

# Effects of Reciprocal Teaching on EFL Learners' Vocabulary Acquisition and Reading Comprehension by the Use of Picture

黃如君、曹秀蓉

E-mail: 9805884@mail.dyu.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

Vocabulary knowledge and reading comprehension ability are undoubtedly two major abilities in English language learning. For enhancing reading comprehension, Palincsar and Brown (1984) proposed "reciprocal teaching". It consists of four strategies: predicting, questioning, clarifying and summarizing under the setting of group cooperative discussion. Moreover, picture story books accompanied with English picture dictionary, which is slightly modified from Nation's (2008) model of "word cards", are also implemented to facilitate learners' vocabulary acquisition and reading comprehension. Participants, sixth graders, were divided into two groups: the experimental and the control group by placement test and each group consists of 161 learners. Therefore, participants in the experimental group are instructed with reciprocal teaching and English picture story books to explore whether their vocabulary acquisition and reading comprehension would be better than participants in the control group instructed with textbooks assigned by the Ministry of Education and regular teaching. Three tests were conducted to compare the effects of two different instructional methods from the perspectives of intentional vocabulary acquisition, incidental vocabulary acquisition and reading comprehension. Furthermore, a questionnaire of two versions for group leaders and group members was also filled out by participants to investigate their perception toward picture story books and reciprocal teaching. According to the results, participants of the experimental group got significantly better scores not only on reading comprehension but also on intentional and incidental vocabulary acquisition than participants of the control group. In addition, participants in the experimental group held obviously positive perception toward picture story books and reciprocal teaching.

Keywords : Picture Story Book、 Reciprocal Teaching、 Intentional Vocabulary Acquisition、 Incidental Vocabulary Acquisition、 Reading Comprehe

## Table of Contents

COVER PAGE	
SIGNATURE PAGE	
AUTHORIZATION PAGE.....	iii
ABSTRACT(ENGLISH).....	iv
ABSTRACT(CHINESE).....	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.....	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF FIGURES	xi
LIST OF TABLES	xii
CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background of the Problem	1
The Problem	1
Solutions	3
1.2 Purpose of the Study	5
1.3 Research Questions	6
1.4 Definition of Terms	7
1.5 Significance of the Study	9
CHAPTER II. LITERATURE REVIEW	10
2.1 Educational Values of English Picture Story Books	10
Vocabulary in English Picture Story Books	12
Picture Dictionary for Vocabulary Learning	13
Vocabulary and Reading Comprehension	15
2.2 Reciprocal Teaching	16

Reciprocal Teaching and ZPD Theory	19
Reciprocal Teaching and Scaffolding	20
Reciprocal Teaching and Metacognitive Strategies	22
Reciprocal Teaching and Independent Learning	24
2.3 Implementing of Reciprocal Teaching	25
Related Experiments of Reciprocal Teaching	25
2.4 Reciprocal Teaching and Cooperative Language Learning	27
Cooperative Language Learning	27
Reciprocal Teaching and Cooperative Language Learning	28
Collaborative Strategic Reading	29
CHAPTER III. METHODOLOGY	31
3.1 Research Design	31
3.2 Participants	32
3.3 Instruments	33
Teaching Material	. 33
Picture Dictionary	. 35
Measurement	. 36
Questionnaire	37
3.4 Research Procedure	38
3.5 Data Analysis	43
3.6 Pilot Study	43
Data Collection	43
Data Analysis	44
CHAPTER IV. RESULTS	50
4.1 Effects on Intentional Vocabulary Acquisition	50
4.2 Effects on Incidental Vocabulary Acquisition	52
4.3 Effects on Reading Comprehension	58
4.4 Learners' Perception toward Picture Story Books and Reciprocal Teaching	62
Learners' Perception toward Picture Books for Vocabulary Acquisition	63
Learners' Perception toward Reciprocal Teaching by the Use of Picture Story Books for Reading Comprehension	64
Learners' Perception toward Reciprocal Teaching for Cooperative Learning	65
CHAPTER V. CONCLUSION	69
5.1 Summary of the Main Findings	69
5.2 Pedagogical Implication	71
5.3 Limitation of the Study	73
5.4 Suggestions for Future Studies	74
Chinese References	76
English References	77
Appendix A: Importance of English	84
Appendix B: Arrangement of Picture Dictionary.....	85
Appendix C: A Placement Test	86
Appendix D: English Textbook of Kang-Hsuan Edition.....	88
Appendix E: English Picture Story Book—Thumper's Shapes	89
Appendix F: Lesson Plan for the Experimental Group	90
Appendix G: Lesson Plan for the Control Group	93
Appendix H: Worksheet for Period 3 in the Control Group	95
Appendix I: Quiz for the Experimental and Control Group	96
Appendix J: Timetable of Reading Instruction for the Experimental and Control Group	98
Appendix K(1): Questionnaire for Group Leaders (Chinese Version)	99
Appendix K(2): Questionnaire for Group Leaders (English Version)	101
Appendix L(1): Questionnaire for Group Members (Chinese Version)	104
Appendix L(2): Questionnaire for Group Members (English Version)	106

## REFERENCES

- CHINESE REFERENCE 林慧麗 (2003)。如何利用英文童書繪本輔助九年一貫課程之兒童英語教學。英語教學, 27(4), 15-24。李家同 (2003)。為什麼英語會有雙峰現象。英語教育電子月刊, 第四期。 <http://ejee.ncu.edu.tw/feature.asp?period=4&flag=4>。黃寶園 (2007)。心理與教育研究法。台北縣:華立圖書。
- ENGLISH REFERENCE Alfassi, M. (1998). Reading for meaning: The efficacy of reciprocal teaching in fostering reading comprehension in high school students in remedial reading classes. *American Educational Research Journal*, 35(2), 309-322. Algozzine, K., Algozzine, R., & Amend, S. (1997). Including high-risk learners in middle school literacy activities. In J. Flood, D. Lapp & K. Wood (Eds.), *Staff development guide for middle school teachers* (pp. 201-205). New York: Macmillan MacGraw-Hill. Allen, S. (2003). An analytic comparison of three models of reading strategy instruction. *International Review of Applied Linguistic in Language Teaching*, 41, 319-338. Brady, P. L. (1990). Improving the reading comprehension of middle school students through reciprocal teaching and semantic mapping strategies. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Oregon. Bremer, C. D., Vaughn, S., Clapper, A. T., & Kim, A-H. (2002). Collaborative strategic reading (CSR): Improving secondary students' reading comprehension skills. *Improving Secondary Education and Transition Services through Research*, 1(2), 2-9. Brester, J., Ellis, G., & Girard, D. (2004). *The primary English teacher's guide*. England: Pearson Education Limited. Brown, A. L. & Campione, J. (1986). Psychological theory and the study of learning disability. *American Psychology*, 41(10), 1059-1068. Brown, A. L., Palincsar, A. S., & Armbruster, B. B. (1984). Instructing comprehension-fostering activities in interactive learning situations. In H. Mandl, N. Stein & T. Trabasso. (Eds.), *Learning and comprehension of text* (pp.255-286). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates. Brown, A. L. and Palincsar, A. S. (1987). Reciprocal teaching of comprehension strategies: A natural history of one program for enhanced learning. In J.D. Day and J. G. Borkowski (Eds.), *Intelligence and exceptionality: New direction for theory, assessment, and instructional practices* (pp.81-132). Norwood, NJ: Ablex Publishing Company. Brown, A. L. & Palincsar, A. S. (1989). Guided, cooperative learning and individual knowledge acquisition. In L. B. Resnick (Eds.), *Knowing, learning and instruction: Essays in honor of Robert Glaser* (pp.393-451). Hilldale, NJ: Erlbaum. Brown, A. L. & Smiley, S. S. (1978). The development of strategies for studying text. *Child Development*, 49(4), 1076-1088. Buer, J. (1993). *The Mind's Journey from Novice to Expert*. *American Educator*, 17(2), 6-45. Cameron, L. (2001). *Teaching languages to young learners*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Coelho, E. (2006). Cooperative Learning: Foundation for a communicative curriculum. In K. Carolyn (Eds.), *Cooperative language learning* (pp. 31-50). New Jersey: Englewood Cliffs. Cross, D. R., & Paris, S. G. (1988). Developmental and instructional analyses of children's metacognition and reading comprehension. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 80 (2), 131-142. Diane, B. & Jean, O. (1993). Implementing reciprocal teaching with fourth- and fifth- grade students in content area reading. Paper presented at the meeting of Center for the Study of reading, Urbana, IL, U.S.A. Doolittle, P. E., Hicks, D., Triplett, C. F., Nichols, W. D., & Young, C. A. (2006). Reciprocal teaching for reading comprehension in higher education: A strategy for fostering the deeper understanding of texts. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education*, 17(2), 106-118. Elley, W. (1989). Vocabulary acquisition from listening to stories. *Reading research Quarterly*, 24(2), 174-187. Ellis, G. & Brewster, J. (1991). *The storytelling handbook for primary teachers*. Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England. Ghai, G. & Kawtharani, A. (2006). Using cooperative learning with primary school students. In S. G. McCafferty, G. M. Jacobs & A. C. D. Iddings (Eds.), *Cooperative learning and second language teaching* (pp. 74-91). Cambridge: Cambridge press. Ghosn, K. I. (2002). Four good reasons to use literature in primary school ELT. *ELT Journal*, 56, 172-178. Gilroy, A. & Moore, D. W. (1988). Reciprocal teaching of comprehension-fostering and comprehension-monitoring activities with ten primary school girls. *Educational Psychology*, 8, 41-49. Greenway, C. (2002). The Process, pitfalls and benefits of implementing a reciprocal teaching. *Educational Psychology in Practice*, 18(2), 113-137. Hashey, J. M., & Connors, D. J. (2003). Learn from our journey: Reciprocal teaching action research. *The Reading Teacher*, 57(3), 224-232. Huck, S. C., Hepler, S., & Hickman, J. (1987). *Children's literature in elementary school*. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston. Hunt, P. (1994). *An instruction to children's literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Hogewood, R. H. (2004). Building a reading Bridge: The impact of reciprocal teaching on poor readers in ninth social studies. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Maryland. Honig, B. (2001). *Teaching our children to read*. American: Corwin Press. Hulstijn, J. H. (2001). Intentional and incidental second language vocabulary learning: a reappraisal of elaboration, rehearsal and automaticity. In P. Robinson (Ed.), *Cognition and second language instruction* (pp.258-286). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Hutchins, P. (1968). *Rosie's walk*. New York: Macmillan. Jacobs, G. M. & McCafferty, S. G. (2006). Connections between cooperative learning and second language learning and teaching. In S. G. McCafferty, G. M. Jacobs & A. C. D. Iddings (Eds.), *Cooperative learning and second language teaching* (pp.18-29). Cambridge: Cambridge press. Johnson, D., Johnson, R., & Holubec, E. (1994). *Cooperative Learning in the Classroom*. Alexandria, Va.: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development. Kelly, M., Moore, D. W. & Tuck, B. F. (1994). Reciprocal teaching in a regular primary school classroom. *Journal of Educational Research*, 88(1), 53-61. Klingner, J. K. & Vaughn, S. (1996). Reciprocal teaching of reading comprehension strategies for students with learning disabilities who use English as a second language. *Elementary School Journal*. 96(3), 275-293. Klingner, J. K. & Vaughn, S. (1998). Using collaborative strategic reading. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 30(6), 32-37. Klingner, J. K. & Vaughn, S. (2000). The helping behaviors of fifth graders while using collaborative strategic reading during ESL content class. *TESOL Quarterly*, 34(1), 69-98. Krashen, D. S. (1982). *Principles and practice in second language acquisition*. Oxford: Pergamon Press. Liao, Y. F. (2000). A study of Taiwanese junior high school students' EFL learning motivation and learning strategies.

Unpublished master thesis, National Changhua University of Education, Changhua, ROC. Leanne, C. (2003). Reciprocal teaching strategy and adult high school students. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Kean University. Lederer, J. M. (1997). Reciprocal teaching of social studies in elementary classrooms. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of New Mexico. Lederer, J. M. (2000). Reciprocal teaching of social studies in inclusive elementary classrooms. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 33(1), 91-106. LeFevre, D. M., Moore, D. W. & Wilkinson, I. A. G. (2003). Tutee-assisted reciprocal teaching: Cognitive bootstrapping for poor decoders. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*, 73, 37-58. Loukia, N. (2006). Teaching young learners through stories: the development of a handy parallel syllabus. *The Reading Matrix*, 6(1), 25-40. Lysynchuk, L. M., Pressley, M., & Vye, N.J. (1990). Reciprocal teaching improves standardized reading-comprehension performance in poor comprehenders. *The Elementary School Journal*, 90(5), 469-484. Maghsoudi, M. (2007). Type of task and type of dictionary in incidental vocabulary acquisition. *South Asian Language Review*, 17(2), 16-28. Male, M. (1988). Special magic: Computers, classroom strategies, and exceptional students. Mountain View CA: Mayfield. Nation, P. (2008). Strategies for vocabulary learning. *English Teaching and Learning*. (pp. 68-77). Republic of China: Taipei. Nagy, W. E. (1988). Teaching vocabulary to improve reading comprehension. Newark, DE: International Reading Association. Oster, L. (2001). Using the think-aloud for reading instruction. *The Reading Teacher*, 55(1), 64-69. Oxford, R., & Nyikos, M. (1989). Variables of affecting choice of language learning strategies by university students. *The Modern Language Journal*, 73, 404-419. Palincsar, A. S. (1986). The role of dialogue in providing scaffolding instruction. *Educational Psychologist*, 21, 73-98. Palincsar, A. S., & Brown, A.L. (1984). Reciprocal teaching of comprehension-fostering and comprehension-monitoring activities. *Cognition and Instruction*, 1, 117-175. Palincsar, A. S., & Klenk, L. (1991). Dialogues promoting reading comprehension. In B. Means, C. Chelemer, & M. S. Knapp (Eds.), *Teaching advanced skills to at-risk student* (pp. 112-140). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass. Palincsar, A. S., Ransom, K. & Derber, S. (1988). Collaborative research and development of reciprocal teaching. *Educational Leadership*, 46(4), 37-40. Paris, S. G. & Myers, M. (1981). Comprehension monitoring, memory, and study strategies of good and poor readers. *Journal of Reading Behavior*, 13, 5-22. Paris, S. G. & Jacobs, J. E. (1984). The benefits of informed instruction for children's reading awareness and comprehension skills. *Child Develop*, 55, 2083-2093. Richards, J. C., & Rodgers, T. S. (2003). *Approaches and methods in language teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Rieck, B. J. (1977). How content area teachers telegraph messages against reading. *Journal of Reading*, 20(8), 646-648. Robinson, F. P. (1961). Study skills for students in secondary school. *The Reading Teacher*, 15, 29-33. Rosenshine, B. (1983). Teaching functions in instructional programs. *Elementary School Journal*, 83, 335-351. Rosenshine, B. & Meiter, C. (1994). Reciprocal teaching: A review of the research. *Review of Educational Research*, 64(4), 479-530. Russell, D. L. (2005). *Literature for Children*. Boston, MA: Pearson Education, Inc. Schmitt, N. (2000). *Vocabulary in language teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Sheu, H. C. (2006). The challenges of using English picture story books with primary school students in Taiwan. *English Teaching and Learning, special issue* (1), 39-60. Singleton, R. (1997). Study skills and the middle school: Pathways to effective present and continued learning. In J. Flood, D Lapp, and K.D. Wood (Eds.), *Staff development guide for middle school teachers* (pp.171-184). New York: Macmillan/McGraw-Hill. Slavin, R. (1995). *Cooperative learning: Theory, research and practice*. New York: Prentice Hall. Smith, F. R. & Feathers, K. M. (1983). Teacher and student perceptions of content area reading. *Journal of Reading*, 26(4), 348-354. Spedding, S., & Chan, L. K. S. (1993). Metacognition, word identification, and reading comprehension. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 18(1), 91-100. Spedding, S., & Chan, L. K. S. (1994). Metacognition abilities in word identification: Assessment and instruction. *Australian Journal of Remedial Education*, 26(3), 8-12. Stewig, J. W. (1995). *Looking at picture books*. WI: Highsmith Press. Swanson, P. J., & De La Paz, S. (1998). Teaching effective comprehension strategies to students with learning and reading disabilities. *Intervention in School and Clinic*, 33(4), 209-218. Tharp, R. G., & Gallimore, R. (1988). *Rousing minds to life: teaching learning, and schooling in social context*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press. Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in Society: The development of higher psychological process*. In M. Cole, V. John-Steiner, S. Scribner & E. Souberman, (Eds.), Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. West, M. (1953). *A general service list of English words*. London: Longman, Green. Wood, D. J., Bruner, J. S., & Ross, G. (1976). The role of tutoring in problem solving. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, 17, 89-100. Wright, A. (2004). *Pictures for language learning*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Yap, K. O. (1979). Vocabulary: building blocks of comprehension? *Journal of Reading Behavior*, 1, 215-219.