

# Service Failure and Service Recovery in Hospitality: The Research of the Moments of Truth Approach.

邱炳翰、張景旭

E-mail: 9607701@mail.dyu.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

Although people have an increasing demand for medical care, patients not anymore play a dependent role that obedient to professional authority. Under the promotion of "medical consumerism," how medical personnel avoid negative emotional response resulted from contact interaction may be a decisive factor of successive medical care service in a medical field with high contact characteristic. Most traditional scholarly discussions on service failure adopted Critical Incident Technique (CIT), but the analysis of respondents' data information was also scaled down by this method, and "moment of truth" of each interaction in service process cannot be discovered either. This study adopted Subjective Sequential Incidents Technique (SSIT) proposed by Chang, Chin-Hsu as a study method to analyze "moment of truth" of contact interaction in patients' experiences of taking medical service, with an attempt to propose a deep discussion on situational factors of service failures in medical outpatient services. Based on sixteen angry stories in outpatient situation, this study set up Subjective Service Delivery Blueprint for six main phases in medical outpatient services. In those angry stories, this study found five types of points that make customers angry (angry points): event-triggering angry point, situation factor angry point, inappropriate response, dramaturgic angry point, and admonitor. Among these angry points, situation factor angry point play its role in service delivery phase and has a feature of linking the last and next angry point. Thus, it is not only a concrete supporter of "moment of truth" continuity in the service failure process, but also provides a thinking concept for studies of recovery of service failure process.

Keywords : subjective sequential incidents technique, service failure, service recovery, moment of truth, subjective service delivery blueprint

## Table of Contents

內容目錄 中文摘要	iii	英文摘要	
iv 誌謝辭		vi 內容目錄	
vii 表目錄		ix 圖目錄	
x 第一章 緒論	1	第一節 研究背景與動機	1
1 第二節 研究目的	3	第二章 文獻探討	3
4 第一節 服務失誤定義	4	第二節 服務失誤類型分類	4
4 第三節 服務補救	14	第四節 醫療服務補救	18
18 第五節 顧客經驗管理	20	第六節 自覺控制感	22
22 第七節 戲劇理論	25	第八節 醫病關係	28
28 第九節 服務遞送藍圖關鍵時刻(MOT)	29	第三章 研究方法	34
34 第一節 研究方法選擇	34	第一節 研究對象及資料蒐集	36
34 第二節 研究步驟圖	34	第二節 SSIT方法分析原則	40
34 第三節 研究問題	36	40 第四章 研究分析與發現	42
36 第四節 研究對象及資料蒐集	36	42 第一節 主觀服務遞送藍圖MOT氣點分類	42
36 第五節 SSIT方法資料分析步驟	37	45 第二節 醫療門診階段、情節分析	45
37 第六節 SSIT方法分析原則	40	45 第三節 醫療門診主觀服務遞送藍圖	56
40 第四章 研究分析與發現	42	56 第一節 本研究主觀服務遞送藍圖與醫療文獻比較	71
42 第一節 主觀服務遞送藍圖MOT氣點分類	42	71 第二節 主觀服務遞送藍圖管理意涵	88
42 第二節 醫療門診階段、情節分析	45	88 第三節 研究限制	92
45 第三節 醫療門診主觀服務遞送藍圖	56	92 第四節 後續研究者建議	93
56 第一節 本研究主觀服務遞送藍圖與醫療文獻比較	71	93 參考文獻	94
71 第二節 主觀服務遞送藍圖管理意涵	88	94 附錄A 個案SSIT分析表格	106
88 第三節 研究限制	92	106 附錄B 個案階段聯集表	128
92 第四節 後續研究者建議	93	128 附錄C 階段聯集表(正式表格)	136
93 參考文獻	94		
94 附錄A 個案SSIT分析表格	106		
106 附錄B 個案階段聯集表	128		
128 附錄C 階段聯集表(正式表格)	136		

## REFERENCES

一、中文部分 Bernd. H. Schmitt (2000), 體驗行銷(王育英, 梁曉鶯譯), 台北市:經典傳訊文化。 Bernd. H. Schmitt (2004), 顧客經驗管理(顧淑馨譯), 台北市:中國產力中心。 Erving Goffman (1992), 日常生活中的自我表演(徐江敏譯)。台北:桂冠出版社。 Jan Carlon (1998), 關鍵時刻(Moments of Truth):顧客導向的營策略(李田樹譯), 台北市:長河出版社。 Smith, S. & Wheeler, J (2003), 創造顧客感動的品牌管理:把顧客變成忠誠的擁戴者(郭菟玲譯), 台北市:哈佛企管。 Terese A. Swartz & Dawn Iacobucci (2002), 服務業的行銷與管理(李茂興, 戴靖惠, 吳偉慈譯), 台北:弘智文化事業有限公司。 中央健康保險局95年11月18日網站 <http://www.nhi.gov.tw/webdata/webdata.asp> 中華民國統計資訊網95年12月31日查詢網站: <http://www.stat.gov.tw/ct.asp?xItem=14437&ctNode=1309> 吳錦棉(2002), 國內醫療服務缺失及服務補救現況之探討—以桃園縣區域醫院為例, 桃園縣元智大學管理學系未出版碩士論文。 翁瑞宏, 黃靖媛, 黃金安(2006), 病患與醫師良好關係是否會增強其對醫院的忠誠度呢? 台灣衛誌, Vol.25, No.4。 陳火庸(2006), 台鐵行車事故肇事因子之研究。 台中市逢甲工程與管理學系未出版碩士論文。 張景旭, 張馨華(2006), 服務經濟轉型下的「重要事件技術」爭議與對策:「主觀順序事件技術」之提出, 第三屆關係管理學術研討會, 彰化縣大葉大學。 張景旭, 朱寶青, 范垂爐, 張馨華(2006), 服務失誤之引發事件與員工回應不當行為之研究 - 以顧客經驗管理為取向, 第四屆關係管理學術研討會, 彰化縣大葉大學。 黃以文(2004), 關病關係的建立, 道雜誌, (10), 31-37。 黃敏惠(2002), 服務失誤之歸因與服務補救後滿意度關係之研究, 台北市中國文化大學國際企業管理學系未出版碩士論文。 經濟部統計處95年11月18日網站:[www.moea.gov.tw/](http://www.moea.gov.tw/) 廖士程, 李明濱, 謝博生, 李源德(2005), 醫病關係與醫療滿意度之全國性普查, 醫學教育, 9, 14-61。 蔡玉娟, 曾智強(2006), 以顧客關係管理為基楚之醫療網站設計, 醫療資訊雜誌, 15(1); 1-16。 鄭榮郎, 鄭嫩婷, 陳昌宗(2005), 醫療服務品質、服務疏失、顧客滿意度之相關性研究, 「管理思維與實務」學術研討會論文集。 二、英文部分 Albrecht, K., & Zemke, R. (1985). Serve America: Doing business in the new economy. Dow-Jones Irwin, Homewood, IL, p. 129. Anthony, D. M., Anne, M. B., & David, E. S. (2001). Promoting and Countering Consumer Misconceptions of Random Events: The Case of Perceived Control and State-Sponsored Lotteries, *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 20, no. 2, 254-267. Bandura, A. (1986). Social foundations of thought and action: A social cognitive theory. New Jersey; prentice-Hall, Inc., Englewood Cliffs. Berry, L. L., Carbone, L. P. & Haeckel, S. H. (2002). Managing the total customer experience. *MIT Sloan Management Review*, 43 (3), pp. 85-89. Bitner, M. J., Booms, B. H., & Tetreault, M. S. (1990). The service encounter: Diagnosing favorable and unfavorable incidents. *Journal of Marketing*, Vol.54, pp. 71-84. Bitner, M. J., Booms, B. M., & Mohr, L. A. (1994). Critical service encounters: The employee 's viewpoint. *Journal of Marketing*, Vol.58, No. 10, pp. 95-106. Brent, S., KAY D., Udell J. (2003): Web service blueprint. < javascript: void (0) ; > . *Info World*. San Mateo: Dec1, 25, Iss.47, p. 32. Buttle, F., & Burton, J. (2002). Does service failure influence customer loyalty. *Journal of Consumer Behaviour*, Vol. 1 (No.3), pp. 217-227. Calhoun, J. (2001). Driving loyalty by managing the total customer experience. *Ivey Business Journal*, 65(6), p. 69-73. Claes, F., & Wernerfelt, B. (1987). Defensive marketing strategy by customer complaint management: A theoretical analysis. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 24 (November), p. 337-46. Davis, F. W., Manrodt, K. B. (1992). Teaching service response logistics. *Journal of Business Logistics*; 13, 2; *ABI/INFORM Global*, p. 199. DiBella, A. J. (2001). Reducing health care risk. *Health Forum Journal*, Vol. 44, No.4, pp. 16-18. Engel, L. (1969), The moment of truth in management services. *Journal of Accountancy* (pre-1986); Feb 1969; 127, *ABI/INFORM Global*, p. 33. Firnstahl, T. W. (1989). My employees are my service guarantees, *Harvard business review*, (July-August), pp.4-8. Gronroos, C. (1988). Service quality: The six criteria of good perceived service quality. *Review of Business*, 9(3), pp. 10-13. Harris, R., & Baron, S. (2003). Theatrical service experiences: Dramatic script development with employees. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*; 14(2); *ABI/INFORM Global*, p. 184. Hart, C. W. L., Heskett, J. L., & Sasser, W. E. (1990). The profitable art of service recovery. *Harvard Business Review*, 12(3), pp. 148-156. Hays, J. M., & Hill, A. V. (1999). The market share impact of service failures. *Production and Operations Management*, Vol. 8, No.3, pp. 208-220. Heskett, J. L., Jones, T. O., Loveman, G. W., Sasser, W. E., & Schlesinger, L. A. (1994). Putting the service-profit chain to work. *Harvard Business Review*, 11(4), p. 164-174. Hoffman, K. D., Kelley S. W. & Rotalsky, H. M. (1995). Tracking service failures and employee recovery efforts. *Journal of Services Marketing*, Vol. 9 (No.2), pp. 49-61. Holbrook, M. B. (1999). Customer value—a framework for analysis and research. London and New York: Routledge. Johnston, T. C. & Molly, A. H. (1997). Fixing service failures. *Industrial Marketing Management*, Vol. 26 (Iss.5), pp. 467-473. Jonnalagadda, S. S. & Diwan, S. (2005). Health behaviors, chronic disease prevalence and self-Rated health of older Asian indian immigrants in the U.S. *Journal of Immigrant Health*, Vol. 7, No. 2, April 2005 (C\_2005). Keaveney, S. M. (1995). Customer switching behavior in service industries: An exploratory Study. *Journal of Marketing*, 59 (April), pp. 71-82. Kelley, S. W., Hoffman, D. & Davis, M. A. (1993). A typology of retail failure and recoveries. *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 69 (Iss.4), pp. 429-452. Kelley, S. W., & Davis, M. A. (1994). Antecedents to consumer expectation for service recovery. *Journal of the Academy Marketing Science*, Vol. 22, No. 1, pp. 52-61. Kenney, M. J. (1995). Antecedents to customer expectations for service recovery. *Journal of Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 22, No. 1, pp. 52-62. Kiska, J. (2002). Customer experience management. *CMA Management*, 76(7), pp. 28-30. Kotler, P., Clarke, R.N. (1987). *Marketing for Health Care Organizations*. Englewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall Inc. Kostera, M. & Kozminski, A. K. (2001). Four theatres: Moral discourses in polish management. *Management Learning*; Sep; 32(3); *ABI/INFORM Global*, p. 321. Lewis, B. R., & Spyropoulos, S. (2001). Service failures and recovery in retail banking: the customers ' perspective. *The International Journal of Bank Marketing*. Bradfo, Vol. 19 (Iss.1). Lofgren, M. (2005). Winning at the first and second moments of truth: an exploratory study. *Managing Service Quality*, 15(1); *ABI/INFORM Global*, p. 102-106. Mathwick, C., Malhotra, N. & Rigdon, E. (2001). Experiential value: Conceptualization, measurement and application in the catalog and internet shopping environment. *Journal of Retailing*, 77(1), pp. 39-56. Maxham, J. G. (2001). Service recovery 's influence on consumer satisfaction, positive word-of-mouth, and purchase intentions. *Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 54 (Iss.1), pp. 11-23. McCollough, M. A., Berry, L. L., & Yadav, M. S. (2000). An empirical investigation of customer satisfaction after service failure and recovery. *Journal of Service Research*, 3(2), pp. 121-137. McKenzie, B. (2006). Retail service quality success factors in Estonia: a qualitative

approach. University of Western Ontario, London, Canada. *Baltic Journal of Management*, Vol. 1, No. 3. The current issue and full text archive of this journal is available at [www.emeraldinsight.com/1746-5265.htm](http://www.emeraldinsight.com/1746-5265.htm). Meuter, M. L., Ostrom A. L., Roundtree, R. I. & Binter, M. J. (2000). Self-service technologies: Understanding customer satisfaction with technology-based service encounters. *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 64, No.3, pp. 50-64. Miche, S. (2004). Consequences of perceived acceptability of a bank ' s service failures. *Journal of Financial Services Marketing*, Jun 2004, 8(4), ABI/INFORM Global, p. 367. Mirvis, P. H. (2005). Large group interventions change as theater. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, Mar; 41(1), ABI/INFORM Global, p. 122. Oliva, R. A. (2000). Atomize your customers experience. *Marketing Management*, 9(3), pp. 54-57. Oswick, C., Keenoy , T., & Grant, D. (2001). Editorial: Dramatizing and organizing acting and being. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*; 14(3), ABI/INFORM Global, p. 218. Panteli, N., & Duncan, E. (2004). Information technology & People, 17(4), ABI/INFORM Global, p. 423. Rotter, J. B. (1966). Generalized expectancies for internal versus external control of reinforcement. *Psychological Monographs*, 80(1, Whole No.609). Sarel, D., & Marmorstein, H. (1999). The role of service recovery in HMO satisfaction. *Marketing Health Service*, Vol. 19, pp.6-12. Schmitt, B. H. (2003), Customer care: Managing the experience, strengthening the business [Customer experience management]. *CMA Management*, 77(3), p.6.55-61. Seligman, M. E. P. (1975). Helplessness. San Francisco: Freeman. Shostack, G. L. (1985). Planning the service encounter, in the service encounter, ed. Czepiel, J. A., Solomon, M. R. & Surprenant, C. F., Lexington, M. A.: Lexington Books, pp.243-254. Shostack, G. L. (1987). Understanding service through blueprinting, in advances in service marketing and management, ed. Sshwartz, T. A., Bowen, D.E. & Brown, S. W., Greenwich, C. T: JAI Press. Singh, J.(1991). Industry characteristics and consumer dissatisfaction. *The Journal of Consumer Affairs*, Vol. 25, No. 1, (summer), pp.19-56. Smith , A. K., Bolton , R. N., & Wanger , Janet. (1999). A model of customer satisfaction with service encounters involving failure and recovery. *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol. XXXVI (August), Vol. 36, pp.356-72. Solnick, S. J. & David, H. (1992). Complaints and disenrollment at a health maintenance organization. *The Journal of Consumer Affairs*, Vol. 26, p.90. Spreng, R. A., Harrell, G. D. & Mackoy, R. D. (1995). Service recovery: Import on satisfaction and intentions. *Journal of Service Management*, 9(1): 15-23. Stan, S., Evans, K. R., Stinson, J. L., & Wood, C. (2002). Critical customer experiences in professional business-to-business service exchanges: Impact on overall customer response to service providers. *American Marketing Association. Conference Proceedings*, 13, pp. 113-114. Strauss, J., & Frost R. (2001). E-marketing. upper saddle river, NJ:Prentice Hall. Tax, S. S., & Brown, S. W. (1998). Recovering and learning from service failure. *Sloan Management*, Vol. 40 (Iss.1), pp.75-88. Tayler, S. E. (1983). Adjustment to threatening events: A theory of cognitive adaptations, *American Psychologist*, 38, 1161-1173. Thompson, S. C., & Spacapan, S. (1991). Perceptions of control in vulnerable population. *Journal of social issues*, 47(4),1-21. Wal, G.. V. D., & Peter, L. (1995). Handling complaints in hospitals. *Health Policy*, Vol. 31, pp. 17-27 Wallston, K. A., Smith, B. S. & Dobbins, C. J. (1987). Perceived control and health, *Current Psychological Research & Reviews*, 6, 5-25. Williams, J. e A., Anderson, H. (2005). Engaing customers in service creation: a theater perspective. *The Journal of Services Marketing*; 19(1); ABI/INFORM Global, pg.13-17. Wilson, A. (1994). Emancipating the professions chichester: John Wiley and Sons. Zeithaml, Valarie A., & Mary Jo Bitner (1996), *Services Marketing*, pp30-51. Yagil, D. (2002). The relationship of customer satisfaction and service workers' perceived control. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 13, 3/4; ABI/INFORM Global, pg.382-384. Zeithaml, V. A., & Bitner, Mary J. (1996). *Services Marketing*, 30-51.