybrid MCDM model based on factor analysis and DEMATEL ” , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.32, pp.1028-1044.106.Tzokas, N., Hultink, E.J. and Hart, S., 2004, “ Navigating the New Product Development Process ” , Industrial Marketing Management, Vol.33, No.7, pp.619-626.107.Ulrich, K.T. and Eppinger, S.D., 2007, Product Design and Development, 4th ed, McGraw-Hill, New York.108.Verona, G., 1999, “ A Resource-Based View of Product Development ” , The Academy of Management Review, Vol.24, p.133.109.Wang, M.L. and Lin, Y.H., 2008, “ To construct a monitoring mechanism of production loss by using Fuzzy Delphi method and fuzzy regression technique - A case study of IC package testing company ” , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.35, pp.1156-1165.110.Wang, W.P., 2009, “ Evaluating new product development performance by fuzzy linguistic computing ” , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.36, pp.9759-9766.111.Wu, W.W. and Lee, Y.T., 2007, “ Developing global manager ’ s competencies using fuzzy DEMATEL method ” , Expert Systems with Applications, Vol.32, pp.499-507.112.Wu, W.W., 2008, “ Choosing knowledge management strategies by using a combined ANP and DEMATDL approach ” , Expert Systems with Applications ” , Vol.35, pp.828-835.