

Service failure and service recovery in health care industry : The research of process recovery approach

陳寶中、朱寶青

E-mail: 9607800@mail.dyu.edu.tw

ABSTRACT

Not like consumptive style services, health care services are highly professional. During the process of service delivering, the patients are easily to be upset due to the gap between reality and expectation. Most related analysis and studies in service failure in health care services apply Critical Incident Technique(CIT). But CIT only focuses on the most critical factor by data reduction, and falls short on analyzing complicated, continuous information occur during an interactive service process. In this research, Subjective Sequential Incidents Technique(SSIT) will be applied to study the negative experiences of patients during medical treatments, and to analyze the possible causes of service failure in a health care process. This study, based on 11 offended-in-hospital cases, establishes a 10-stages " Subjective Service Deliver Blueprint " in health care services using SSIT. For the causes of offensive feeling, this study also presents a concept framework with 5 kinds of classifications: recessive, comprise cause affairs, dramaturgy, inappropriate response, and admonish. This study also points out 17 scenarios of service failure during the interactive process of service in the sample cases.

Keywords : Service Failure ; Service Recovery ; Subjective Sequential Incidents Technique ; Critical Incident Technique

Table of Contents

內容目錄	中文摘要	iii	英文摘要	iii
iv	誌謝辭	v	內容目錄	v
vi	表目錄	viii	圖目錄	viii
x	第一章 緒論	1	第一節 研究背景與動機	1
1	第二節 研究目的	1	第二章 文獻探討	1
4	第一節 服務接觸	4	第二節 顧客經驗管理	4
6	第三節 服務失誤的相關研究	9	第四節 服務補救相關的研究	16
16	第五節 劇場理論	19	第六節 醫病溝通與知覺控制	21
21	第三章 研究方法	25	第一節 傳統研究方法的不足	25
25	第二節 研究問題	25	第三節 SSIT操作分析方法與步驟	26
26	第四節 資料分析原則	28	第五節 資料收集與研究對象	29
29	第四章 研究分析	31	第一節 病患(第三者)負面情緒延伸六分類框架	31
31	第二節 醫療業之主觀服務遞送藍圖	33	第三節 本研究主情節、氣點家族的氣點分布結果分析	46
46	第四節 與既有服務失誤文獻分類之對照分析	50	第五章 結論與建議	50
50	第一節 結論	62	第二節 管理意涵	62
62	第三節 研究建議與限制	66	參考文獻	66
66	附錄A SSIT整理表格	80	附錄B 階段整理表	80
80	附錄C 階段狀況整理表	175		175

REFERENCES

- 一、中文部分 Goffman, E.(1992), 日常生活中的自我表演(徐江敏, 李姚軍譯), 台北:桂冠出版社, (原文於1975年出版)。Iacobucci, & Swartz(2002), 服務業的行銷與管理(李茂興, 戴靖惠, 吳偉慈譯), 台北:弘智出版社, (原文於1999年出版)。王莉華(2004), 顧客對不同醫療服務缺失之歸因、嚴重度認知與行為反應之研究, 台灣大學醫療機構管理研究所未出版之碩士論文。石崇良(2003), 病人安全之國際趨勢, 於行政院衛生署主辦, 建立安全的醫療環境研討會講義, 台中:台中中山附設醫院。財團法人醫院評鑑暨醫療品質策進會(2006), 醫院評鑑[線上資料], 來源:www.tjcha.org.tw/。張景旭, 張馨華(2006), 服務經濟轉型下的「重要事件技術」爭議與對策:「主觀順序事件技術」之提出, 關係管理研究, (3), 49-76。陳富來(2003), 服務品質與服務缺口關係之研究:以中醫醫療為例, 銘傳大學管理科學研究所在職專班未出版之碩士論文。景鴻鑫(1998, October), 飛航安全裕度, 科學月刊, 29(5), 804-807。黃麗君, 楊勝凱(2006), 顧客共

創激勵因子之探索性研究---顧客夥伴關係之建構, 關係管理研究, (3), 77-92。 楊嘉玲(2004), 某醫學中心內科病房消費者滿意度指標之探討消費者滿意度指標, 醫療品質雜誌, 3(1), 11-18。 熊心如(2005), 全民健保總額支付制度與醫病關係之影響--某醫學中心之個案研究, 東海大學管理研究所在職專班未出版之碩士論文。 鄭榮郎, 鄭嫩婷, 陳昌宗(2005), 醫療服務品質、服務疏失、顧客滿意度之相關性研究, 第三屆『管理思維與實務』學術研討會論文集(pp. 181-193), 高雄:正修科技大學。 簡明慧(2004), 醫院顧客抱怨處理機制之研究--以台北市某醫學中心檔案為例, 國立陽明大學醫務管理研究所碩士論文。

二、英文部分 Arediss, Donabedian (1998). The definition of quality and approaches to its assessment. Explorations in Quality Assessment and Monitoring Vo1 Health Administration Press Ann Arbor, Michigam. Bamford, D., & Xystouri, Tatiana (2005). A case study of service failure and recovery within an international airline. *Managing Service Quality*, 15(3), 306-322. Barbara, R. Lewis, & McCann, Pamela. (2004). Service failure and recovery: Evidence from the hotel industry. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 16(1), 6-17. Barker, S., & Hartel, C. E. J. (2004). Intercultural service encounters: An exploratory study of customer experiences. *Cross Cultural Management*, 11(1), 3-14. Berry, L. L., Carbone, L. P., & Haeckel, S. H. (2002). Managing the total customer experience. *MIT Sloan Management Review*, 43(3), 85-89. Berry, L., Shostack, G., & Upah, G. (Eds.). (1983). The dramaturgy of services exchange: An analytical framework for services marketing. Emerging perspectives on services marketing. Chicago: American Marketing Association. Bitner, M. J., Booms, B. H., & Mohr, L. A. (1994). Critical service encounters: The employee's viewpoint. *Journal of Marketing*, 58(4), 95-106. Bitner, M. J., Booms, B. H., & Tetreault, M. S. (1990). The service encounter: Diagnosing favorable and unfavorable incidents. *Journal of Marketing*, 54(1), 71-84. Bitran, Gabriel R., & Hoeh, Johannes (1990). The humanization of service: Respect at the moment of truth. *Sloan Management Review*, 31(2), 89-96. Boshoff, Christo (1999). An instrument to measure satisfaction with transaction-specific service recovery. *Journal of Service Research*, 1(3), 236-249. Calhoun, J. (2001). Driving loyalty by managing the total customer experience. *Ivey Business Journal*, 65(6), 69-73. Carlzon, J. (1987). Moments of truth. Ballinger Publishing Co., Cambridge. Cina, Craig (1990). Compomy study: Five steps to service excellence. *The Journal of Services Marketing*, 4(2), 39-47. Oswick, Cliff., Keenoy, Tom., & Grant, David (2001). Dramatizing and organizing: Acting and being. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 14(3), 218 – 224 . Conlon, D. E., & Murry, N. M. (1996). Customer perception of corporate responses to product complaints: The role of explanations. *Academy of Management Journal*, 39(5), 1040-1056. Dasu, Sriram, & Rao, Jay (1999). Nature and determinations of customer expectations of service recovery in health care. *Quality Management in Health Care*, 7(4), 32-50. Davis, Frank W. Jr., & Manrodt, Karl B. (1992). Teaching service response logistics. *Journal of Business Logistics*, 13(2), 199-214. Edvardsson, B. (1996). Kvalitet och tjänsteutveckling. Studentlitteratur, Swedish: Lund. Edvardsson, B., Gustafsson, A., Johnson, M. D., & Sanden, B. (2000). New service development and innovation in the new economy. Studentlitteratur, Swedish:Lund. Engel, Lee(1969). The moment of truth in management services. *Journal of Accountancy*, 127(000002), 33-37. File, Karen Maru, Judd, Ben B., & Prince, Russ Alan (1992). Interactive marketing: The Influence of participation on Pos. *The Journal of Services Marketing*, 6(4), 5-14. Freeman, L. Neal (2005). Extended marketing mix drives service delivery. *Ophthalmology Times, Trade & Industry*, 106. Gilmore, J. H., & Ii, B. J. P. (2002). Customer experience places: The new offering frontier, *Strategy & Leadership*, 30(4), 4-11. Goodwin, C., & Ross, I. (1992). Consumer responses to service failures: Influence of procedural and interactional fairness perceptons. *Journal of Business Research*, 25(2), 149-153. Gronroos, Christian (1988). Service Quality: The Six Criteria Of Good Perceived Service. *Review of Business*, 9(3), 10-13. Harris, R., Harris, K., & Baron, Steve(2003). Theatrical service experiences: Dramatic script development with employees. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 14(2), 184-199. Hart, C. W. L., Heskett, J. L., & Sasser, W. E. (1990). The profitable art of service recovery. *Harvard Business Review*, 68(4), 148-156. Higie, R. A., & Feick, L. F. (1989). Enduring involvement: Conceptual and measurement issue. *Advances in Consumer Research*, 3(16), 690-696. Hoffman, K.D., Kelley, S.W., & Rotalsky, H. M. (1995). Tracking service failures and employee recovery efforts. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 9(2), 1-11. Holbrook, M. B. (1999). Customer value-A framework for analysis and research. London and New York: Routledge. Jacob, V. Simons Jr. (2004). Reliability-based analysis of service recovery. *The International Journal of Quality & Reliability Management*, 21(1), 11-31. Jacob, V. Simons Jr., & Mark, E. Kraus (2005). An analytical approach for allocating service recovery efforts to reduce internal failures. *Journal of Service Research*, 7(3), 77-289. Jong, Ad. De., & Ruyter, Ko. de. (2004). Adaptive versus proactive behavior in service recovery: The role of self-managing teams. *Decision Sciences*, 35(3), 457-491. Karl, Katherine, & Peluchette, Joy V. (2006a). Perceptions regarding the impact of workplace attire on workplace outcomes. *Journal of the North American Management Society*, 1(1), 42-48. Karl, Katherine, & Peluchette, Joy V.(2006b). How does workplace fun impact employee perceptions of customer service quality? *Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies*, 13(2), 2-29. Katz, Karen L., Larson, Blaire M., & Larson, Richard C. (1991), Prescription for the Waiting-in-Line blues: Entertain, enlighten, and engage. *Sloan Management Review*, 32(Winter), 44-53. Kelley, S. W., & Davis, M. A. (1994). Antecedents to consumer expectation for service recovery. *Journal of the Academy Marketing Science*, 22(1), 52-61. Kelley, S.W., Hoffman, K. D., & Davis, M. A. (1993). A typology of retail failures and recoveries. *Journal of Retailing*, 69(4), 429-452. Kendrick, Terry, & Fletcher, Keith (2002). Addressing customer myopia: Strategic interactive marketing planning in a volatile business environment. *Journal of Database Management*, 9(3), 207-219. Kiska, J. (2002). Customer experience management. *CMA Management*, 76(7), 28-30. Kostera, Monika, & Kominski, Andrzej K. (2001). Four theatres: moral discourses in polish management. *Management Learning*. 32(3), 321-343. Lockwood, & Andrew (1994). Using service incidents to identify quality improvement points. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 6(1, 2), 75-80. LOfgren, Martin (2005). Winning at the first and second moments of truth: an exploratory study. *Managing Service Quality*, 15(1), 102-115. Maxham III, J. G., & Netemeyer, R. G. (2001). A longitudinal study of complaining customers' evaluations of multiple service failures and recovery efforts. *Journal of Marketing*, 66(4), 57-71. McCollough, M. A., Berry, L. L., & Yadav, M. S. (2000). An empirical investigation of customer satisfaction after service failure and recovery. *Journal of Service Research*, 3(2), 121-137. Meuter, M.

L., Ostrom, A. L., Roundtree, R. I., & Bitner, M. J. (2000). Self-service technologies: Understanding customer satisfaction with technology-based service encounters. *Journal of Marketing*, 64(3), 50-64. Michel, Stefan (2004). Consequences of perceived acceptability of a bank's service failures. *Journal of Financial Services Marketing*, 8(4), 367-377. Mick, D. G., & Fournier, S. (2000). I can't get no satisfaction (without really knowing customer's experiences). *American Marketing Association. Conference Proceedings*, 11, 81-82. Mirvis, Philip H. (2005). Large Group Interventions: Change as Theater. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 41(1), 122-138. Normann, R. (1984). *Service Management*. John Wiley & Sons, New York. Oliva, R. A. (2000). 'Atomize' your customers' experience. *Marketing Management*, 9(3), 54-57. Olorunniwo, F., Maxwell, K. Hsu, & Godwin, J. Udo. (2006). Service quality, customer satisfaction, and behavioral intentions in the service factory. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 20(1), 59-72. Parasuraman A., Berry, L. L., & Zeithaml, V. A. (1985). A conceptual model of service quality and its implications for futuring research. *Journal of Marketing*, 49, 41-50. Richard B. Chase (2004). It's time to get to first principles in service design. *Managing Service Quality*, 14(2/3), 126-128. Robert, E. B. Jr. (1999). Stop hurting the ones you love--applying customer-driven strategies. *Hospital Materiel Management Quarterly*, 21(2), 26-30. Sara Bjorlin Liden, Ugur Yavas, Osman M. Karatepe, & Turgay Avci (2003). The effect of service guarantees on service recovery. *Academy of Marketing Science*, 31(3), 272. Schmitt, B. H. (2003). Customer care: Managing the experience, strengthening the business [Customer experience management]. *CMA Management*, 77(3), 6-7. Shostack, G. L. (1985). Planning the service encounter. *The Service Encounter*. Lexington: MA, 243-254. Smith, A. K., Bloton, R. N. & Wagner, J. (1999). A model of customer satisfaction with service encounters involving failure and recovery. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 36(3), 356-372. Solnick S. J., & David H. (1992). Complaints and disenrollment at a health maintenance organization, *The Journal of Consumer Affairs*, 1(26), 90. Solomon, M. R., Surprenant, C., Czepiel J. A., & Gutman E.G. (1984). A role theory perspective on dyadic interactions: The service encounter. *Journal of Marketing*, 49, 99-111. Stan, S., Evans, K. R., Stinson, J. L. & Wood, C. (2002). Critical customer experiences in professional business-to-business service exchanges: Impact on overall customer response to service providers. *American Marketing Association. Conference Proceedings*, 13, 113-114. Stevens, T., & May, A. (2004). Improving customer experience using web services. *BT Technology Journal*, 22(1), 63-71. Strauss, J. & Frost, R. (2001). *E-marketing*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall. Streeter, B., Bielski, L., & Valentine, L. (2005). Amid all the glitter, it still comes back to customer experience. *American Bankers Association, ABA Banking Journal*, 97(1), 49-52. Tateson, R., & Bonsma, E. (2003). Shopping garden -- Improving the customer experience with on-line catalogues. *BT Technology Journal*, 21(4), 84-91. Tax, S. S., & Brown, S. W. (1998). Recovering and learning from service failure. *Sloan Management Review*, 75-88. Thomas, B. (2003). Making quality customer experience real: how we achieved new heights in our customer-supplier relationships. *Quality Congress. Annual Quality Congress Proceedings*, 57, 617-623. Thomas, Wood Jr. (2002). Spectacular metaphors: From theatre to cinema. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 15(1), 11-20. Wells, William D. (1994). Disc very-oriented consumer research. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 19(4), 489-504. White, E., Behara, R., & Babbar, S. (2002). Mine customer experiences. *Quality Progress*, 35(7), 63-67. Williams, Jacqueline A., & Anderson, Helen H. (2005). Engaging customers in service creation: A theater perspective. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 19(1), 13-23. Wirtz, Jochen, & Mattila, Anna S. (2004). Consumer responses to compensation, speed of recovery and apology after a. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 15(2), 150-166. Wyner, G. A. (2000). Customer experience on the web. *Marketing Management*, 9(4), 6-7. Yuan-Chih Huang, Chih-Hung Wu, & Jovan Chia-Jung Hsu (2006). Using importance-performance analysis in evaluating Taiwan medium and long di. *Journal of American Academy of Business*, Cambridge, 98.