

越南環境影響評估系統比較研究

Vu Thi Thanh Huan、魏漣邦

E-mail: 9805418@mail.dyu.edu.tw

摘要

越南政府在執行環境影響評估制度15年後，2005年11月制定了「環境保護法」，以補強「政策環境評估」與「環境影響評估」相關條文。「環境保護法」是越南環境管理的一項重大成就，然而環境影響評估執行成效仍難令人滿意。

本研究採用Wood 14項準則評估越南環境影響評估制度。這些準則聚焦於環境影響評估的需求與運作。本研究就開發中國家越南的環境影響評估制度，與已開發國家的美國與即將進入已開發國家的台灣進行比較，以探討改善之道。

現行越南環境影響評估制度之缺失包括法律架構的鬆散、累積影響與替代方案評估的欠缺、範疇界定的不足、有效公共參與的缺乏。

本研究藉由先進國家立法經驗，指出越南可以強化其環境影響評估制度的機會。

關鍵詞：環境影響評估制度比較、Wood環境影響評估模型、越南環境保護法、美國國家環境政策法、台灣環境影響評估法

目錄

ABSTRACT iv

摘要 v

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS vi

CONTENTS vii

LIST OF FIGURES xii

LIST OF TABLES xiii

LIST OF TABLES xiii

ABBREVIATIONS xiv

Chapter 1 INTRODUCTION 1

1.1 Background of the Study 1

1.2 Vietnam EIA – a case study 2

1.3 Baseline system selection 3

1.4 Objectives of the study 5

1.5 Scope of work 5

1.6 Framework of the study 6

Chapter 2 LITERATURE REVIEW 7

2.1 Environmental impact assessment process 7

2.1.1 Nature of environmental impact assessment 7

2.1.2 Elements of the EIA process 8

2.2 Development of EIA in the world 11

2.3 EIA in the United States of America 12

2.4 EIA in Taiwan 16

2.5 Development and current status of Vietnam EIA system 19

2.5.1 EIA in Vietnam: the historical context 19

2.5.2 Administration of EIA in Vietnam 22

2.5.3 Procedural framework for EIA in Vietnam 24

Chapter 3 STUDY METHODS 29

3.1 Data Collection 29

3.2 Data Analysis 30

3.3 The Wood model 30

3.3.1 Selection a criteria to evaluate 30

3.3.2 Criteria of Wood model 32

3.4 Review of criteria 33

3.4.1. Legal basis of EIA System	33
3.4.2 Coverage of EIA Systems	33
3.4.3 Alternatives in EIA Process	35
3.4.4 Screening of Actions	35
3.4.5 Scoping of Impact	35
3.4.6 EIA Report Preparation	36
3.4.7 EIA Report Review	36
3.4.8 Decision Making Process	36
3.4.9 Monitoring and Auditing of actions	37
3.4.10 Mitigation of Impact	39
3.4.11 Consultation and Participation	39
3.4.12 EIA System Monitoring	40
3.4.13 Cost and Benefits of EIA System	40
3.4.14 Strategic Environmental Assessment	41
Chapter 4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	43
4.1 Legal basis of EIA system (Criterion 1)	43
4.1.1 United States of America	43
4.1.2 Taiwan	44
4.1.3 Vietnam	45
4.1.4 Synthesis and Comparison	47
4.2 Coverage of EIA system (Criterion 2)	48
4.2.1 United States of America	48
4.2.2 Taiwan	49
4.2.3 Vietnam	50
4.2.4 Synthesis and Comparison	51
4.3 Alternatives in EIA Process (Criterion 3)	54
4.3.1 United States of America	54
4.3.2 Taiwan	55
4.3.3 Vietnam	55
4.3.4 Synthesis and Comparison	56
4.4 Screening of actions (Criterion 4)	57
4.4.1 United States of America	57
4.4.2 Taiwan	60
4.4.3 Vietnam	60
4.4.4 Synthesis and Comparison	61
4.5 Scoping of impacts (Criterion 5)	62
4.5.1 United States of America	62
4.5.2 Taiwan	63
4.5.3 Vietnam	64
4.5.4 Synthesis and Comparison	65
4.6. EIA report preparation (Criterion 6)	66
4.6.1 United States of America	66
4.6.2 Taiwan	67
4.6.3 Vietnam	68
4.6.4 Synthesis and Comparison	69
4.7 EIA report review (Criterion 7)	69
4.7.1 United States of America	69
4.7.2 Taiwan	71
4.7.3 Vietnam	74
4.7.4 Synthesis and Comparison	74
4.8 Decision making Process (Criterion 8)	75
4.8.1 United States of America	75
4.8.2 Taiwan	76

4.8.3 Vietnam	79
4.8.4 Synthesis and Comparison	79
4.9 Monitoring and Auditing of actions (Criterion 9)	80
4.9.1 United States of America	80
4.9.2 Taiwan	81
4.9.3 Vietnam	82
4.9.4 Synthesis and Comparison	82
4.10 Mitigation of impacts (Criterion 10)	84
4.10.1 United States of America	84
4.10.2 Taiwan	85
4.10.3 Vietnam	85
4.10.4 Synthesis and Comparison	86
4.11 Consultation and Participation (Criterion 11)	87
4.11.1 United States of America	87
4.11.2 Taiwan	88
4.11.3 Vietnam	89
4.11.4 Synthesis and Comparison	90
4.12 EIA System Monitoring (Criterion 12)	91
4.12.1 United States of America	91
4.12.2 Taiwan	92
4.12.3 Vietnam	93
4.12.4 Synthesis and Comparison	94
4.13 Cost and Benefits of EIA System (Criterion 13)	95
4.13.1 United States of America	95
4.13.2 Taiwan	95
4.13.3 Vietnam	96
4.13.4 Synthesis and Comparison	97
4.14 Strategic Environmental Assessment (Criterion 14)	98
4.14.1 United States of America	98
4.14.2 Taiwan	99
4.14.3 Vietnam	100
4.14.4 Synthesis and Comparison	101
4.15 Overall review for the Vietnam EIA system	102
4.15.1 Cooperation between authorities	104
4.15.2 Legal Status	104
4.15.3 Public Participations	105
CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	106
5.1 Conclusions	106
5.2 Recommendations	107
REFERENCES	108

參考文獻

- 1.AIDIS - Inter-American Association of Sanitary and Environmental Engineering (2002). Fundamentals of Environmental Impact Assessment.
- 2.Ahmad, B., Wood, C. (2002). A Comparative evaluation of the EIA systems in Egypt, Turkey and Tunisia. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol. 22: 213-234.
- 3.Barker, A. and Wood, C. (1999). An evaluation of EIA system performance in eight EU countries. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol.19: 387-404.
- 4.Bruhn-Tysk, S. and Eklund, M. (2002). Environmental Impact Assessment-A Tool for Sustainable Development. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol.22: 129-144.
- 5.CEQ, Council on Environmental Quality (2007). A Citizen's Guide to the NEPA - Having Your Voice Heard. Available from: <http://ceq.hss.doe.gov/nepa/nepanet.htm> (Assessed in May, 2009).
- 6.The Center for International Environmental Law (CIEL, 2004), A comparison of six environmental impact assessment regimes. Available from: <http://www.CIEL, 2004.org/Publications/AComparisonof6EnvReg.pdf> (Accessed in January, 2009)
- 7.Doberstein, B. (2003). Environmental Impact Assessment in Vietnam. Impact Assessment and Project Appraisal, Vol.21: 25-42.
- 8.Doberstein, B. (2004). EIA models and capacity building in Vietnam: an analysis of development aid programs. Environmental Impact Assessment Review, Vol.24: 283-318.
- 9.Eccleston, C.H. (2008),

NEPA and Environmental Planning: Tools, Techniques, and Approaches for Practitioners. Taylor & Francis Group, LLC.10.El-Fadl, K. and El-Fadel, M. (2004). Comparative assessment of EIA systems in MENA countries: challenges and prospects. *Environmental Impact Assessment Review*, Vol. 24: 553-593.11. Glasson, J., Therivel, R. and Chadwick, A. (2005). *Introduction to Environmental Impact Assessment: Principles and Procedures, Process, Practice and Prospects*. 3rd ed. Published by Taylor & Francis Routledge12.Hildebrand, S.G., Cannon, J.B. (1993). *Environmental Analysis: The NEPA Experience* CRC Press.13.Hoang, M.S (2008). Overview of Law on Environmental Protection in Vietnam. Vietnam Environment Administration – Ministry of Natural Resource and Environment (in Vietnamese).14.Hostovsky, C., Maclaren, V. (2006). The Role of Public Consultation in Vietnamese Waste and Other EIAs. Available from: <http://individual.utoronto.ca/hostovsky/cambodia.pdf> (Accessed in October, 2008)15.Jain, R.K, Urban, L.V., Stacey, G.S and Balbach, H.E. (2001). *Environmental Assessment*. 2nd. Published by McGraw-Hill16.Jou, J.J and Liaw, S.L (2006). A study of establishment of EIA system in the Taiwan region. *Journal of Environmental Assessment Policy and Management*, Vol. 8, No.4.17.Legislative Council Secretarial, LCS (2004). The Legislative Council of Hong Kong. Information Note. Available from: <http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr03-04/english/sec/library/0304in20e.pdf> (Accessed in February, 2009)18.Leu, W.S, William, W.P.and Bark, A.W. (1996). Development of an Environmental Impact Assessment Evaluation Model and Its Application: Taiwan Case Study. *Environmental Impact Assessment Review*, Vol.16:115-133.19. Le, H.N (2008). Workshop on Experience with Development of SEA System in Vietnam (in Vietnamese).20. Liou, M.L, and Yu, Y., H, (2004). Development and implementation of Strategic Environmental Assessment in Taiwan. *Environmental Impact Assessment Review*, Vol. 24, Issue 3: 337-350.21. Luther, L. (2007). The National Environmental Policy Act: Streamlining NEPA. Congressional Research Service. The Library of Congress, Washington, D.C. Available from <http://www.nationalaglawcenter.org/assets/crs/RL33267.pdf> (Accessed in December, 2008)22.Modak, P. and Biswas, A.K. (1999). *Conducting Environmental Impact Assessment for Developing Countries*. United Nations University Press. Unites States of America. Available from: <http://books.google.com/books?id=5TSQIEJe2MMC&printsec=frontcover>23.National Conference on Law Environmental Protection. Available from: http://www.nea.gov.vn/thongtinmt/noidung/btnmt_31_5_07.htm (in Vietnamese) (Accessed in October, 2008)24.Nguyen, K.K (2007). Status of Environmental Impact Assessment in Vietnam. *Natural Resources and Environment Magazine*, No 7 (45)25.Nguyen, D.M (2008). Lecture Environmental Impact Assessment. Ministry of Education and Training, University of Agriculture (in Vietnamese).26. NEPanet (1997). *Considering Cumulative Effects Under the National Environmental Policy Act*. Available from: <http://ceq.hss.doe.gov/NEPA/ccenepa/ccenepa.htm> (Accessed in May, 2009)27.Ortolano, L. (1997). *Environmental Regulation and Impact Assessment*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.28. Paoletto, G. (2003). *Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA)*. Lecture Notes Available from: <http://www.gdrc.org/uem/eia/lecture-notes.html> (Accessed in July, 2008)29. Riffat, R. and Khan, D. (2006). A Review and Evaluation of the Environmental Impact Assessment Process in Pakistan. *Journal of Applied Sciences in Environmental Sanitation*, Vol.1: 17-29.30.Regeringskansliet, Utrikesdepartementet (2003). Country Strategy for Swedish development co-operation with Vietnam 2004-2003. Stockholm31.Smith, M.D., (2005). Recent Trends in Cumulative impact case law. Available from: <http://www.shipleygroup.com/news/articles/0505.pdf> (Accessed in February, 2009)32.Socialist Republic of Vietnam, SRV (2006). Law on Environmental Protection. Published by Judicial Publishing House, Hanoi.33.Taiwan Environmental Protection Administration Executive Yuan R.O.C. Environmental Impact Assessment Act 2003. Available from: <http://law.epa.gov.tw/en/laws/eia.html> Accessed in September, 2008)34. The European Commission - Proceedings of the second and third workshop on EIA - An output of the project " Capacity building for EIA in Vietnam " , Available from: <http://www.vub.ac.be/MEKO/Vietnam/EU/home.html> (Accessed in September, 2008)35. Tang, S.Y., Tang, C.P and W-HL Carlos, W.HL (2005). Public participation and environmental impact assessment in Mainland China and Taiwan: Political foundations of environmental management. *The Journal of Development Studies*, Vol.41, No.1:1-32.36.United States Environmental Protection Agency <http://www.epa.gov/lawsregs/laws/nepa.html> (Accessed in November, 2008).37. UNEP, 2002. EIA Training Resource Manual. Available from: http://www.unep.ch/etu/publications/EIAMan2_ovhds.htm, (Accessed in February, 2008).38. Vietnam Environment Administration <http://www.nea.gov.vn/39.Vietnamnet Bridge> <http://english.vietnamnet.vn/social/2008/09/804796/> (Accessed in September 2008)40. Vietnamnet <http://vietnamnet.vn/khoahoc/2008/05/782950/> (Accessed in May 2008) (by Vietnamese).41.Wang, Y., Richard, K.M.and Cashmore, M. (2003). Environmental impact assessment of projects in the People ' s Republic of China: new law, old problems. *Environmental Impact Assessment Review*. Vol.23: 543-579.42.Wood, C. (1995). *Environmental Impact Assessment: A Comparative Review*. Longman Group Limited, England.43.Wood, C. (2003). *Environmental Impact Assessment in Developing Countries: An Overview*. Conference on, New Directions in Impact Assessment for Development: Methods and Practice. EIA Centre. University of Manchester. Available from: <http://www.enterprise-impact.org.uk/pdf/Wood.pdf> (Accessed in September 2008)44.Vu, Q. (2008). <http://www.toquoc.gov.vn/Thongtin/Thoi-Su/Danh-Gia-Tac-Dong-Moi-Truong-Van-Con-Nhung-Lo-Hong.html> (in Vietnamese) (Accessed in August, 2008)