

# Examining the Link between Ethics and Abusive Supervision: Evidence from Taiwan and Mainland China

楊慧貞、吳孟玲

E-mail: 9701158@mail.dyu.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

Previous studies on abusive supervision have focused on either organization- or individual level analysis. This multilevel study examined the effect of ethical ideology, moral intensity, corporate ethical values, and procedural justice climate on abusive supervision using a sample of 261 supervisors from Taiwan and Mainland China. Results indicated that with the exception of relativism, all our hypothesized relationships were supported. Implications of these findings for management practice and future research are discussed.

Keywords : abusive supervision ; idealism ; relativism ; moral intensity ; corporate ethical values ; procedural justice climate

## Table of Contents

內容目錄 中文摘要	iii	英文摘要	iii
iv 誌謝辭		v 內容目錄	
vi 表目錄		viii 圖目錄	
ix 第一章 緒論	1	第二章 文獻探討	1
4 第一節 不當監督行為	4	第二節 倫理與道德	4
5 第三節 主管倫理觀與不當監督行為	6	第四節 道德強度	6
7 第五節 道德強度與不當監督行為	8	第六節 企業倫理	8
9 第七節 企業倫理與不當監督行為	9	第八節 程序正義氣候	9
10 第九節 程序正義氣候與不當監督行為	11	第三章 研究方法	11
12 第一節 研究架構	12	第二節 研究對象、問卷發放與回收	13
13 第三節 操作性定義	13	第四節 分析方法	16
16 第四章 研究結果	18	第五章 結論與建議	22
22 第一節 研究結論	22	第二節 研究意涵	25
25 第三節 管理意涵	25	第四節 研究建議及限制	26
26 參考文獻		28 附錄A 主管問卷	46
46 附錄B 部屬問卷			49

## REFERENCES

- 參考文獻 一、中文部份 Hirschi, T. & Gottfredson, M. R. (1997), 偏差行為的共通性(孟維德譯), 28(6), 1-22, (原文於1994年出版)。陳慶瑞(1989), 費德勒權變領導理論研究, 台北, 五南。張岱年(1991), 中國思想倫理研究, 台北:貫雅文化事業公司。王淑女(1993), 民眾的守法觀及其影響因素, 輔仁學誌 法、管理學院之部, 25, 259-297。林鈺琴(2005), 組織公民行為之跨層次分析, 管理學報, 22(4), 503-524。林鈺琴, 彭台光(2006), 多層次管理研究, 管理學報, 22(4), 503-524。林育理(2005), 組織知識活動氣候對員工知識活動影響之研究:一個跨層次模式的驗證, 元智大學管理研究所未出版之博士論文。林原宏(1997), 教育研究資料的階層線性模型分析, 台中師院學報, 11, 489-510。尤靖雅(2005), 企業倫理規範、倫理評價、倫理判斷與行為意圖關係之研究 以房屋仲介從業人員為例, 國立屏東商業技術學院不動產經營所未出版之碩士論文。蔡俊偉(2006), 不當監督與國家文化對組織公民行為之影響探討 以外籍勞工為例, 大葉大學國際企業管理研究所未出版之碩士論文。巫喜瑞, 陳皇嘩(2007), 網路交易消費者道德決策研究-道德強度、道德哲學與匿名性之影響, 管理學報, 2(5), 531-550。高新建, 吳幼吾(1997a), 階層線性模型在內屬結構教育資料上的應用, 教育研究資訊, 5(2), 31-50。高新建(1997b), 階層線性模型的基本概念與模型, 測驗統計簡訊, 15, 1-10。劉子鍵, 林原宏(1997), 階層線性模型之理論與運用:以「影響自然科學成績之因素的研究」為分析實力, 教育與心理研究, 20, 1-22。彭台光, 高月慈, 林鈺琴(2006), 管理研究中的共同方法變異:問題本質、影響、測試和補救, 管理學報, 23(1), 77-98。陳家如(2006), 學校因素對學生學業成就的影響, 國立台北大學社會學系未出版之碩士論文。陳德禹(2000), 「現代行政倫理體系初探」, 行政管理論文選輯, 詮敘部主編, 14, 285-307。徐培松(2004), 不當監督行為及主從交換關係對工作態度之影響, 大葉大學國際企業管理學系研究所未出版之碩士論文。許金田(2004), 倫理領導與領

導效能關聯性之探討，國立台灣大學商學研究所未出版之博士論文。許士軍(1999)，「新管理典範下的企業倫理」，通識教育季刊，6(3)，35-46。許春金，周文勇，蔡田木(1996)，男性與女性偏差行為成因差異之實證研究，犯罪學期刊，2，1-14。吳秉恩(1994)，『「企業倫理」教育的本質、內涵與實踐』，發表於第六屆全國管理教育研討會。吳成豐(2000)，「員工倫理決策與公司企業倫理及組織績效相關性之研究——台灣卓越中小企業、一般中小企業及大企業之比較」，臺大管理論叢，11(1)，231-261。鄭忠勇(2005)，個人倫理觀與領導風格關聯性之研究——以陸軍聯合保修廠領導職軍官為例，國防大學國防管理學院後勤管理研究所未出版之碩士論文。劉勇呈(2006)，倫理價值組合模式與員工倫理行為傾向之關聯性研究——員工忠誠度之交互作用，國防大學國防管理學院資源管理研究所未出版之碩士論文。曹羽男(2006)，組織情境認知、個人道德標準與員工偏差行為之關係，國立台灣科技大學企業管理系研究所未出版之碩士論文。曾淨宜(2004)，以控制觀點探討台灣勞工的不當行為，大葉大學國際企業學系研究所未出版之碩士論文。邱顯良(2006a)，低自我控制與神經、外向性格特質關聯性之初探，中央警察大學警學叢刊，36(5)，147-168。邱顯良(2006b)，不同犯罪類型受刑人低自我控制特質之比較研究，犯罪與刑事司法研究，7，1。張楓明(2006)，社會控制理論之「參與」因素對青少年偏差行為抑制性之實證研究，犯罪學期刊，9(2)，69-96。陸榮茂(2003)，銀行員工受信行為倫理決策之研究——南部地區銀行業從業人員為例，國立高雄第一科技大學金融運管系未出版之碩士論文。葉匡時(2000)，「企業倫理的分析模式與體制變遷」，亞太經濟管理評論，3(2)，1-13。蘇尹翎(2000)，社會聯結與雲嘉地區少年偏差行為Hirschi社會控制理論之驗證研究，南華大學教育社會學研究所未出版之碩士論文。蔣東霖(2002)，依附、社會學習與少年偏差行為，南華大學社會教育學研究所未出版之碩士論文。張人偉(2004)，企業倫理氣候對於員工工作態度及員工倫理行為影響之研究——以證?營業員為例，銘傳大學國際企業學系未出版之碩士論文。康傳林(2004)，跨國企業程序正義與策略執行績效關係之研究——兼論子公司角色及國家文化差異干擾之影響——台美日在大陸子公司之實例研究，中國文化大學國際企業管理研究所未出版之博士論文。徐淑麗(2004)，CEO人格特質、領導型態及組織文化間關係探討——以中部某國際觀光旅館之CEO為例，靜宜大學觀光事業學系未出版之碩士論文。廖國鋒，吳華春(2003)，從正義知覺與關係品質的觀點探討領導者權力對員工投入影響之實證研究，人力資源管理學報，3(2)，1-25。楊正輝(2007)，「新臺灣之子」偏差行為影響因素研究——以桃園縣為例，台北國立大學犯罪學研究所未出版之碩士論文。

二、英文部份

Aronson, E. (2001). Integrating leadership styles and ethical perspectives. *Canadian Journal of Administrative Sciences*, 18(4), 244.

Ashforth, B. (1994). Petty Tyranny in Organizations. *Human Relations*, 47, 755-778.

Barnett T., Bass K., & Brown G., (1996). Religiosity, Ethical Ideology, and Intentions to Report a Peer's Wrongdoing. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 15(11), 1161-1174.

Bartels, R. (1967). A Model for Ethics in Marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 31(1), 20-26.

Bies, R. J. (1987). The predicament of injustice: The management of moral outrage. *Research in Organizational Behavior*, 9, 289-319.

Bies, R. J., & Tripp, T. M. (1998). Revenge in organizations: The good, the bad, and the ugly. In R. W. Griffin, A. O'Leary-Kelly, & J.M. Collins(Eds.), *Dysfunctional behavior in organizations: Behavior Non-Violent Dysfunctional Behavior*, 49-67, Stamford, CT: JAI Press.

Bies, R. J. (2000). Interactional(in) justice: The sacred and the profane. In J. Greenberg, & R. Crpanzano(Eds), *Advances in organization behavior*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Bennett, R. J., & Robinson, S. L. (2000). The past, present and future of workplace deviance research. In Greenberg J(Eds.), *Organizational Behavior: The state of the science*(2nd ed., 247-281), Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.

Bradfield, M., & Aquino, K. (1999). The effects of blame attributions and offender likeableness on forgiveness and revenge in workplace. *Journal of Management*, 25, 607-631.

Bamberger, P. A., & Bacharach, S. B. (2006). Abusive supervision and subordinate problem drinking: Taking resistance, stress and subordinate personality into account. *Human Relations*, 59(6),723-752.

Burton, J. P., & Hoobler, J. M. (2006). Subordinate Self-esteem and Abusive Supervision. *Journal of Managerial*, 18(3), 340-298.

Bartels, L. K. (1998). The relationship between Ethical Climate and Ethical Problems within Human Resource Management. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 17, 799-804.

Cullen, S. (2006). Bad Bosses: tales from the Dark Side. *Office Solutions*, 23(2), 18-23.

Clark. N. K. (1985). The Sadistic Manager. *Personnel*, 62(2), 34-38.

Cordeiro, W. P. (2003). The solution to the Decline in Business Ethics: Ethical Managers, *Teaching Business Ethics*, 7(3), 265-279.

Colquitt, J. A., Noe, R. A., & Jackson C. L. (2002). Justice in teams: antecedents and consequences of procedural justice climate. *Personnel Psychology*, 55(1), 83-109.

Ciulla, J. B. (1995). Leadership ethics: Mapping the territory. *Business Ethics Quarterly*, 5(1), 5-28.

Conner, P. E., & Becker, B. W. (1975). Values and he organizational – suggestions for research. *Academy of Management Journal*, 18(3), 550-561.

Dalal, R. S. (2005). A meta-analysis of the relationship between organizational citizenship behavior and counterproductive work behavior. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 90, 1241-1255.

Davis, M. A., Andersen, M. G., & Curtis, M.B. (2001). Measuring Ethical Ideology in Business Ethics: A Critical Analysis of the Ethics Position questionnaire. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 32(1), 35-53.

Djurkovic, N., McCormack, D., & Casimir, G. (2005). The Behavioral Reactions of Victims to different types of Workplace Bullying. *International of Journal of Organization Theory and Behavior*, 8(4), 439-460.

Douglas, S. C., & Martinko, M. J. (2001). Exploring the role of individual differences in the prediction of workplace aggression. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 86, 547-559.

Domagalski, T. A., & Steelman, L. A. (2005). The impact of work events and disposition on the experience and expression of employee anger. *Organizational Analysis*, 13(1), 31-52.

Duffy, M. K., & Ferrier W. J. (2003). Birds of a Feather? How-Supervisor Subordinate Dissimilarity Moderates the Influence of Supervisor Behavior on Workplace Attitudes. *Group and Organization Management*, 28, 217-248.

Douglas, A., & Martinko, M. (2001). Exploring the role of individual differences in the prediction of workplace aggression. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 86, 547-559.

Daft, R. L. (1998). *Organization Theory and Design*. South-West College Publish, 5101, Madison Road, Cincinnati, Ohio, 45227.

Forsyth, D. R. (1980). A Taxonomy of Ethical Ideologies. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 39(1), 175-184.

Forsyth, D. R. (1985). Individual Differences in Information Integration During Moral Judgment. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 49, 264-272.

Forsyth, D. R. (1992). Judging the morality of business practices: The influences of personal moral philosophies. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 11, 461-470.

Forsyth D. R., Nye, J. L., & Kelley K.(2001). Idealism, Relativism, and the Ethic of Caring. *The Journal of Psychology*, 122(3), 243-248.

Ferrell, O. C., & Gresham, L. G. (1985). A contingency Framework for understanding ethical decision making in marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 69-73.

George, J. M. (1990).

Personality, affect, and behavior in group. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 75, 107-116. Hackman, J. R. (1992). Group influences on individual in organizations. In M.D. Dunnette, & L. M. Hough(Eds.), *Handbook of industrial and organizational psychology*, 3, 199-268. Palo Alto, CA: Consulting Psychologists Press. Hoobler, J. M. (2002). *Abusive supervision In the Workplace: a Restorative Justice Perspective*. Dissertation, Doctor of Philosophy, College of Business and Economics , University of Kentucky. Henle, C. A., Giacalone, R. A., & Jurkiewicz, C. L. (2005). The Role of Ethical Ideology in Workplace Deviance. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 56, 219-230. Hosmer, L. T. (1987). *The Ethics of Management*, Irwin. Hirschi, T. (1969). *Cause of Delinquency*. CA: University of California Press. Hirschi, T., & Gottfredson, M. R. (1994). The Generality of Deviance. London: Transaction Publishers, C1, 1-22. Hunt, S. D., & Vitell, S. J. (1986). A general Theory of Marketing Ethics. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 6(2), 5-16. Hofmann, D. A. (1997). An overview of the logic and rationale of hierarchical linear models. *Journal of Management*, 23, 723-744. Hunt, S. D., Wood, V. R., & Chonko, L. B. (1989). Corporate ethical values and organizational commitment in marketing. *Journal of Marketing* 53, 79-90. James, L. R. (1982). Aggregation bias in estimates of perceptual agreement. *Journal of Applied psychology*, 67, 219-229. Jones, T. M. (1991). Ethical decision making by individuals in organizations: An issue-contingent model. *Academy of Management. The academy of Management Review*, 16(2), 366-395. Keashly, L., Trott, V., & MacLean, L. M. (1994). Abusive behavior in the workplace: A preliminary investigation. *Violence and Victims*, 9(4), 341-357. Kimmel, A. J. (1988). *Ethics and Values in applied in applied social research*. Newburg Park, CA: Sage Publication, Inc.28-29. Leary, M. R., P. D. Knight, & Barnes, B. D. (1986). Ethical Ideologies of the Machiavellian. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* ,12(1), 75-80. Leitsch, D. L. (2004). Differences in the Perceptions of Moral Intensity in the Moral Decision Process: An Empirical Examination of Accounting Students. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 53, 313-323. Laczniak, G., & Murphy, P. E. (1991). Fostering Ethical Marketing Decisions. *Journal of business Ethics*, 10(4), 259-271. Liao, H., & Rupp, D. E. (2005). The impact of justice climate and justice orientation on work outcomes: a cross-level multifoci framework. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 90, 242-256. Lewin, K. (1951). *Field theory in social science : Selected theoretical papers*, In D. Cartwright(Ed.), New York : Harper & Row. Lorenzo, V. D. (2007). Business Ethics: Law as a determinant of Business conduct. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 71, 275-299. Lurie, Y., & Albin, R. (2007). Moral dilemmas in Business Ethics: From Decision Procedures to Edifying Perspectives. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 71, 195-207. Lorenzo, V. D. (2007). Business Ethics: Law as a determinant of Business conduct. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 71, 275-299. Mayer, D., Nishii, L., Schneider, B., & Goldstein, H. (2007). The precursors and products of justice climates: Group leader antecedents. *Personnel Psychology*, 60(4), 929-963. Mazerolle, P., Burton, V. S., Jr., Cullen, F. T., Evans, T. D., & Payne, G..L. (2000). Strain, anger, and delinquent adaptations specifying general strain theory. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 28, 89-101. McMahon, J. M., & Harvey, R. J. (2007). The Effect of Moral Intensity on Ethical Judgment. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 72, 335-357. Mount, M., Ilies, R., & Johnson E. (2006). Relationship of personality traits and counterproductive work behaviors. *Personnel Psychology*, 59(3), 591-622. Mossholder, K. W., Bennett, N., & Martin, C. L. (1998). A multilevel Analysis of Procedural Justice Context. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 19, 131-141. Naumann, S. E., & Bennett, N. (2000). A case for procedural justice climate: Development and test of a multilevel model. *Academy of Management Journal*, 43, 881-889. Nelson, R. J. (1998). *Abusive Supervision and Subordinates ' Coping Strategies*. Dissertation, Doctor of Philosophy , The University of Kentucky. Nwachukwu, S. L. S., & Vitell, Jr. S. J. (1997). The influence of corporate culture on managerial ethical judgments. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 16(8), 757-776. Pillai, R., Schriesheim, C. A., & Williams, S. (1999). Fairness perceptions and trust as mediators for transformational and transaction leadership: A two-sample study. *Journal of Management*, 25(6), 897-935. Raudenbush, S. W., & Bryk, A. S. (2002). *Hierarchical linear models : Applications and data analysis methods*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications. Rest, J. R. (1986). *Moral Development: Advances in Research and Theory*. Praeger: New York. Reckless, W. C., & Dintz, S. (1967). Pioneering with self-concept as a vulnerability factor in delinquency. *Journal of Criminal Law, Criminology and Police Science*, 58, 515-523. Rossouw, G. J. (2005). Business Ethics and Corporate Governance: A Global Survey. *Business and Society*, 44(1), 32-39. Rossouw, D., & Van Vuuren, L. (2004). *Business ethics(3rd)*. Cape Town, South Africa : Oxford University Press. Robbins, S. P. (2003), *Organizational Behavior (10th )* Upper Saddle river, NJ: Prentice Hall. Roberson, Q. M. (2006). Justice in Teams: The effects of interdependence and identification on reference choice and justice climate strength. *Social Justice Research*, 19(3), 323-344. Rokeach, M., (1973). *The nature of human values*, New York : The Free Press. Ryan, K., & Oestreich, D. (1998). *Driving Fear out of the Workplace: Creating the High Trust, High Performance Organization*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass. Salgado, J. F. (2002), The Big Five personality dimensions and counterproductive behaviors. *International Journal of Selection and Assessment*, 10, 117-125. Saucier, G. (1994). Mini-Makers: A brief version of Goldberg ' s unipolar Big-Five Makers. *Journal of Personality Assessment*, 63(3), 506-516. Skarlicki, D. P., & Folger, R. (1997). Retaliation in the workplace. The role of distributive, procedural, and interactional justice. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 82, 434-443. Schneider, B., & Reichers, A. (1983). On the etiology of climates. *Personnel Psychology*, 36, 19-40. Sparks, J. R., & Hunt, S. D. (1998). Marketing Researcher ethical sensitivity: Conceptualization, measurement, and Exploratory investigation. *Journal of Marketing*, 62, 92-109. Tepper, B. J. (2000). Consequences of abusive supervision. *Academy of Management Journal*, 43, 178-190. Tepper, B. J., Duffy, M. K., Henle C. A., & Lambert, L. S. (2006). Procedural Injustice, Victim Precipitation, and Abusive Supervision. *Personnel Psychology*, 59(1), 101-123. Trevino, L. K. (1986). Ethical decision-making in organizations: A person-situation integrationist model. *The Academy of Management Review*, 11, 601-617. Tyler, T. R., & Lind, E. A. (1988). *The social psychology of procedural justice*. New York : Plenum. Tyler, T. R., & Bies, R. J. (1990). Beyond formal procedures: The interpersonal context of procedural justice. In : Carroll , J.(Ed.) *Advance in Applied Social Psychology: Business Settings*, Lawrence Erlbaum, Hillsdale, NJ, 77-98. Tyler, T. R., & Lind, E. A. (1992). A relational model of authority in groups. In M.P. Zanna(Ed.), *Advances in experimental social psychology*. 25: 115-191. Sandiego: Academic Press. Tyler, T. R. (1994). Psychological models of the justice motive: Antecedents of distributive and procedural justice. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 67(5), 850-863. Van der Vegt, G., Emans,

B., & Van de Vliert, E. (1998). Motivating effects of task and outcome interdependence in work teams. *Group and Organization Management*, 23, 124-143. Velasquez, M. G., & Rostankowski, C. (1985). *Ethics : Theory and practice*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ : Prentice-Hall. Vitell, S. J., & Hidalgo, E. R. (2006). The Impact of corporation Ethical Values and Enforcement of Ethical codes on the Perceived Importance of Ethics in Business: A comparison of U.S. and Spanish Managers. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 64, 31-43. Wolf, T. M., Randall, H. M., Van Almen, K., & Tynes, L. L. (1991). Perceived mistreatment and attitude change by graduating medical students: A retrospective study. *Medical Education*, 25, 182-190. Watley, L. D., & May, D. R. (2004). Enhancing Moral Intensity: The Roles of Personal and Consequential Information In Ethical Decision-Making. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 50, 105-126. Wimbush, J. C., & Shepard, J. M. (1994). Toward an understanding of Ethical Climate: Its relationship to ethical behavior and supervisory influence. *Journal of Business*, 13, 637-647.