

The Effects of Annotations of Illustrations and Simplified Text on College Students' Reading Comprehension in the Web-b

顏怡青、倪淑芳博士

E-mail: 9601198@mail.dyu.edu.tw

ABSTRACT

Researchers of computer assisted language learning have suggested that integration of text and pictures can create an authentic and interactive environment for learning languages. However, how well non-English major college students comprehend the reading passage through multimedia annotations deserves more attention. The purpose of the present study was to investigate the effectiveness of different annotation modes in web-based learning environment. In addition, the participants' attitudes and perspectives toward different multimedia annotation modes were also examined. The participants were 120 non-English major freshmen at a university in central Taiwan. All participants were assigned into four groups. The first group was the control group, and participants in this group read a text in the web-based environment without any annotation. The participants in Group Two comprehended the reading passage with the assistance of ten simplified text annotations. The participants in Group Three comprehended the reading passage with the assistance of ten text-related pictorial annotations. The participants in the Group Four utilized the assistance of text-picture combination annotation to facilitate the reading process. A multiple-choice reading comprehension test, a recall protocol test, a questionnaire, and an interview were adopted in this study. The main findings from the present study are: (1) Participants' performance on the multiple-choice reading comprehension was better while reading with text-picture combination annotations in the web-based learning environment. (2) Participants' performance on the recall protocol test was better while reading with text-picture combination annotations in the web-based learning environment. (3) Most participants had positive attitudes and perspectives toward multimedia annotations on comprehending the reading text in the web-based environment. Results of the present study were of importance in explaining the effectiveness of different kinds of multimedia annotations. The pedagogical implications for multimedia design further discussed in the fifth chapter and some suggestions for future study were also drawn.

Keywords : multimedia annotations ; reading comprehension ; recall ; web-based learning ; second language learning

Table of Contents

Chapter I. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background of the Study.....	1
1.2 Purposes of the Study.....	4
1.3 Significance of the Study.....	5
1.4 Research Questions.....	6
1.5 Definition of Terms.....	6
1.6 Limitation of the Study.....	8
1.7 Overview of the Study.....	9
Chapter II. LITERATURE REVIEW	10
2.1 The Theoretical Background of Multimedia Processing	10
2.1.1 Generative Theory of Multimedia Learning to Second-Language learning.....	11
2.1.2 Dual-Coding Theory.....	12
2.2 The Value and Effect of Multimedia Annotation.....	13
2.3 The Process of Reading Comprehension.....	14
2.4 The Relationship between Annotations and Reading Comprehension.....	17
2.5 The Theoretical Foundation and the Components of Simplification.....	19
2.6 Visual and Verbal Effects in Second-Language Multimedia Learning.....	23
2.7 Summary.....	24
Chapter III. METHODOLOGY	26
3.1 The Design of the Study.....	26
3.2 Participants.....	29
3.3 Experimental Materials.....	29
3.3.1 The Material: Hypertext Design with Multimedia Annotations.....	30
3.3.2 Instruments.....	33
3.3.2.1 The Written Recall Protocol Test.....	33
3.3.2.2 The Multiple-choice Reading Comprehension Test.....	34
3.3.2.3 The Questionnaire.....	35
3.3.2.4 The Interview.....	36
3.4 Scoring.....	37
3.5 Procedure of the Study.....	38
3.6 Data Analysis.....	40
3.7 Reliability and Validity of the Multiple-choice Reading Comprehension Test and Questionnaire.....	41
3.8 Pilot Study.....	42
3.9 Summary.....	46
Chapter IV RESULTS	47
4.1 Demographic Data of the Respondents	47
4.2 The Result of the Participants' Reading Comprehension.....	49
4.2.1 The Result of Multiple-choice Reading Comprehension Test.....	51
4.2.2 The Result of Recall Protocol Test.....	53
4.3 The Participants' Perceptions of Different Modes of Multimedia Annotations.....	56
4.3.1 The Result of the Perceptions of Simplified-text Annotations.....	56
4.3.2 The Result of the Perceptions of Text-related Pictorial	

Annotations.....	58	4.3.3 The Result of the Perceptions of Multimedia Annotations.....	60	4.4 The Result of the Interview.....	63
4.5 Summary of the results.....	65	Chapter V DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION			
5.1 Discussion of the Result.....	66	5.1.1 Effects of Multimedia Annotations on Reading Comprehension.....	66	5.1.2 Participants ' Perceptions of the Effectiveness of Multimedia Annotations.....	69
5.1.2.1 The Effects of the Simplified Text Annotations.....	70	5.1.2.2 The Effects of the Text-related Pictorial Annotations.....	70	5.1.3.3 The Functions of the Multimedia Annotations.....	71
5.1.3.4 The Result of the Interview.....	72	5.2 Conclusion.....	74	5.3 Pedagogical Implications.....	76
5.4 Suggestion for Future Study.....	77	REFERENCE.....			80
Appendix A: Multiple-choice Reading Comprehension Test.....	87	Appendix B: Recall Protocol Test (Chinese Version)	90	Appendix C: Recall Protocol Test (English Version)	91
Appendix D: The Questionnaire.....	92	Appendix E: The Interview.....	96	Appendix F: The Idea Units of the Written Recall Protocol.....	97
Appendix D: The Questionnaire.....	92	Appendix E: The Interview.....	96	Appendix F: The Idea Units of the Written Recall Protocol.....	97
Appendix G: The Central Ideas of the Reading Text.....	99	Appendix H: The Supporting Ideas of the Reading Text.....	100	Appendix I: The Translation and the Detailed Scoring Criteria.....	102
Appendix J: Simplified Text and Text-related Pictorial Annotations for Complicated Sentences.....	104	Appendix K: An Example of One Student ' s Recall Protocol with the Detailed Scoring.....	108		

REFERENCES

- Abraham, L.B. (2001). The effects of multimedia on second language vocabulary learning and reading comprehension. Doctorial dissertation. University of New Mexico.
- Adamsand, M.J., & Collins, A. (1979). A schema-theoretic view of reading. In R.O. Freedle (ED.), *New Directions in Discourse Processing* (pp.1-22). Norwood, NJ: Ablex.
- Anderson, R. C. & Pearson, P. D. (1988). A Schema-Theoretic View of Basic Processed in Reading Comprehension. In P.L. Carrel, J. Devine & D.E. Eskey (Eds.), *Interactive approaches to second language reading*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Bartoli, J., & Brown, A. L. (1988). *Reading learning disability: An ecological approach*. New York: New Teachers College Press.
- Bernard, R. M. (1990). Using extended captions to improve learning from instructional illustrations. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 21, 215-225.
- Brown, H. D. (2001). *Teaching by Principles: An Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy*. (2nd ed.). White Plains, NY: Pearson Education.
- Burmeister, L. E. (1974). *Reading strategies for secondary school teachers*. London: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company.
- Butler-Pascoe, M. E., & Wiburg, K. M. (2003). *Technology and Teaching English Language Learners*. Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Campbell, N. (1987). Adapted literary texts and the EFL reading comprehension. *ELT Journal*, 41, 132-135.
- Carrell, P. L. (1983). Three components of background knowledge in reading comprehension. *Language Learning*, 33(2), 183-207.
- Carrell, P. L., Devine, J., & Eskey, D. E. (1988). *Interactive approaches to second language reading*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Carrell, P. L. & Eisterhold, J. C. (1989). Schema theory and ESL reading pedagogy. In P. L. Carrell, J. Devine, & D. E. Eskey (Eds.), *Interactive approaches to second language reading*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Chang, S. (2002). The roles of marginal glosses and pocket electronic dictionaries in EFL incidental vocabulary learning. Unpublished master ' s thesis, National Taiwan Normal University
- Chen, H. C. (2001). The effects of guessing from context and translation on English vocabulary retention of junior high school students in Taiwan. Unpublished master ' s thesis, National Kaohsiung Normal University
- Chen, T. C. (2000). Vocabulary teaching and semantic feature analysis. *Bulletin of National Taipei Institute of Commerce*, 55, 267-284.
- Chuang, S. Y. (2004). The effect of marginal glosses upon junior high school students ' incidental vocabulary learning through a simplified novel, Unpublished master ' s thesis, National Kaohsiung Normal University
- Chun, D. M., & Plass, J. L. (1996). Effects of multimedia annotations on vocabulary acquisition. *The Modern Language Journal*, 80 (2), 183-198.
- Chun, D. M., & Plass, J. L. (1997). Research on text comprehension in multimedia environment. *Language Learning & Technology*, 1(1), 1-35
- Cochran, J. A. (1993). Reading in the content areas for junior high school and high school. MA: Simon & Schuster
- Dale, E., & Chall, J. S. (1948). A formula for predicting readability. *Educational Research Bulletin*, 11(12), 37-54
- Davey, B. (1988). Factors affecting the difficulty of reading comprehension items for successful and unsuccessful readers. *Journal of Experimental Education*, 56, 67-76.
- Davis J. N. (1989) Facilitating effects of marginal glosses on foreign language reading. *The Modern Language Reading*, 73, 41 – 52.
- Davis, J. N., & Lyman-Hager, M. (1997). Computers and L2 reading: student performance, student attitudes. *Foreign Language Annals*, 30(1), 58-72
- Dechant, E. (1991). *Understanding and Teaching Reading: An Interactive Model*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associate, Inc.
- Dewalt, M., Winkler, M. C., & Rubel, S. (1992). Effects of instructional method on reading comprehension. *Journal of Reading Improvement*, 30(2), 93-99
- Duquette, L., Renie, D., & Laurier, M. (1998). The evaluation of vocabulary acquisition when learning French as a second language in a multimedia environment. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 11(1), 3-34
- Duffy, G. G., Roehler, L. R., & Mason, J. (1984). *Comprehension instruction*. New York: Longman.
- Ellis, R. (1995). Modified oral input and the acquisition of word meanings. *Applied Linguistics*, 16, 409-441
- Fry, E. B. (1968). A readability formula that saves time. *Journal of Reading*, 11, 513-516.
- Garnham, A. (1985). *Psycholinguistics: Central Topics*. New York: Methuen.
- Gettys, S., Imhof, L. A., & Kautz, J. O. (2001). Computer-assisted reading: the effect of glossing format on comprehension and vocabulary retention. *Foreign Language Annals*, 34 (2), 91-106.
- Glenberg, A. H., & Langston, W. E. (1992).

Comprehension of illustrated text: Pictures help to build mental models. *Journal of Memory and Language*, 31, 129-151. Goodman, K. S. (1975). The reading process: Theory and practice. Bellingham: Wash. Grabe, W. (1991). Current developments in second language reading research. *TESOL Quarterly*, 3, 375-396. Guri-Rozenblit, S. (1998). The interrelationship between diagrammatic representations and verbal explanations in learning from social science text. *Instructional Science*, 17, 219-234. Heilman, A. W., Blair, T. R., & Rupley, W. H. (1986). *Principles and Practices of Teaching Reading*. Columbus: Charles E. Merrill. Holley, F. M. (1970). Vocabulary glosses in foreign language reading materials. *Language Learning*, 21, 213-219. Honeyfield, J. (1977). Word frequency and the importance of context in vocabulary learning, *RELC Journal*, 8(2), 35-42. Hu, Y. N. (2003). The effects of original text vs simplified text the adventures of Tom Sawyer on reading attitudes and reading comprehension of EFL senior high students. Unpublished master's thesis, National Kaohsiung Normal University, Taiwan. Irvin, J. W. (1986). Teaching reading comprehension processes. New Jersey City: Prentice-Hall. Jacobs, G. M. (1991). Second language reading recall as a function of vocabulary glossing and selected other variables. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Hawaii at Manoa. Jacobs, G. M. (1994). What lurks in the margin: Use of vocabulary glosses as a strategy in second language reading. *Issues in Applied Linguistics*, 4 (1), 115-137. Johnson, P. (1981). Effects on reading comprehension of language complexity and cultural background of a text. *TESOL Quarterly*, 15(2), 169-182. Johnson, P. (1982). Effects on reading comprehension of background knowledge. *TESOL Quarterly*, 19, 503-516. Knight, S. (1994). Dictionary use while reading: The effects on comprehension and vocabulary acquisition for students of different verbal abilities. *The Modern Language Journal*, 78, 285-299. Kommers, P. A. M., Grabinger, S., & Dunlap, J. C. (1996). *Hypermedia learning environments: Instructional design and integration*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum. Krashen, S. D. (1982). *Principles and practice in second language acquisition*. Oxford: Pergamon Press. Lee, J. F. (1986). Background knowledge & L2 reading. *The Modern Language Journal*, 70, 350-354. Leow, R. P. (1993). To simplify or not to simplify. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, 15 (3), 337-55. Liang, G. P. (2003) The effects of visual aids on junior high EFL students' English reading performance. National Kaohsiung Normal University. Lomicka, L. (1998). To gloss or not to gloss: An investigation of reading comprehension online. *Language Learning and Technology*, 1(2), 41-50. Lotherington-Woloszyn, H. (1993). Do simplified texts simplify language comprehension for EFL learner? (ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED371583) Lucas, M. A. (1991). Systematic grammatical simplification. *International Review of Applied Linguistics in Language Teaching*, 29(3), 241-248. Mandl, H., & Levin, J. R. (1989). Knowledge acquisition from text and pictures. Amsterdam: North-Holland. Martinez-Lage, A. (1997) Hypermedia technology for teaching reading. In Bush, M. D. & Terry, R. M. (Eds.), *Technology enhanced language learning* (pp. 122-163). Lincolnwood, IL: National Textbook Company. Martinez-Lage, A., & Herren, D. (1998). Challenges and opportunities: Curriculum pressures in the technological present. In J. Harper, M. Lively, & M. Williams (Eds.), *The coming of age of the profession: Issues and emerging ideas for the teaching of foreign languages* (pp. 141-167). Mayer, R. E. (1997). Multimedia learning: Are we asking the right questions? *Educational Psychologist*, 32(1), 1 – 19. Mayer, R. E., & Sims, K. (1994). For whom is a picture worth a thousand words? Extensions of a dual-coding theory of multimedia learning. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 86(3), 389-401. Mayer, R. E., Steinhoff, K., Bower, G., & Mars, R. (1995) A generative theory of textbook design: Using annotated illustrations to foster meaningful learning of science text. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 43, 31-44. Moore, P. J., & Scevak, J. J. (1997). Learning from texts and visual aids: a developmental perspective. *Journal of Research in Reading*, 20(3), 205-223. Mountford, A. (1976). The notion of simplification: its relevance to materials preparation for English and technology. In J. C. Richards (ED), *English for Science and Technology* (pp.143-162). Singapore: Singapore University Press. Najjar, L. J. (1996). Multimedia information and learning. *Journal of Educational Multimedia and Hypermedia*, 5, 129-150. Nation, I. S. P. (1990). *Teaching and learning vocabulary*. Boston: Heinle & Heinle Publishers. Nunan, D. (1991). *Language Teaching Methodology*. New York: Prentice Hall. Omaggio, A. C. (1979). Pictures and second language comprehension: do they help? *Foreign Language Annals*, 12(2), 107-116. Ostler, S. (1980). A survey of academic needs for advanced ESL. *TESOL Quarterly*, 14, 489-502. Paivio, A. (1986). *Mental representations: A dual coding approach*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Pak, J. (1986). The effects of vocabulary glossing on ESL reading comprehension. Unpublished manuscript, University of Hawaii at Manoa. Pearson, D., & Johnson, D. D. (1972). *Teaching reading comprehension*. New York City: Holt, Rinehart, & Winston. Plass, J. L., Chun, D. M., Mayer, R. E., & Leutner, D. (1998). Supporting visual and verbal learning preferences in a second-language multimedia learning environment. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 90(1), 25-36. Purnell, K. N., & Solman, R. T. (1991). The influence of technical illustrations on students' comprehension in geography. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 26, 277-299. Richards, J.C., Platt, J. & Platt, H. (1998). *Longman Dictionary of Language Teaching & Applied Linguistics*. Hong Kong: Pearson Education North Asia Limited. Roby, W. B. (1999). What's in a gloss? *Language Learning & Technology*, 2(2): 94-101. Retrieved from the World Wide Web July 20, 2006: <http://ilt.msu.edu/vol2num2/roby/index.html> Rumelhart, D. E. (1977). Toward an interactive model of reading. (CHIP Technical Report No. 56). Paper presented at the Attention and Performance VI International Symposium, Stockholm, Sweden, July 1975). (Retrieved From ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 155 587). Shieh, Yen-Lung. (1992). Reading English exposition for gist by Chinese EFL learners: Comprehension, recall and instruction. unpublished doctoral dissertation, National Taiwan Normal University: Shin, Y. F. and Alessi, S. M. (1996). Effects of Text versus Voice on Learning in Multimedia Courseware. *Journal of Educational Multimedia and Hypermedia*, 5(2), 203-218. Silberstein, S. (1994). *Techniques and Resources in Teaching Reading*. New York: Oxford University Press. Singer, M., & Hallderson, M. (1996). Constructing and validating motive bridging influences. *Cognitive Psychology*, 80(1), 1-32. Spache, G. S. (1974). *Good reading for poor readers*. Champaign, IL: Garrard Stemler L. K. (1997). Educational characteristics of multimedia: a literature review. *Journal of Educational Multimedia and Hypermedia*, 6(3-4), 339-359. Sultan, A., & Marshall, J. (1995). The effects of computer visual appeal on learners' motivation. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 391488) Tickoo, M. L. (1993). Simplification: a viewpoint in outline.

(ERIC Document Reproduction Service ED 371586). Tommola, J. (1980). Some parameters of simplification. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED269975) Waddil, P. J., McDaniel, M. A., Einstein, G. O. (1988). Illustrations as adjuncts to prose: A test-appropriate processing approach. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 80, 457-464. Wang, M. C. (2003). A case study of multimedia in TEFL. Unpublished master ' s thesis, National Kaohsiung Normal University, Taiwan Winder, B. (1996). Aesop ' s fables. Taipei: Bookman Winn, W. (1991). Learning from maps and diagrams. *Educational Psychology Review*, 3, 211-247. Wolf, D. F. (1993). A comparison of assessment tasks used to measure FL reading comprehension. *The Modern Language Journal*, 77, 473-489. Wong, H. K., & Wong, R. T. (1991). *The first days of school*. Sunnyvale, CA: Imagery Wong. Wu, J. C. (2002). The effects of multimedia annotations on second language vocabulary retention. Unpublished master ' s thesis, Providence University, Taiwan Yano, Y., Long, H. M. & Ross, S. (1994). The effects of simplified and elaborated texts on foreign language reading comprehension. *Language Learning*, 44(2), 189-219.