

# The Influence of Expected Remedy and Actual Remedy on Satisfaction with Remedy: A Study of Scenario Experiment

林育昀、張景旭

E-mail: 9707875@mail.dyu.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

Because failure occurrence and recovery condition were not often the same. Hence, increase customer postrecovery satisfaction, let them be willing to return to consume once again and maintain good relationship with firms. The firms should seek recovery management method of customers expected. So far works which is about service failure and service recovery have had a lot quite, but prior works explored service failure types or recovery strategies after service failure for the most part, thus, the purpose of this study was further to examine the impact of the difference service failure types and difference actual remedy conditions on postrecovery satisfaction. Furthermore, the study was also to examine the impact difference service failure types on failure attribution, failure attribution on expected remedy, expected remedy on recovery disconfirmation, recovery disconfirmation on postrecovery satisfaction and actual remedy on recovery disconfirmation. Subjects in this study was banking industries, which adopts a 2(service failure type) by 4(actual remedy) between-subjects scenario experiment. The result revealed that postrecovery satisfaction was not influenced by service failure types, but was significantly influenced by actual remedy, and service failure types was not interactive effect with actual remedy; difference service failure types were not significantly difference for failure attribution; failure attribution positively influences expected remedy; expected remedy positively influences recovery disconfirmation; actual remedy was significantly difference for recovery disconfirmation; recovery disconfirmation negatively influences postrecovery satisfaction.

Keywords : service failure ; expected ; actual remedy ; recovery disconfirmation ; postrecovery satisfaction

## Table of Contents

內容目錄 中文摘要	iii	英文摘要	iii
iv 誌謝辭	vi	內容目錄	vi
vii 表目錄	ix	圖目錄	ix
xi 第一章 緒論	1	第一節 研究背景與動機	1
1 第二節 研究問題	3	第二章 文獻探討	3
5 第一節 服務接觸型態	5	第二節 歸因理論	5
9 第三節 知覺正義	14	第四節 服務補救	14
17 第五節 服務補救期望與失驗	22	第六節 補救滿意	22
28 第三章 研究設計	32	第一節 研究架構	32
32 第二節 研究假設	32	第三節 操作性定義與衡量	32
33 第四節 實驗設計	39	第五節 資料蒐集	39
41 第六節 資料分析方法	43	第四章 資料分析	43
44 第一節 敘敘性統計	44	第二節 信度與效度分析	44
45 第三節 皮爾森相關分析	46	第四節 假設檢定	46
47 第五節 假設驗證結果	60	第五章 結論與建議	60
62 第一節 研究結論	62	第二節 管理意涵	62
66 第三節 研究限制與建議	67	參考文獻	67
69 附錄A 問卷	80	附錄B 問卷	80
83 表目錄 表 2-1 自助式服務科技在使用上的分類與應用	7	表 2-2 零售業之服務補救措施	19
19 表 2-3 餐飲業之服務補救措施	20	表 3-1 人際型/科技型接觸失誤之操作性定義與衡量項目	34
34 表 3-2 補救行動之操作性定義與衡量項目	35	表 3-3 失誤歸因之操作性定義與衡量項目	36
36 表 3-4 服務補救期望之操作性定義與衡量項目	37	表 3-5 補救失驗之操作型定義	38
38 表 3-6 補救滿意之操作性定義與衡量項目	38	表 3-7 腳本實驗情境設計表	40
40 表 3-8 各實驗情境有效樣本人數	42	表 4-1 樣本結構分配	45
45 表 4-2 各構面皮爾森相關分析	47	表 4-3 失誤類型對失誤歸因之獨立樣本T檢定結果分析表	48
48 表 4-4 失誤歸因與補救期望之迴歸分析	48		

49 表 4-5 補救期望與補救失驗之迴歸分析	49 表 4-6 補救失驗與補救滿意之迴歸分析
50 表 4-7 補救行動對補救失驗的單因子變異數分析表	51 表 4-8 失誤類型與補救行動組合的補救滿意平均數表
52 表 4-9 失誤類型與補救行動的二因子變異數分析表	52 表 4-10 失誤類型與補救行動組合的題一補救滿意平均數表
55 表 4-11 失誤類型與補救行動對題一的二因子變異數分析表	55 表 4-12 失誤類型與補救行動組合的題二補救滿意平均數表
57 表 4-13 失誤類型與補救行動對題二的二因子變異數分析表	57 表 4-14 失誤類型與補救行動組合的題三補救滿意平均數表
59 表 4-15 失誤類型與補救行動對題三的二因子變異數分析表	59 表 4-16 假設實證結果
61 圖目錄	圖 2-1 服務行銷金三角模型
6 圖 2-2 歸因歷程連結想法、感覺、行動	11 圖 2-3 服務失誤與服務補救接觸的顧客滿意度模型
16 圖 2-4 顧客補救期望構念	25 圖 3-1 觀念性架構
32 圖 4-1 失誤類型與補救行動對補救滿意的交互效果圖	53 圖 4-2 失誤類型與補救行動對補救滿意的交互效果圖
56 圖 4-3 失誤類型與補救行動對補救滿意的交互效果圖	58 圖 4-4 失誤類型與補救行動對補救滿意的交互效果圖
60	

## REFERENCES

- 參考文獻 一、中文部份 Swartz, T. A., & Iacobucci, D. (2002), 服務業的行銷與管理(李茂興、戴靖惠、吳偉慈譯), 台北:弘智文化。(原文於2000年出版)。 George, J. M., & Jones, G. R. (2004), 組織行為(吳玲玲譯), 台北:智勝文化。(原文於2002年出版)。 方世榮, 彭彥群(2004), 關係屬性、歸因與涉入對服務補救期望之影響 - 以航空業為例, 行銷評論, 1(2), 31-52。 方世榮, 許秋萍(2005), 科技型與人際型服務接觸對關係利益的影響, 管理評論, 24(2), 53-76。 行政院主計處(2007), 國民所得統計摘要[線上資料], 來源: <http://www.stat.gov.tw/ct.asp?xItem=15060&ctNode=3565>, [2007, December 5]。 吳聰智(2001), 歸因理論對組織安全管理的啟示, 工業安全衛生, 148, 52-59。 林宜靜, 陳禎祥, 曾倫崇(2006), 產品類型與實體通路型態對顧客價值、顧客滿意度與忠誠度之影響, 顧客滿意學刊, 2(2), 121-160。 林珮秀, 黃文翰, 黃毓伶(2003), 服務失誤及服務補救之類型分析 - 以台灣地區之餐廳為例, 觀光研究學報, 9(1), 39-59。 林陽助, 吳昱益(2005), 服務失誤、服務補救顧客滿意度關係之研究-以行動電話通路商為例, 東吳經濟商學學報, 51, 227-268。 凌儀玲(2000), 服務接觸中認知腳本之研究, 國立中山大學企業管理研究所出版之博士論文。 張淑昌, 林文實(2001), 影響知覺服務品質與失驗的相關因素與關係品質績效關連性之研究, 中華管理學報, 2(1), 1-18。 陳鈺達(2002), 企業形象、服務補救期望與補救後滿意度關係之研究, 私立中國文化大學國際企業管理研究所出版之碩士論文。 陳慧婷(2005), 複合式休閒產品之服務失誤與補償期待運動休閒, 運動休閒管理學報, 2(1), 83-100。 彭彥群(2004), 從顧客特性探討服務補救期望-以餐飲業和航空業為例, 私立逢甲大學企業管理所未出版之碩士論文。 黃文翰(2002), 服務不一致、服務補救後滿意度與消費者後續行為意圖之關係研究, 國立東華大學觀光暨遊憩管理研究所未出版之碩士論文。 黃吉村, 渥頓, 李奇勳, 劉宗其(2004), 服務失誤之補償效果:跨文化服務接觸的檢視, 管理評論, 23(3), 23-52。 廖森貴, 謝作明(2001), 服務失誤、服務補救與顧客滿意之探討 - 以行動電話服務業為例, 2001年科技與管理學術研究會論文集(pp.275-281), 台北:國立台北科技大學。 蔣大成, 林婉琳, 洪瑞敏(2004), 服務失誤與服務補救之探討 - 以服務業為例, 品質月刊, 40(11), 61-66。 鄭紹成(2002), 服務補救滿意構面之探索性研究, 管理評論, 21(3), 49-68。 謝效昭, 陳明升(2006), 顧客對銀行自助服務技術之偏好-使用模式分析, 東吳經濟商學學報, 55, 35-94。 羅雅嬪(2005), 網購服務失誤、服務補救與顧客滿意度-知覺公平與期望不一致之觀點, 國立嘉義大學管理研究所未出版之碩士論文。 二、英文部份 Andreassen, T. W. (2000). Antecedents to satisfaction with service recovery. *European Journal of Marketing*, 34(1/2), 156-175. Bitner, M. J. (1990). Evaluating service encounters: The effects of physical surroundings and employee response. *Journal of Marketing*, 54(2), 69-82. Bitner, M. J., Booms, B. H., & Tetreault, M. S. (1990). The service encounter: Diagnosing favorable and unfavorable incidents. *Journal of Marketing*, 54, 71-84. Bitner, M. J., Booms, B. H., & Mohr, L. A. (1994). Critical service encounters: The employee's viewpoint. *Journal of Marketing*, 58(4), 95-106. Bitner, M. J., Brown, S. W., & Meuter, M. L. (2000). Technology infusion in service encounter. *Journal of Marketing Science*, 28(1), 138-149. Blodgett, J., Wakefield, K., & Barnes, J. (1995). The effects of customer service on consumer complaining behavior. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 9(4), 31-42. Boshoff, C., & Leong, J. (1998). Empowerment, attribution and apologizing as dimensions of service recovery. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 9(1), 24-47. Boshoff, C. (2005). An instrument to measure satisfaction with transaction-specific service recovery. *Managing Service Quality*, 15(5), 410-428. Boulding, W., Kalra, A., Staelin, R., & Zeithaml, V. A. (1993). A dynamic process model of service quality: From expectations to behavioral intentions. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 30(1), 7-27. Choi, S., & Mattila, A. S. (2008). Perceived controllability and service expectations: Influences on customer reactions following service failure. *Journal of Business Research*, 61(1), 24-30. Christensen, G., & Ringberg, T. (2006). Balance in the (Re)making: A deep metaphor analysis of consumer recovery expectations. *European Advance in Consumer Research*, 7, 440-441. Churchill, G. A., & Surprenant, C. (1982). An investigation into the determinants of consumer satisfaction. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 19(4), 491-504. Dasu, S., & Rao, J. (1999). Nature and determinants of customer expectations of service recovery in health care. *Quality Management in Health Care*, 7(4), 32-50. DeWitt, T., Brady, M. K. (2003). Rethinking service recovery strategies-The effect of rapport on consumer responses to service failure. *Journal of Service Research*, 6(2), 193-207. Duffy, J. A. M., Miller, J. M., & Bexley, J. B. (2006). Banking customers' varied reactions to service recovery strategies. *The International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 24(2/3), 112-131. Erevelles, S., Srinivasan, S., & Rangel S. (2003). Consumer satisfaction for internet service providers: An analysis of underlying process. *Information Technology and Management*, 4, 69-89. Firnstahl, T. W. (1989). My employees are my service guarantees. *Harvard Business Review*, 24(4), 4-8. Folkes, V. S. (1984). Consumer

reactions to product failures: An attributional approach. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 10, 398-409. Gilly, M. C. (1987), Postcomplaint processes: From organizational response to repurchase behavior. *Journal of Consumer Affairs*, 21(2), 293-313. Gronroos, C. (1988). Service quality: The six criteria of good perceived service quality. *Review of Business*, 9(3), 10-13. Harris, K. E., Grewal, D., Mohr, L. A., & Bernhardt, K. L. (2006). Consumer responses to service recovery strategies: The moderating role of online versus offline environment. *Journal of Business Research*, 59(4), 425-431. Harris, K. E., Mohr, L. A. & Bernhardt, K. L. (2006). Online service failure, consumer attributions and expectations. *Journal of Service Marketing*, 20(7), 453-458. Hart, C. W. L., Heskett, J. L., & Sasser, W. E., Jr. (1990). The profitable art of service recovery. *Harvard Business Review*, 68(4), 148-156. Keaveney, S. M. (1995). Customer switching behavior in service industries: An exploratory study. *Journal of Marketing*, 59(4), 71-82. Kelley, S. M., Hoffman, K. D., & Davis, M. A. (1993). A typology of retail failures and recoveries. *Journal of Retailing*, 69(4), 429-452. Kelley, S. M., & Davis, M. A. (1994). Antecedents to customer expectations for service recovery. *Journal of Academy of Marketing Service*, 22(1), 52-61. Mattila, A. S. (2001). The effectiveness of service recovery in a multi-industry setting. *The Journal of Services Marketing*, 15(6/7), 583-596. Mattila, A. S., & Cranage, D. (2005). The impact of choice on fairness in the context of service recovery. *The Journal of Services Marketing*, 19(5), 271-279. McCollough, M. A., Berry, L. L., & Yadav, M. S. (2000). An empirical investigation of customer satisfaction after service failure and recovery. *Journal of Service Research*, 3(2), 121-137. Meuter, M. L., & Bitner, M. J. (1998), Self-service technologies: Extending service frameworks and identifying issues for research. *American Marketing Association*, 9, 12-19. Meuter, M. L., Ostrom, A. L., Roundtree, R. I., & Bitner, M. J. (2000). Self-service technologies: Understanding customer satisfaction with technology-based service encounters. *Journal of Marketing*, 64(3), 50-64. Michel, S. (2002). Exploring the service recovery paradox. *American Marketing Association*, 13, 75-82. Miller, J. L., Craighead, C. W., & Karwan, K. R. (2000). Service recovery: A framework and empirical investigation. *Journal of Operations Management*, 18, 387-400. Montfort, K. V., Masurel, E., & Rijn, I. V. (2000). Service satisfaction: An empirical analysis of consumer satisfaction in financial services. *The Service Industries Journal*, 20(3), 80-94. Nunnally, J. C. (1978). *Psychometric theory* (2nd ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill. Oliver, R. L. (1980). A cognitive model of the antecedents and consequences of satisfaction decision. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 17(11), 460-469. Oliver, R. L. (1981). Measurement and evaluation of satisfaction processes in retail settings. *Journal of Retailing*, 57(3), 460-469. Oliver, R. L., & Desarbo, W. S. (1988). Response determinants in satisfaction judgement. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 14(3), 495-507. Oliver, R. L. (1993). Cognitive, affective, and attribute bases of the satisfaction response. *Journal of consumer research*, 20, 418-430. Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., & Berry, L. L. (1985). A conceptual model of service quality and its implication for future research. *Journal of Marketing*, 48(3), 41-50. Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., & Berry, L. L. (1988). SERVQUAL: A multiple-item scale for measuring consumer perceptions of service quality. *Journal of Retailing*, 64(1), 12-40. Sarel, D., & Marmorstein, H. (1999). Managing the delayed service encounter: The role of employee action and customer prior experience. *International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 17(6), 286-294. Shankar, V., Smith, K. M., & Rangaswamy, A. (2003). Customer satisfaction and loyalty in online and offline environments. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 20, 153-175. Smith, A. K., Bolton, R. N., & Wanger, J. (1999). A model of customer satisfaction with service encounters involving failure and recovery. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 36(8), 356-372. Snellman, K., & Vihtkari, T. (2003). Customer complaining behavior in technology-based service encounters. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 14(2), 217-231. Spreng, R. A., Harrell, G. D., & Mackoy, R. D. (1995). Service recovery: Impact on satisfaction and intentions. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 9(1), 15-23. Strawderman, L., & Koubek, R. (2006). Quality and usability in a student health clinic. *International Journal of Health Care Quality Assurance*, 19(3), 225-236. Surprenant, C. F., & Solomon, M. R. (1987). Predictability and personalization in the service encounter. *Journal of Marketing*, 51, 86-96. Swanson, S. R., & Kelley, S. W. (2001). Attributions and outcomes of the service recovery process. *Journal of Marketing Theory & Practice*, 9(4), 50-65. Tax, S. S., & Brown, S. W. (1998). Recovering and learning from service failure. *Sloan Management Review*, 55(4), 75-88. Tax, S. S., Brown, S. W., & Chandrashekar, M. (1998). Customer evaluation of service complaint experience: Implications for relationship marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 62(4), 60-77. Weiner, B. (2000). Attributional thoughts about consumer behavior. *Journal of Consumer research*, 27, 382-387. Wirtz, J., & Mattila, A. S. (2004). Consumer responses to compensation, speed of recovery and apology after a service failure. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 15(2), 150-166. Yim, C. K., Gu, F. F., Chan, K. W., & Tse, D. K. (2003). Justice-based service recovery expectations: Measurement and antecedents. *Journal of Consumer Satisfaction, Dissatisfaction and Complaining Behavior*, 16, 36-52.