

# A comparative study for vietnam environmental impact assessment system = 越南環境影響評估系統比較研究

Vu Thi Thanh Huan、魏漣邦

E-mail: 9805418@mail.dyu.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

After more than 15 years of experience with Environmental Impact Assessment, the government of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam is set to introduce a new Law in Environmental Protection (LEP), in November 2005, in which Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) and Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) were amended and complemented. In general, the new LEP has been recorded as an achievement in environmental management. However, evidence shows that EIA has not yet evolved satisfactorily in Vietnam.

Wood ' s criteria are used to assess the Vietnam EIA system. These criteria focus on the requirements and operation of EIA process. Three different EIA systems are compared in this study: the United State of America - a developed country, Taiwan - a quasi-developed country and Vietnam - a developing country.

Based on the result of this research, various shortcomings of the Vietnam EIA system are revealed. These include: lax legal framework, deficiencies in cumulative impact and alternative of action, inadequacy in scoping and lack of effective public participation.

On the basis of this analysis, the opportunities for taking advantage of the current foreign EIA systems for strengthening that of the Vietnam are identified.

Keywords : Environmental Impact Assessment comparison、 Vietnam、 USA、 Taiwan、 Wood model in EIA

## Table of Contents

ABSTRACT	iv
摘要	v
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	vi
CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF FIGURES	xii
LIST OF TABLES	xiii
LIST OF TABLES	xiii
ABBREVIATIONS	xiv
Chapter 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background of the Study	1
1.2 Vietnam EIA – a case study	2
1.3 Baseline system selection	3
1.4 Objectives of the study	5
1.5 Scope of work	5
1.6 Framework of the study	6
Chapter 2 LITERATURE REVIEW	7
2.1 Environmental impact assessment process	7
2.1.1 Nature of environmental impact assessment	7
2.1.2 Elements of the EIA process	8
2.2 Development of EIA in the world	11
2.3 EIA in the United States of America	12
2.4 EIA in Taiwan	16
2.5 Development and current status of Vietnam EIA system	19
2.5.1 EIA in Vietnam: the historical context	19
2.5.2 Administration of EIA in Vietnam	22
2.5.3 Procedural framework for EIA in Vietnam	24

Chapter 3 STUDY METHODS	29
3.1 Data Collection	29
3.2 Data Analysis	30
3.3 The Wood model	30
3.3.1 Selection a criteria to evaluate	30
3.3.2 Criteria of Wood model	32
3.4 Review of criteria	33
3.4.1. Legal basis of EIA System	33
3.4.2 Coverage of EIA Systems	33
3.4.3 Alternatives in EIA Process	35
3.4.4 Screening of Actions	35
3.4.5 Scoping of Impact	35
3.4.6 EIA Report Preparation	36
3.4.7 EIA Report Review	36
3.4.8 Decision Making Process	36
3.4.9 Monitoring and Auditing of actions	37
3.4.10 Mitigation of Impact	39
3.4.11 Consultation and Participation	39
3.4.12 EIA System Monitoring	40
3.4.13 Cost and Benefits of EIA System	40
3.4.14 Strategic Environmental Assessment	41
Chapter 4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	43
4.1 Legal basis of EIA system (Criterion 1)	43
4.1.1 United States of America	43
4.1.2 Taiwan	44
4.1.3 Vietnam	45
4.1.4 Synthesis and Comparison	47
4.2 Coverage of EIA system (Criterion 2)	48
4.2.1 United States of America	48
4.2.2 Taiwan	49
4.2.3 Vietnam	50
4.2.4 Synthesis and Comparison	51
4.3 Alternatives in EIA Process (Criterion 3)	54
4.3.1 United States of America	54
4.3.2 Taiwan	55
4.3.3 Vietnam	55
4.3.4 Synthesis and Comparison	56
4.4 Screening of actions (Criterion 4)	57
4.4.1 United States of America	57
4.4.2 Taiwan	60
4.4.3 Vietnam	60
4.4.4 Synthesis and Comparison	61
4.5 Scoping of impacts (Criterion 5)	62
4.5.1 United States of America	62
4.5.2 Taiwan	63
4.5.3 Vietnam	64
4.5.4 Synthesis and Comparison	65
4.6. EIA report preparation (Criterion 6)	66
4.6.1 United States of America	66
4.6.2 Taiwan	67
4.6.3 Vietnam	68
4.6.4 Synthesis and Comparison	69
4.7 EIA report review (Criterion 7)	69

4.7.1 United States of America	69
4.7.2 Taiwan	71
4.7.3 Vietnam	74
4.7.4 Synthesis and Comparison	74
4.8 Decision making Process (Criterion 8)	75
4.8.1 United States of America	75
4.8.2 Taiwan	76
4.8.3 Vietnam	79
4.8.4 Synthesis and Comparison	79
4.9 Monitoring and Auditing of actions (Criterion 9)	80
4.9.1 United States of America	80
4.9.2 Taiwan	81
4.9.3 Vietnam	82
4.9.4 Synthesis and Comparison	82
4.10 Mitigation of impacts (Criterion 10)	84
4.10.1 United States of America	84
4.10.2 Taiwan	85
4.10.3 Vietnam	85
4.10.4 Synthesis and Comparison	86
4.11 Consultation and Participation (Criterion 11)	87
4.11.1 United States of America	87
4.11.2 Taiwan	88
4.11.3 Vietnam	89
4.11.4 Synthesis and Comparison	90
4.12 EIA System Monitoring (Criterion 12)	91
4.12.1 United States of America	91
4.12.2 Taiwan	92
4.12.3 Vietnam	93
4.12.4 Synthesis and Comparison	94
4.13 Cost and Benefits of EIA System (Criterion 13)	95
4.13.1 United States of America	95
4.13.2 Taiwan	95
4.13.3 Vietnam	96
4.13.4 Synthesis and Comparison	97
4.14 Strategic Environmental Assessment (Criterion 14)	98
4.14.1 United States of America	98
4.14.2 Taiwan	99
4.14.3 Vietnam	100
4.14.4 Synthesis and Comparison	101
4.15 Overall review for the Vietnam EIA system	102
4.15.1 Cooperation between authorities	104
4.15.2 Legal Status	104
4.15.3 Public Participations	105
CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	106
5.1 Conclusions	106
5.2 Recommendations	107
REFERENCES	108

## REFERENCES

- 1.AIDIS - Inter-American Association of Sanitary and Environmental Engineering (2002). Fundamentals of Environmental Impact Assessment.
- 2.Ahmad, B., Wood, C. (2002). A Comparative evaluation of the EIA systems in Egypt, Turkey and Tunisia. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol. 22: 213-234.
- 3.Barker, A. and Wood, C. (1999). An evaluation of EIA system performance in eight EU countries.

Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol.19: 387-404. Bruhn-Tysk, S. and Eklund, M. (2002). Environmental Impact Assessment-A Tool for Sustainable Development. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol.22: 129-144.

5. CEQ, Council on Environmental Quality (2007). A Citizen's Guide to the NEPA - Having Your Voice Heard. Available from: <http://ceq.hss.doe.gov/nepa/nepanet.htm> (Assessed in May, 2009).

6. The Center for International Environmental Law (CIEL, 2004), A comparison of six environmental impact assessment regimes. Available from: <http://www.CIEL,2004.org/Publications/AComparisonof6EnvReg.pdf> (Accessed in January, 2009)

7. Doberstein, B. (2003). Environmental Impact Assessment in Vietnam. Impact Assessment and Project Appraisal, Vol.21: 25-42.

8. Doberstein, B. (2004). EIA models and capacity building in Vietnam: an analysis of development aid programs. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol.24: 283-318.

9. Eccleston, C.H. (2008), NEPA and Environmental Planning: Tools, Techniques, and Approaches for Practitioners. Taylor & Francis Group, LLC.

10. El-Fadl, K. and El-Fadel, M. (2004). Comparative assessment of EIA systems in MENA countries: challenges and prospects. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol. 24: 553-593.

11. Glasson, J., Therivel, R. and Chadwick, A. (2005). Introduction to Environmental Impact Assessment: Principles and Procedures, Process, Practice and Prospects. 3rd ed. Published by Taylor & Francis Routledge

12. Hildebrand, S.G., Cannon, J.B. (1993). Environmental Analysis: The NEPA Experience CRC Press.

13. Hoang, M.S (2008). Overview of Law on Environmental Protection in Vietnam. Vietnam Environment Administration – Ministry of Natural Resource and Environment (in Vietnamese).

14. Hostovsky, C., Maclaren, V. (2006). The Role of Public Consultation in Vietnamese Waste and Other EIAs. Available from: <http://individual.utoronto.ca/hostovsky/cambodia.pdf> (Accessed in October, 2008)

15. Jain, R.K, Urban, L.V., Stacey, G.S and Balbach, H.E. (2001). Environmental Assessment. 2nd. Published by McGraw-Hill

16. Jou, J.J and Liaw, S.L (2006). A study of establishment of EIA system in the Taiwan region. Journal of Environmental Assessment Policy and Management, Vol. 8, No.4.

17. Legislative Council Secretarial, LCS (2004). The Legislative Council of Hong Kong. Information Note. Available from: <http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr03-04/english/sec/library/0304in20e.pdf> (Accessed in February, 2009)

18. Leu, W.S, William, W.P. and Bark, A.W. (1996). Development of an Environmental Impact Assessment Evaluation Model and Its Application: Taiwan Case Study. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol.16:115-133.

19. Le, H.N (2008). Workshop on Experience with Development of SEA System in Vietnam (in Vietnamese).

20. Liou, M.L, and Yu, Y., H. (2004). Development and implementation of Strategic Environmental Assessment in Taiwan. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol. 24, Issue 3: 337-350.

21. Luther, L. (2007). The National Environmental Policy Act: Streamlining NEPA. Congressional Research Service. The Library of Congress, Washington, D.C. Available from <http://www.nationalaglawcenter.org/assets/crs/RL33267.pdf> (Accessed in December, 2008)

22. Modak, P. and Biswas, A.K. (1999). Conducting Environmental Impact Assessment for Developing Countries. United Nations University Press. Unites States of America. Available from: <http://books.google.com/books?id=5TSQIEJe2MMC&printsec=frontcover>

23. National Conference on Law Environmental Protection. Available from: [http://www.nea.gov.vn/thongtinmt/noidung/btnmt\\_31\\_5\\_07.htm](http://www.nea.gov.vn/thongtinmt/noidung/btnmt_31_5_07.htm) (in Vietnamese) (Accessed in October, 2008)

24. Nguyen, K.K (2007). Status of Environmental Impact Assessment in Vietnam. Natural Resources and Environment Magazine, No 7 (45)

25. Nguyen, D.M (2008). Lecture Environmental Impact Assessment. Ministry of Education and Training, University of Agriculture (in Vietnamese).

26. NEPanet (1997). Considering Cumulative Effects Under the National Environmental Policy Act. Available from: <http://ceq.hss.doe.gov/NEPA/ccenepa/ccenepa.htm> (Accessed in May, 2009)

27. Ortolano, L. (1997). Environmental Regulation and Impact Assessment. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

28. Paoletto, G. (2003). Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA). Lecture Notes Available from: <http://www.gdrc.org/uem/eia/lecture-notes.html> (Accessed in July, 2008)

29. Riffat, R. and Khan, D. (2006). A Review and Evaluation of the Environmental Impact Assessment Process in Pakistan. Journal of Applied Sciences in Environmental Sanitation, Vol.1: 17-29.

30. Regeringskansliet, Utrikesdepartementet (2003). Country Strategy for Swedish development co-operation with Vietnam 2004-2003. Stockholm

31. Smith, M.D., (2005). Recent Trends in Cumulative impact case law. Available from: <http://www.shipleygroup.com/news/articles/0505.pdf> (Accessed in February, 2009)

32. Socialist Republic of Vietnam, SRV (2006). Law on Environmental Protection. Published by Judicial Publishing House, Hanoi.

33. Taiwan Environmental Protection Administration Executive Yuan R.O.C. Environmental Impact Assessment Act 2003. Available from: <http://law.epa.gov.tw/en/laws/eia.html> Accessed in September, 2008

34. The European Commission - Proceedings of the second and third workshop on EIA - An output of the project " Capacity building for EIA in Vietnam " , Available from: <http://www.vub.ac.be/MEKO/Vietnam/EU/home.html> (Accessed in September, 2008)

35. Tang, S.Y., Tang, C.P and W-HL Carlos, W.HL (2005). Public participation and environmental impact assessment in Mainland China and Taiwan: Political foundations of environmental management. The Journal of Development Studies, Vol.41, No.1:1-32.

36. United States Environmental Protection Agency <http://www.epa.gov/lawsregs/laws/nepa.html> (Accessed in November, 2008).

37. UNEP, 2002. EIA Training Resource Manual. Available from: [http://www.unep.ch/etu/publications/EIAMan2\\_ovhds.htm](http://www.unep.ch/etu/publications/EIAMan2_ovhds.htm), (Accessed in February, 2008).

38. Vietnam Environment Administration [http://www.nea.gov.vn/39.Vietnamnet Bridge](http://www.nea.gov.vn/39.Vietnamnet%20Bridge) <http://english.vietnamnet.vn/social/2008/09/804796/> ( Accessed in September 2008)

40. Vietnamnet <http://vietnamnet.vn/khoahoc/2008/05/782950/> (Accessed in May 2008) (by Vietnamese).

41. Wang, Y., Richard, K.M. and Cashmore, M. (2003). Environmental impact assessment of projects in the People ' s Republic of China: new law, old problems. Environmental Impact Assessment Review. Vol.23: 543-579.

42. Wood, C. (1995). Environmental Impact Assessment: A Comparative Review. Longman Group Limited, England.

43. Wood, C. (2003). Environmental Impact Assessment in Developing Countries: An Overview. Conference on, New Directions in Impact Assessment for Development: Methods and Practice. EIA Centre. University of Manchester. Available from: <http://www.enterprise-impact.org.uk/pdf/Wood.pdf> (Accessed in September 2008)

44. Vu, Q. (2008). <http://www.toquoc.gov.vn/Thongtin/Thoi-Su/Danh-Gia-Tac-Dong-Moi-Truong-Van-Con-Nhung-Lo-Hong.html> (in Vietnamese) (Accessed in

August, 2008)