

Service Failure and Service Recovery in Apparel Retailing: Dramaturgical Analysis

游雅萍、張景旭

E-mail: 9606751@mail.dyu.edu.tw

ABSTRACT

Service failure and service recovery are important issues for researcher. Based on customer experience management, the study is devoted to the possibility of extending the traditional research of service failure. Besides, SSIT method will be introduced by this research and we will discuss the possible way of the SSIT method for some other research. To improve the Critical Incident Technique, the work utilizes Subjective Sequential Incidents Technique to the discussion of service failure. Accordingly, the traditional CIT in the compressed operation mode of complicated information can be replaced by the detailed conceptualization of customer emotion experience. The study establishes the subjective service deliver blueprint in apparel retailing research using SSIT, which is an extension path form of negative motion with particular industry consumer. Such a form in the dress retail includes ten stages remarkable. Moreover, the work presents a concept framework with seven kinds of classification, such as comprise cause affairs, recessive, the appropriate response, dramaturgy, recovery, link, and admonish. Finally, we compare Bitner's categorization of service failure. We find some types of service failure cannot be found in Bitner's categories.

Keywords : service failure ; service recovery ; subjective sequential incidents technique ; customer experience management ; critical incident technique

Table of Contents

內容目錄 中文摘要	iii	英文摘要	iii
iv 誌謝辭	v	內容目錄	v
vi 表目錄	viii	第一章 緒論	viii
1 第一節 研究背景與動機	1	第二節 研究目的	1
3 第二章 文獻探討	4	第一節 顧客經驗管理	4
4 第二節 關鍵時刻與服務遞送藍圖	8	第三節 服務失誤	10
四節 服務補救	13	第五節 劇場理論	15
第三章 研究方法	20	第一節 傳統研究方法上的不足	20
主觀事件順序技術分析	20	第二節 SSIT分析步驟	21
SSIT分析原則	23	第三節 資料收集方法與研究對象選擇	24
研究分析與發現	26	第一節 顧客負面情緒延伸七分制框架	26
業主觀服務遞送藍圖	28	第二節 服飾業主觀服務遞送藍圖與Bitner比較	36
建議	41	第一節 結論	41
	43	第二節 管理意涵	43
	46	第三節 研究限制	45
	63	第四節 後續相關研究建議	46
	155	參考文獻	47
		附錄A 服飾業SSIT表格	63
		附錄B 服飾業階段分類框架	142
		附錄C 服飾業聯集表	155

REFERENCES

一、中文部分 Goffman, E. (1992), 日常生活中的自我表演(徐江敏等譯), 台北:桂冠出版社, (原文於1975年出版)。行政院主計處(2007), 國民所得及經濟成長[線上資料], 來源: <http://www.stat.gov.tw/ct.asp?xItem=17136&ctNode=497>。行政院主計處(2007), 工商及服務業普查統計表[線上資料], 來源: <http://www.stat.gov.tw/lp.asp?ctNode=543&CtUnit=379&BaseDSD=7>。巫喜瑞, 梁榮達(2005), 餐飲服務業服務接觸要素對顧客反應之影響-劇場理論之觀點, 顧客滿意學刊, 1(2), 183-216。林靜儀, 許蕙卿(2006), 服務失誤與服務補救分類的探索-跨產業觀點, 國立屏東商業技術學院學報, (8), 135-151。林隆儀, 賴錫昭(2005), 關係行銷在服務失誤與服務補救上對顧客滿意影響之研究 - 以航空業為例, 經濟部, 經濟情勢與評論, 11(1), 150-178。陳鈺達(2006), 服務失誤嚴重度、服務補救方式、顧客忠誠度與服務補救滿意度關係之研究, 文大商管學報, 11(2), 71-90。程廣仁(2003), 顧客抱怨原因之研究-以麗嬰房為例, 私立大葉大學工業關係研究所未出版之碩士論文, 44-45。張景旭, 張馨華(2006), 服務經濟轉型下的「重要事件技術」爭議與對策:「主觀順序事件技術」之提出, 關係管理研究, (3), 49-76。劉宗其, 李奇勳, 黃吉村, 渥頓(2001), 服務失誤類型、補償措施與再惠顧率之探索性研究-

以CIT法應用於餐飲業為例，管理評論，20(1)，65-97。鄭紹成(2005)，服務行銷與管理:亞太案例。本土思維，台北:雙葉書廊，440-441。讀書會未發表資料(2007)。

二、英文部分 Alexander, E. C. (2002). Consumer reactions to unethical service recovery. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 36(3), 223-237. Anonymous (1996). Using organizational survey results to improve organizational performance. *The Journal of services marketing*, 10(5), 33-38. Barker, S., & Hartel, C. E. J. (2004). Intercultural service encounters: An exploratory study of customer experiences. *Cross Cultural Management*, 11(1), 3-14. Baum, S. H. (1990). Making your service blueprint pay off. *The Journal of Service Marketing*, 4(3), 45-52. Berry, L. L., Carbone, L. P., & Haeckel, S. H. (2002). Managing the total customer experience. *MIT Sloan Management Review*, 43(3), 85-89. Bitner, M. J., Booms, B. H., & Mohr, L. A. (1994). Critical service encounters: the employee's viewpoint. *Journal of Marketing*, 58(4), 95-106. Bitner, M. J., Booms, B. H., & Tetreault, M. S. (1990). The service encounter: diagnosing favorable and unfavorable incidents. *Journal of Marketing*, 54, 71-84. Bitran, G. R., & Hoeh, J. (1990). The humanization of service: respect at the moment of truth. *Sloan Management Review*, 31(2), 89-96. Booms, B. H., & Bitner, M. J. (1982). Marketing services by managing the environment. In the *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly*, 23, 35-39. Buller, D. B., & Burgoon, J. K. (1996). Interpersonal deception theory. *Communication Theory*, 6, 203-242. Calhoun, J. (2001). Driving loyalty by managing the total customer experience. *Ivey Business Journal*, 65(6), 69-73. Carlzon, J. (1987). *Moments of Truth*. Ballinger Publishing Co., Cambridge. Chandon, J. L., Leo, P. Y., & Philippe, J. (1997). Service encounter dimension a dyadic perspective: measuring the dimensions of service encounters ad perceived by customers and personnel. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 8(1), 65-86. Cina, C. (1990). Company study: five steps to service excellence. *The Journal of Services Marketing*, 4(2), 39-47. Coverly, D. E., Holme, N. O., Keller, A. G., Mattison, T. F. H., & Toyoki, S. (2002). Service recovery in the airline industry: Is it as simple as failed, recovered, satisfied? *Marketing Review*, 1(3), 21-37. Davis, F. W. Jr., & Manrodt, K. B. (1992). Teaching service response logistics. *Journal of Business Logistics*, 13(2), 199-229. Depaulo, B. M., Ainsfield, M. E., & Bell, K. L. (1996). Theories about deception and paradigms for studying it: A critical appraisal of Buller and Burgoon's interpersonal deception theory and research. *Communication Theory*, 6, 297-310. Doug, D. (1997). Keeping it all in focus: the viyella service story. *Managing Service Quality*, 7(3), 124. Duffy, J. A. M., Miller, J. M., & Bexley, J. B. (2006). Banking customers' varied reactions to service recovery strategies. *The International journal of bank marketing*, 24(2/3), 112-132. Edvardsson, B. (1996). *Kvalitet och tjänsteutveckling*. Studentlitteratur, Lund(in Swedish). Edvardsson, B., Gustafsson, A., Johnson, M. D., & Sanden, B. (2000). New service development and innovation in the new economy. Studentlitteratur, Lund. Gagliano, K. B., & Hathcote, J. (1994). Customer expectations and perceptions of service quality in retail apparel specialty stores. *The Journal of Services Marketing*, 8(1), 60-69. Gilmore, J. H., & li, B. J. P. (2002). Customer experience places: The new offering frontier. *Strategy & Leadership*, 30(4), 4-11. Goffman, E. (1959). *The presentation of self in everyday life*. Doubleday and Co., New York, NY. Goodwin, C., & Gremler, D. D. (1996). Friendship over the counter: hoe social aspects of service encounters influence consumer service loyalty. *Advances in Services Marketing and Management*, 5, 247-282. Goodwin, C., & Ross, I. (1992). Consumer responses to service failures: Influence of procedural and interactional fairness perceptons. *Journal of Business Research*, 25(2), 149-153. Gronroos, C. (1988). Service quality: The six criteria of good perceived service. *Review of Business*, 9(3), 10-13. Grove, S. J., & Fisk, R.P. (1983). The dramaturgy of services exchange: An analytical framework for services marketing. In L. Berry & G. Shostack & G. Upah (Eds), *Emerging perspectives on services marketing*. Chicago: American Marketing Association. Grove, S. J., Fisk, R. P., & Dorsch, M. J. (1998). Assessing the theatrical components of the service encounter : Acluster analysis examination. *The Service Industries Journal* , 18(3), 116-134. Harris, R., Harris, K., & Baron, S. (2003). Theatrical service experiences: Dramatic script development with employees. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 14(2), 184-199. Hart, C. W. L., Heskett, J. L., & Sasser, W. E. (1990). The profitable art of service recovery. *Harvard Business Review*, 68(4), 148-156. Hays, J. M., & Hill, A. V. (1999). The market share impact of service failures. *Production and Operations Management*, 8(3), 208-220. Higie, R. A., & Feick, L. F. (1989). Enduring involvement: conceptual and measurement issue. *Advances in Consumer Research*, 3(16), 690-696. Hoffman, K.D., Kelley, S.W., & Rotalsky, H. M. (1995). Tracking service failures and employee recovery efforts. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 9(2), 1-11. Holbrook, M. B. (1999). *Customer value-a framework for analysis and research*. London and New York: Routledge. Holloway, B. B., & Beatty, S. E. (2003). Service failure in online retailing. *Journal of service research*, 6(1), 92-105. Janet, R. M. K., & Beverley, A. S. (2003). Application of fairness theory to service failures and service recovery. *Journal of service research*, 5(3), 251-266. Jones, M. A., Taylor, V. A., Becherer, R. C., & Halstead, D. (2003). The impact of instruction understanding on stisfacton amd switching intentions. *Journal of Consumer Satisfaction, Dissatisfaction and Complaining Behavior*, 16, 10-18. Jong, A. D., & Ruyter, K. D. (2004). Adaptive versus proactive behavior in service recovery: the role of self-managing teams. *Decision sciences*, 35(3), 457-491. Kau, A. K., & Loh, E. W. Y. (2006). The effects of service recovery on consumer satisfaction: a comparison between complainants and non-complainants. *Journal of services marketing*, 20(2), 101-111. Keaveney, S. M. (1995). Customer switching behavior in service industries : an exploratory study. *Journal of Marketing*, 59(2), 71-89. Kelley, S. W., & Davis, M. A. (1994). Antecedents to consumer expectation for service recovery. *Journal of the Academy Marketing Science*, 22(1), 52-61. Kelley, S.W., Hoffman, K. D., & Davis, M. A. (1993). A typology of retail failures and recoveries. *Journal of Retailing*, 69(4), 429-452. Khanh, V. L., & Kandampully, J. (2004). Market oriented learning and customer value enhancement through service recovery. *Managing Service Quality*, 14(5), 390-401. Kiska, J. (2002). Customer experience management. *CMA Management*, 76(7), 28-30. Knorr, E., Sleeper, B., Kaye, D., & Udell, J. (2003). Web services blueprint. *InfoWorld*, 25(47), 32-44. Kostera, M., & Kominski, A. K. (2001). Four theatres: Moral discourses in polish management. *Management Learning*, 32(3), 321-343. Lacko, J. M., McKernan, S. M., & Hastak, M. (2002). Customer experience with rent-to-own transactions. *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 21(1), 126-138. Levesque, T. J., & McDougall, G. H. G. (2000). Service problems and recovery strategies: An experiment. *Canadian Journal of Administrative Sciences*, 17(1), 20-37. Lofgren, M. (2005). Winning at the first and second moments

of truth: an exploratory study. *Managing Service Quality*, 15(1), 102-115. Ma, Y. J., & Niehm, L. S. (2006). Service expectations of older generation y customers: An examination of apparel retail settings. *Managing Service Quality*, 16(6), 620. Manrai, L. A. (1993). Mood effects in services : An integrated conceptual model. In T. A. Swartz & D. E. Bowen & S. W. Brown (Eds.), *Advances in services marketing and management*. London: JAI Press Inc. Massad, N., Heckman, R., & Crowston, K. (2006). Customer satisfaction with electronic service encounters. *International Journal of Electronic Commerce*, 10(4), 73. Maxham III, J. G., & Netemeyer, R. G. (2001). A longitudinal study of complaining customers ' evaluations of multiple service failures and recovery efforts. *Journal of Marketing*, 66(4), 57-71. McCollough, M. A., Berry, L. L., & Yadav, M. S. (2000). An empirical investigation of customer satisfaction after service failure and recovery. *Journal of Service Research*, 3(2), 121-137. McCornack, S. A. (1997). The generation of deceptive messages: Laying the groundwork for a viable theory of interpersonal deception. In J. O. Greene(Eds.), *Message production: Advances in communication theory*(pp.91-126). Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum. Menon, K., & Dube, L. (2000). Ensuring greater satisfaction by engineering salesperson response to customer emotions. *Journal of Retailing* ,76(3), 285-307. Meuter, M. L., Ostrom, A. L., Roundtree, R. I. & Binter, M. J. (2000). Self-service technologies: Understanding customer satisfaction with technology-based service encounters. *Journal of Marketing*, 64(3), 50-64. Michel, S. (2001). Analyzing service failures and recoveries: A process approach. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 12(1), 20-33. Mick, D. G., & Fournier, S. (2000). I can't get no satisfaction (without really knowing customers' experiences). *American Marketing Association. Conference Proceeding*, 11, 81-82. Mirvis, P. H. (2005). Large group interventions: Change as theater. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 41(1), 122-138. Naylor, G., & Frank, K. E. (2000). The impact of retail sales force responsiveness of consumers ' perceptions of value. *Journal of services marketing*, 14(4), 310-322. Normann, R. (1984). *Service Management*. John Wiley & Sons, New York. Novak, T. P., Hoffman, D. L., & Yung, Y. F. (2000). Measuring the customer experience in online environments: A structural modeling approach. *Marketing Science*, 19(1), 22-42. Oliva, R. A. (2000). 'Atomize' your customers' experience. *Marketing Management*, 9(3), 54-57. Oswick, C., Keenoy, T., & Grant, D. (2001). Dramatizing and organizing: acting and being. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 14(3), 218-224. Panteli, N., & Duncan, E. (2004). Trust and temporary virtual teams: alternative explanations and dramaturgical relationships. *Information Technology & People*, 17(4), 423-441. Parasurman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., & Berry, I. L. (1985). A conceptual model of service quality and its implicatohns for future research. *Journal of Marketing* , 49, 41-50. Pieters, R., Bottschen, G., & Thelen, E. (1998). Customer desire expectations about service employees: An analysis of hierarchical relations. *Psychology & Marketing*, 15(8), 755-773. Pine, J. B. II., & Gilmore, J. H. (1999). *The experience economy*. Harvard Business School Press, Boston, MA. Power, C. (1992). Smart selling: How companies are winning over today ' s tougher customer. *Business Week*, 8(3), 46. Robert, E. B. Jr. (1999). Stop hurting the ones you love--applying customer-driven strategies. *Hospital Materiel Management Quarterly*, 21(2), 26-30. Schmitt, B. H. (2003). *Customer experience management*. John Wiley & Sons Inc, New York. Schoefer, K., Ennew, C. (2005). The impact of perceived justice on consumers ' emotional responses to service complaint experiences. *Journal of services marketing*, 19(5), 261-270. Smith, A. K., Bolton, R. N., & Wagner, J. (1999). A model of customer satisfaction with service encounters involving failure and recovery. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 36(3), 356-372. Smith, D. (2005). Business (not) as usual: crisis management, service recovery and the vulnerability of organizations. *The journal of services marketing*, 19(5), 309-320. Spreng, R. A., Harrell, G. D., & Mackoy, R. D. (1995). Service recovery: impact on satisfaction and intentions. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 9(1), 15-23. Stan, S., Evans, K. R., Stinson, J. L., & Wood, C. (2002). Critical customer experiences in professional business-to-business service exchanges: Impact on overall customer response to service providers. *American Marketing Association. Conference Proceedings*, 13, 113-114. Stevens, T., & May, A. (2004). Improving customer experience using web services. *BT Technology Journal*, 22(1), 63-71. Strasser, S., Kennedy, M. R., & Schweikhart, S. B. (1993). Service recovery in health services organizations. *Hospital and health Services Administration*, 38(1), 3-21. Strauss, B. (2002). The dimensions of complaint satisfaction: process and outcome complaint satisfaction versus cold fact and warm act complaint satisfaction. *Managing Service Quality*, 12(3), 172-183. Strauss, J., & Frost, R. (2001). *E-marketing*. Upper Saddle River, NJ:Prentice Hall. Streeter, B., Bielski, L., & Valentine, L. (2005). Amid all the glitter, it still comes back to customer experience. *American Bankers Association, ABA Banking Journal*, 97(1), 49-52. Suprenant, C.F., & Solomon, M. R. (1987). Predictability and personalization in the service encounter. *Journal of Marketing* , 51(2), 86-96. Swanson, S. R., & Kelley, S. W. (2001). Service recovery attributions and word-of-mouth intentions. *European Journal of Marketing*, 35(1/2), 194-211. Tateson, R., & Bonsma, E. (2003). Shopping garden -- Improving the customer experience with on-line catalogues. *BT Technology Journal*, 21(4), 84-91. Tax, S. S., & Brown, S. W. (1998). Recovering and learning form service failure. *Sloan Management Review*, Fall, 75-88. Taylor, V. A., & Bower, A. B. (2004). Improving product instruction compliance: " If you tell me why, i might comply " . *Psychology & Marketing*, 21(3), 229-245. Terri, S., & Jennifer, N. G. (2006). Effect of communication mode in justice-based service recovery. *Managing service quality*, 16(2), 124-144. Terry, L. D. (1997). Public administration and the theater metaphor: The public administrator as villain, hero, and innocent victim. *Public Administration Review*, 57(1), 53-61. Thomas, B., (2003). Making quality customer experience real: How we achieved new heights in our customer-supplier relationships. *Quality Congress. ASQ ' s... Annual Quality Congress Proceedings*, 57, 617-623. Thomas, W. Jr. (2002). Spectacular metaphors: From theatre to cinema. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 15(1), 11-20. Wells, W. D. (1994). " Disc very-oriented consumer research " . *Journal of Consumer Research*, 19 (4), 489-504. Westbrook, R. A. (1981). Source of satisfaction with retail outlets. *Journal of Retailing*, 57(3), 68-85. White, E., Behara, R., & Babbar, S. (2002). Mine customer experiences. *Quality Progress*, 35(7), 63-67. William, K. H. Jr. (1998). Managing moments of truth. *Management Review*, 87(8), 56-60. Williams, J. A., & Anderson, H. H. (2005). Engaging customers in service creation: a theater perspective. *The Journal of Services Marketing*, 19(1), 13-23. Wirtz, J., & Mattila, A. S. (2004). Consumer responses to compensation, speed of recovery and apology after a service failure. *International journal of service industry*

management, 15(2), 150-166. Witkowski, T. H., & Wolfinbarger, M. F. (2002). Comparative service quality: German and American ratings across service settings. *Journal of Business Research*, 55(11), 875. Wyner, G. A. (2000). Customer experience on the web. *Marketing Management*, 9(4), 6-7.