

# A Study on the Evaluation of Tourism Competitive Information and Decision Analysis

洪維強、唐啟發；白炳豐

E-mail: 9708433@mail.dyu.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

International tourism is expected to be a major vehicle of economic development in industrializing countries in the twenty-first century. Countries with tourism-based economies must develop approaches for employing their comparative advantages to achieve competitive advantages. However, competitiveness in the tourist industry is multi-dimensional and complex. This study proposes that the competitiveness of a tourist destination should be composed of (1) Ricardian comparative advantages (RCA), including the conditions of natural endowments (exogenous comparative advantages) and the degree of technological change (endogenous comparative advantages); (2) Porterian competitive advantages (PCA), explaining the increase in trade among countries with similar factorial portfolios than in trade pattern determination; (3) tourism management, i.e., providing high quality education and training to tourist industry workers as well as public goods, support services and reduced transaction costs to enhance RCA and PCA; and (4) environmental conditions, including the domestic and the global environmental conditions. This study employs analytic hierarchy process (AHP) to weight these evaluation dimensions, elements and indicators in the proposed tourism competitiveness research framework. The analytical results reveal that exogenous comparative advantages (weight, 49.18%) is the most important factor for enhancing the tourism competitiveness of a tourist destination. Other important factors are competitive advantages (17.27%), tourism management (12.01%), endogenous comparative advantages (10.62%) and global environmental conditions (6.03%). The least important factor is domestic environment conditions (4.89%). Additionally, statistical analyses were conducted to reveal the influential effects among RCA, PCA and tourism management. The analytical results indicate that exogenous comparative advantages influential effects could enhance competitive advantages. In the influential process, effective tourism management also could play the catalyst role in providing suitable assistance to enhance PCA. However, the influence of endogenous comparative advantages influential effects is negative. In contrast, competitive advantages influential effects slightly enhance exogenous comparative advantages (natural, cultural and heritage resources) and endogenous comparative advantages (human resources improvement).

Keywords : tourism competitiveness evaluation ; comparative advantages ; competitive advantages ; analytic hierarchy process

## Table of Contents

中文摘要	iii	Abstract	iv	Thanks	vi	Contents	vii	List of Tables	ix	List of Figures	x	Chapter 1 Introduction	1	1.1
Competition in the Tourism Industry	1	1.2 Motivation	4	1.3 Problem Statement	9	1.4 Contributions	16							
Chapter 2 Literature Reviews	18	2.1 Exogenous Comparative Advantage Theory	19	2.2 Endogenous Comparative Advantage Theory	23	2.3 Competitive Advantages	30	2.4 Competitiveness and Evaluation Methodology	41	2.5				
Tourism Competitiveness Researches	55	Chapter 3 Research Methods	62	3.1 Evaluative Indicators for Tourism Competitive Information	62	3.2 Influential Effects of Tourism Competitive Information	86	3.3 Evaluation Methodology and Procedure	93	Chapter 4 Weight of Indicators and Decision Analyses	106	4.1 AHP Questionnaire Survey Procedure	106	
Considerations	119	4.2 Weight of Indicators Analysis	107	4.3 Statistical Analyses and Feasible Decisions										
Chapter 5 Conclusions and Future Works	125	5.1 Conclusions	125	5.2 Future Works	130									
References	131	Appendix	148											

## REFERENCES

- APEC Tourism Charter (2000). Seoul Declaration on APEC Tourism Charter. The 1st APEC Tourism Ministerial Meeting. Seoul: APEC Tourism Charter.
- Archer, B. (1987). Demand forecasting and estimation. In J. Ritchie & C. Goeldner (Eds), *Travel, Tourism and Hospitality Research* (pp. 77-85). New York: Wiley.
- Arrow, K. J. (1962). The economic implications of learning by doing. *The Review of Economic Studies*, 29(3), 155-173.
- Artto, E. W. (1987). Relative total costs—An approach to competitiveness measurement of industries. *Management International Review*, 27(2), 47-58.
- Barney, J. B. (1991). Firm resources and sustainable competitive advantages. *Journal of Management*, 17(1), 99-120.
- Baron, J., & Kemp, S. (2004). Support for trade restrictions, attitudes, and understanding of comparative advantage. *Journal of Economic Psychology*, 25(5), 565-580.
- Bess, R. (2006). New Zealand seafood firm competitiveness in export markets: The role of the quota management system and

aqua-culture legislation. *Marine Policy*, 30(4), 367-378. Bonn, M. A., Joseph, S. M., & Dai, M. (2005). International versus domestic visitors: An examination of destination image perceptions. *Journal of Travel Research*, 43(3), 294-301. Bramwell, B., & Rawding, L. (1996). Tourism marketing images of industrial cities. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 23(1), 201-221. Buhails, D. (2000). Marketing the competitive destination of the future. *Tourism Management*, 21(1), 97-116. Chakravarthy, B. S. (1986). Measuring strategic performance. *Strategic Management Journal*, 7(5), 437-458. Chin, K. S., Pun, K. F., & Lau, H. (2003). Development of a knowledge-based self-assessment system for measuring organizational performance. *Expert Systems with Application*, 24(4), 443-455. Cho, D. S. (1994). A dynamic approach to international competitiveness: The case of Korea. *Journal of Far Eastern Business*, 1(1), 17-36. Cho, D. S., & Moon, H. C. (1998). A nation's international competitiveness in different stages of economic development. *Advances in Competitiveness Research*, 6(1), 5-19. Cho, D. S., & Moon, H. C. (2000). From Adam Smith to Michael Porter: Evolution of Competitiveness Theory. Singapore: World Scientific Publishing Co. Pte. Ltd. Chon, K. S. & Mayer, K. J. (1995). Destination competitiveness models in tourism and their application in Las Vegas. *Journal of Tourism Systems and Quality Management*, 1(2-4), 227-246. Clements, M. A., & Georgiou, A. (1998). The impact of political instability on a fragile tourism product. *Tourism Management*, 19(3), 283-288. Cohen, S. S. (1994). Speaking freely. *Foreign Affairs*, 73(4), 194-197. Crouch, G. I., & Ritchie, J. R. B. (1999). Tourism, competitiveness, and societal prosperity. *Journal of Business Research*, 44(3), 137-152. Crouch, G. I., & Ritchie, J. R. B. (2000). The competitive destination: A sustainability perspective. *Tourism Management*, 21(1), 1-7. Dann, G. M. S. (1996). Tourists images of a destination: An alternative analysis. *Journal of Travel and Tourism Marketing*, 5(1/2), 41-55. Davis, D. R., & Weinstein, D. E. (2003). Market access, economic geography and comparative advantage: an empirical test. *Journal of International Economics*, 59(1), 1 – 23. Dharmaratne, G. S. (1995). Forecasting tourist arrivals in Barbados. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 22(4), 804-818. d'Hauteserre, A. M. (2000). Lessons in managed destination competitiveness: The case of Foxwoods Casino Resort. *Tourism Management*, 21(1), 23-32. Dick, W., & Hagerty, N. (1971). *Topics in Measurement: Reliability and Validity*. New Jersey: McGraw-Hill. Dixit, A. K., & Stiglitz, J. E. (1977). Monopolistic competition and optimum product diversity. *The American Economic Review*, 67(3), 297-308. Driscoll, A., Lawson, R., & Niven, B. (1994). Measuring tourists' destination perceptions. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 21(3), 499-511. Dunning, J. H. (1993). Internationalizing Porter's diamond. *Management International Review*, 33(special issue 2), 7-15. Durand, M., Madaschi, C., & Terribile, F. (1998). Trends in OECD countries' international competitiveness: The influence of emerging market economies (Economics Department Working Papers No. 195). Paris: OECD. Dwyer, L., Forsyth, P., & Rao, P. (2000). The price competitiveness of travel and tourism: A comparison of 19 destinations. *Tourism Management*, 21(1), 9-22. Dwyer, L., Forsyth, P., & Rao, P. (2002). Destination price competitiveness: Exchange rate changes versus domestic inflation. *Journal of Travel Research*, 40(3), 328-336. Echtner, C. M., & Ritchie, J. R. B. (1993). The measurement of destination image: An empirical assessment. *Journal of Travel Research*, 31(4), 3-13. Enright, M. J., & Newton, J. (2004). Tourism destination competitiveness: A quantitative approach. *Tourism Management*, 25(6), 777-788. Enright, M. J., & Newton, J. (2005). Determinants of tourism destination competitiveness in Asia Pacific: Comprehensiveness and universality. *Journal of Travel Research*, 43(4), 339-350. Eatwell, J., Milgate, M., & Newman, P. (1991). *The New Palgrave: A Dictionary of Economics*. UK: The Macmillan Press Ltd. The Economist (1994, April 30). The economics of meaning. *The Economist*, 331(7861), 17-18. European Commission (1994). Competitiveness Advisory Group, Enhancing European Competitiveness, 2nd Report to The President of The Commission, Luxembourg: OOEPC. Fagerberg, J. (1988). International competitiveness. *The Economic Journal*, 98(391), 355- 374. Fajnzylber, F. (1988). International competitiveness: Agreed goal, hard task. *CEPAL Review*, 36, 7-23. Fakeye, P. C., & Crompton, J. L. (1991). Image differences between prospective, first-time, and repeat visitors to the lower Rio Grande Valley. *Journal of Travel Research*, 30(2), 10-16. Faulkner, B., Oppermann, M., & Fredline, E. (1999). Destination competitiveness: An exploratory examination of South Australia's core attractions. *Journal of Vacation Marketing*, 5(2), 125-139. Fisher, E. O. N., & Kakkar, V. (2004). On the evolution of comparative advantage in matching models. *Journal of International Economics*, 64(1), 169 – 193. Freeman, C. (1994). The economics of technical change. *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, 18(5), 463-514. Gallarza, M. G., Saura, I. G., & Garcia, H. C. (2002). Destination image: Towards a Conceptual Framework. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 29(1), 56-72. Gearing, C. E., Swart, W. W., & Var, T. (1974). Establishing a measure of touristic attractiveness. *Journal of Travel Research*, 12(1), 1-8. Goodrich, J. N. (2002). September 11, 2001 attack on America: a record of the immediate impacts and reactions in the USA travel and tourism industry. *Tourism Management*, 23(6), 573-580. Greenaway, D. (1993). The competitive advantage of nations by Michael E. Porter. *Kyklos*, 46(1), 145-146. Grant, R. M. (1991). Porter's competitive advantage of nations: An assessment. *Strategic Management Journal*, 12(7), 535-548. Guan, J. C., Yam, R. C. M., Mok, C. K., & Ma, N. (2006). A study of the relationship between competitiveness and technological innovation capability based on DEA models. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 170(3), 971-986. Hassan, S. S. (2000). Determinants of market competitiveness in an environmentally sustainable tourism industry. *Journal of Travel Research*, 38(3), 239-245. Heckscher, E. (1919). The effect of foreign trade on the distribution of income. *Economisk Tidskrift*, 21, 497-512. Reprinted in H. S. Ellis & L. M. Metzler (Eds), *Readings in The Theory of International Trade*. Homewood, Illinois: Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1950. Henderson, J. C. (1999). Southeast Asian tourism and the financial crisis: Indonesia and Thailand compared. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 2(4), 294-303. Hirsch, W. Z. (1956). Firm progress ratios. *Econometrica*, 24, 136-143. His Majesty's Treasury (1983). International competitiveness. *Economic Progress Report*, 158, 1-5. Hou, J. S., Lin, C. H., & Morais, D. B. (2005). Antecedents of attachment to a cultural tourism destination: The case of Hakka and non-Hakka Taiwanese visitors to Pei-pu, Taiwan. *Journal of Travel Research*, 44(2), 221-233. Hsu, C. H. C., Wolfe, K., & Kang, S. K. (2004). Image assessment for a destination with limited comparative advantages. *Tourism Management*, 25(1), 121-126. Hu, Y. Z., & Ritchie, J. R. B. (1993). Measuring destination attractiveness: A contextual approach. *Journal of Travel Research*, 32(3), 25-34. Huang, J. H., & Min, J. C. H. (2002). Earthquake devastation and

recovery in tourism: the Taiwan case. *Tourism Management*, 23(2), 145-154. International Monetary Fund (2000). *Globalization: Threat or Opportunity?* Washington DC: IMF. International Institute for Management Development (2005). *The World Competitiveness Yearbook 2005*. Switzerland: Lausanne. Ivanova, I. M., Arcelus, F. J., & Srinivasan, G. (1998). Assessment of the competitiveness position of the Latin American countries. *International Journal of Commerce & Management*, 8(2), 7-32. Kim, D., & Marion, B. W. (1997). Domestic market structure and performance in global markets: theory and empirical evidence from U.S. food manufacturing industries. *Review of Industrial Organization*, 12(3), 335-354. Krugman, P. (1979). Increasing returns, monopolistic competition and international trade. *Journal of International Economics*, 9(4), 469-479. Krugman, P. (1994). Competitiveness: A dangerous obsession. *Foreign Affairs*, 73(2), 28-46. Lancaster, K. J. (1980). Intra-industry trade under perfect monopolistic competition. *Journal of International Economics*, 10(2), 151-175. Leontief, W. (1953). Domestic production and foreign trade: The American capital position re-examined. *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society*, 97, 332-349. Reprinted in H. G. Johnson & R. E. Caves (Eds), *Readings in International Trade*. Homewood, Illinois: Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 1968. Li, L. X. (2000). An analysis of sources of competitiveness and performance of Chinese manufacturers. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 20(3), 299-315. Linder, S. B. (1961). *An Essay on Trade and Transformation*. New York: John Wiley. List, F. (1883/1837). *The Natural System of Political Economy*. London: Cass. Lucas, R. E. (1988). On the mechanism of economic development. *Journal of Monetary Economics*, 22(1), 3-42. McCain, G., & Ray, N. M. (2003). Legacy tourism: the search for personal meaning in heritage travel. *Tourism Management*, 24(6), 713-717. McKercher, B., & Chon, K. (2004). The over-reaction to SARS and the collapse of Asian tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 31(3), 716-719. Melián-González, A., & García-Falcón, J. M. (2003). Competitive potential of tourism in destinations. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 30(3), 720-740. Miller, G. (1956). The magical number of seven plus or minus two: some limits on our capacity for processing information. *Psychological Review*, 63, 81-97. Moon, H. C., Rugman, A. M., & Verbeke, A. (1998). A generalized double diamond approach to the international competitiveness of Korea and Singapore. *International Business Review*, 7(2), 135-150. Murphy, P., Pritchard, M. P., & Smith, B. (2000). The destination product and its impact on traveler perceptions. *Tourism Management*, 21(1), 43-52. Newall, J. E. (1992). The challenge of competitiveness. *The Business Quarterly*, 56(1), 94-100. Nunnally, J. C., & Bernstein, I. H. (1994). *Psychometric Theory*. New York: McGraw-Hill. OECD (2000). *The competitiveness of European industry: 1999 Report* (Working Document of The Services of The European Commission: COM(1999) 465). Paris: OECD. Ohlin, B. (1933). *Interregional and International Trade*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. Oral, M. (1986). An industrial competitiveness model. *IIE Transactions*, 18(2), 148-157. Oral, M. (1993). A methodology for competitiveness analysis and strategy formulation in glass industry. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 68(1), 9-22. Oral, M., & Reisman, A. (1988). Measuring industrial competitiveness. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 17(3), 263-272. Pai, P. F., & Hong, W. C. (2005). An improved neural network model in forecasting arrivals. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 32(4), 1138-1141. Patsouratis, V., Frangouli, Z., & Anastasopoulos, G. (2005). Competition in tourism among the Mediterranean countries. *Applied Economics*, 37(16), 1865-1880. Pavitt, K. L. R. (1980). *Technical Innovation and British Economic Performance*. London: Macmillan. Pearce, D. G. (1997). Competitive destination analysis in Southeast Asia. *Journal of Travel Research*, 36(1), 16-24. Peteraf, M. A. (1993). The cornerstones of competitive advantages: A resource-based view. *Strategic Management Journal*, 14(3), 179-191. Poon, A. (1993). *Tourism, Technology and Competitive Strategy*. Wallingford (UK): CAB International. Porter, M. E. (1980). *Competitive Strategy: Techniques for Analyzing Industries and Competitors*. New York: The Free Press. Porter, M. E. (1985). *Competitive Advantages: Creating and Sustaining Superior Performance*. New York: The Free Press. Porter, M. E. (1990). *The Competitive Advantages of Nations*. New York: The Free Press. Prahalad, C. K., & Hamel, G. (1990). The core competence of the corporation. *Harvard Business Review*, 68(3), 79-91. Ryan, R. (1990). A grand disunity. *National Review*, 42(13), 46-47. Report of the President's Commission on Industrial Competitiveness (1985). *Global Competition: The New Reality*. Washington DC: U.S. Government Printing Office. Ricardo, D. (1817/1817). *On the Principles of Political Economy and Taxation*. Baltimore: Penguin. Ritchie, J. R. B. (1975). Some critical aspects of measurement theory and practice in travel research. *Journal of Travel Research*, 14(1), 1-10. Ritchie, J. R. B., & Crouch, G. I. (2000). The competitive destination: A sustainability perspective. *Tourism Management*, 21(1), 1-7. Romer, P. (1990). Endogenous technological change. *Journal of Political Economy*, 98(5), S71-S102. Rugman, A. M., & D' Cruz, J. R. (1993). The double diamond model of international competitiveness: The Canadian experiences. *Management International Review*, 33(special issue 2), 17-39. Russo, A. P., & van der Borg, J. (2002). Planning considerations for cultural tourism: a case study of four European cities. *Tourism Management*, 23(6), 631-637. Saaty, T. L. (1977). A Scaling Method for Priorities in Hierarchical Structures. *Journal of Mathematical Psychology*, 15(3), 234-281. Saaty, T. L. (1980). *The Analytic Hierarchy Process*. New York: McGraw-Hill. Saaty, T. L. (1990). How to make a decision: the analytic hierarchy process. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 48(3), 9-26. Schumpeter, J. (1912). *The Theory of Economic Development*. Leipzig: Duncker & Humblot. Scott, B. R., & Lodge, G. C. (1985). *U.S. Competitiveness in the World Economy*. Boston MA: Harvard Business School Press. Selby, M., & Morgan, N. G. (1996). Reconstructing place image: a case study of its role in destination market research. *Tourism Management*, 17(4), 287-294. Sim, L. L., Ong, S. E., & Agarwal, A. (2003). Singapore's competitiveness as a global city: development strategy, institutions and business environment. *Cities*, 20(2), 115-127. Smith, Adam (1776/1776). *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations* (Modern Library). New York: Random House. Solleiro, J. L., & Castanon, R. (2005). Competitiveness and innovation systems: The challenges for Mexico's insertion in the global context. *Technovation*, 25(9), 1059-1070. Stevens, T. (1992). Trends in the Attractions Industry. *World Travel and Tourism Review*, 2, 177-181. Thurow, L. C. (1994). Microchips, not potato chips. *Foreign Affairs*, 73(4), 189-192. United Nations World Tourism Organization (2005). *Tourism Highlights 2005*. Spain: Madrid: UNWTO. Vernon, R. (1966). International investments and international trade in the product cycle. *Quarterly Journal of*

Economics, 81, 190-207. Wernerfelt, B. (1984). A resource-based view of the firm. *Strategic Management Journal*, 5(2), 171-180. Wilder-Smith, A. (2006). The severe acute respiratory syndrome: Impact on travel and tourism. *Travel Medicine and Infectious Disease*, 4(2), 53-60. World Economic Forum (2000). *The Global Competitiveness Report 2000*. Switzerland: WEF. World Economic Forum (2005). *The Global Competitiveness Report 2005*. Switzerland: WEF. World Travel and Tourism Council (2005). *Progress and Priorities 2005-06*. UK: WTTC. Xepapadeas, A., & de Zeeuw, A. (1999). Environmental policy and competitiveness: The Porter hypothesis and the composition of capital. *Journal of Environmental Economics and Management*, 37(2), 165-182. Yang, X. K. (1994). Endogenous vs. exogenous comparative advantage and economies of specialization vs. economies of scale. *Journal of Economics*, 60(1), 29-54. Yang, X. K., & Zhang, D. S. (2000). Endogenous structure of the division of labor, endogenous trade policy regime, and a dual structure in economic development. *Annals of Economics and Finance*, 1(1), 211-230. Zanakis, S. H., & Becerra-Fernandez, I. (2005). Competitiveness of nations: A knowledge discovery examination. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 166(1), 185-211.