

大學生對協同寫作的認知之研究

詹雅惠、魏式琦、倪淑芳

E-mail: 9511415@mail.dyu.edu.tw

摘要

本研究之目的在探討台灣大學生對於協同寫作在語言的發展、寫作焦慮、寫作動機以及社交技巧方面之看法，同時也調查了學生對於小組評稿的看法。本研究以便利抽樣取得彰化縣某間私立學校一百四十四位大學生為研究對象，並經施以三個星期約四個小時的協同寫作及小組評稿之活動。本研究屬於量化性質之研究設計。蒐集的資料包括問卷與大學生之寫作之成績。此研究採用軟體SPSS 10.0 For Windows分析所有蒐集到的資料，藉以提供敘述性與相關性統計之數據。首先，大學生之背景資料與大學生對於協同寫作之看法，主要以次數、百分比、平均數、標準差作呈現。第二，大學生之敘述性回答則藉以內容之分析來歸納。第三，大學生寫作之成績在實驗前與實驗後之比較則用相依樣本T檢定來分析。最後，獨立樣本T檢定與單因子變異係數分析來進行更進一步的問卷之統計分析。本研究主要的發現如下：(一) 協同寫作可以改善學生的語言發展，包括英語能力、寫作能力以及閱讀能力。(二) 協同寫作可以減少學生的寫作焦慮並重新建立學生的信心。(三) 協同寫作可以重新喚起學生的寫作動機。(四) 協同寫作可以發展社交技巧。(五) 透過小組評稿，學生們的寫作作品中的內容及文法會有所改善。(六) 大學生分別因性別、學院、年級的不同，在語言的發展、寫作焦慮、寫作動機以及社交技巧方面之看法有顯著的差異。(七) 大學生分別因學院與年級的不同，在小組評稿方面之看法也有顯著的差異。

關鍵詞：協同寫作；小組評稿

目錄

ABSTRACT.....	vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	viii
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	ix
LIST OF FIGURE.....	xii
LIST OF TABLES.....	xiii
CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 Background and Motivation.....	1
1.2 The statement of the Problem.....	5
1.3 Purpose of the Study.....	6
1.4 Research Questions.....	7
1.5 Significance of the Study.....	7
1.6 Limitation of the Study.....	8
1.7 Definition of Terms.....	9
CHAPTER II. LITERATURE REVIEW.....	14
2.1 Writing Process.....	14
2.2 Collaborative Writing.....	19
2.3 Peer Review / Group Review.....	25
2.4 Writing Apprehension.....	26
2.5 Motivation.....	28
2.6 Summary.....	28
CHAPTER III. METHODOLOGY.....	29
3.1 Participants.....	29
3.2 Instruments.....	30
3.2.1 Teacher ' s Grading Rubric.....	30
3.2.2 Writing Evaluation Checklist.....	32
3.2.3 Questionnaire.....	33
3.3 Procedures.....	36
3.4 Data Analysis.....	37
CHAPTER IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION.....	38
4.1 Results of the Participants ' Background.....	38
4.2 Results of Research Question 1.....	40
4.3 Results of Research Question 2.....	48
4.3.1 Positive Feedback on Collaborative Writing.....	49
4.3.2 Negative Feedback on Collaborative Writing.....	51
4.4 Results of Research Question 3.....	51
4.5 Discussion.....	54
4.5.1 Background Information.....	54
4.5.2 Research Question 1.....	55
4.5.3 Research Question 2.....	58
4.5.4 Research Question 3.....	59
4.6 Subsidiary Analysis.....	61
4.6.1 Independent Samples T-test Results of Gender Differences.....	61
4.6.2 Discussion on Gender Differences.....	64
4.6.3 One-Way ANOVA Results of School Differences.....	65
4.6.4 Discussion on the School Differences.....	69
4.6.5 One-Way ANOVA Results of Grade.....	69

Differences.....	69	4.6.6 Discussion on the Grade Differences.....	73	CHAPTER
V. Conclusion.....	74	5.1 Summary.....	74	
.....	74	5.2 Limitations.....	76	5.3 Pedagogical Implications
.....	77	5.4 Suggestions for Future Research.....	78	
REFERENCES.....	80	APPENDIXES.....		
.....	88	Appendix A: Teacher ' s Grading Rubric.....	88	Appendix
B: Writing Evaluation Checklist (Chinese Version).....	90	Appendix C: Writing Evaluation Checklist (English Version)		
.....	92	Appendix D: Students ' Perceptions toward Collaborative Writing Questionnaire (Chinese Version).....		
.....	94	Appendix E: Students ' Perceptions toward Collaborative Writing Questionnaire		
(English Version).....	97			

參考文獻

- Chinese References <http://www.cgedu.net/research/050105050.htm> 龐偉智 (1999) 合作學習與電腦實驗教學 - 以運結串列學習為例。國立台灣師範大學資訊教育研究所論文, 台北。
- English References Bello, T. (1997). Improving ESL learners ' writing skills. ERIC Digest [On-line]. Available: <http://ericir.syr.edu/plweb/cgi/obtain.pi> Berg, E. C. (1999). The effects of trained peer response on ESL students ' revision types and writing quality. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 8, 215-241. Brown, H. D. (2001). An interactive approach to language pedagogy. *Teaching by Principles*. (2nd ed.). New York: Longman. Bruffee, K. A. (1984). Collaborative learning and the conversation of mankind. *College English*, 28, 323-347. Bruffee, K. A. (1986). Social construction, language, and the authority of knowledge - A bibliographical essay. *College English*, 48, 773-790. Brumfit, C. (1984). *Communicative methodology in language teaching*. London: Cambridge University Press. Byrne, D. (1988). *Teaching writing skills*. London: Longman. Carson, J. G., & Nelson, G. L. (1994). Writing groups: Cross-cultural issues. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 3, 17-30. Caulk, N. (1994). Comparing teacher and student responses to written work. *TESOL Quarterly* 28: 181-188. Chaudron, C. (1983). Evaluating writing: Effects of feedback on revision. Paper presented at the 17th annual TESOL Convention, Toronto, Canada (EDRS No. ED 227 706). Chiang, M. C. (1999). The Effect of Model-based Instruction on Chinese Students ' English Writing. Master ' s Thesis of Graduate Institute of English. National Taiwan Normal Univerisy. Chou, M.C. (1998). How peer negotiations shape revisions. In Katchen, J. & Liung, Y. N. (Ed.). *Proceedings of the Seventh International Symposium on English Teaching*. Taipei, Taiwan: Crane. Clawson, S. (1993). The impact of collaborative writing on the individual. *Teaching and Change*, 1 (1), 55-70. Connor, U., & Asenavage, K. (1994). Peer response groups in ESL writing classes: How much impact on revision? *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 3, 257-276. Dale, H. (1994). Collaborative writing interaction in one ninth-grade classroom. *Journal of Educational Research*, 87 (6), 334-345. Daly, J. A., & Shamo, W. (1978). Academic decisions as a function of writing apprehension. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 12, 119-126. Devin, J., Railey, K., & Boshoff, P. (1993). The implications of cognitive models in L1 and L2 writing. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 2, 203-225. Dillenbourg, P. (1999). Introduction: What do you mean by " collaborative learning " ? In Dillenbourg, P. (Ed.), *Collaborative Learning*. Oxford: Elsevier Science Ltd. Donato, R. (1994). *Collective scaffolding in second language learning* in Lantolf, J. P., & Appel, G. (Ed.). *Vygotskian Approaches to Second Language Research*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex Publishing Corporation. Ede, L., & Lunsford, A. (1990). *Singular Text / Plural Authors*. Carbondale Southern Illinois University Press. Elbow, P. (1973). *Writing without teachers*. New York: Oxford University Press. Emig, J. (1971). The composing processes of twelfth graders. *Research Report No. 13*. Urbana, Ill.: National Council of Teachers of English. Forman, E., & Cazden, C. (1985). Exploring Vygotskian perspectives in education: The cognitive value of peer interaction. In Wertsch, J. (Ed.). *Culture, Communication and Cognition: Vygotskian Perspectives* (323-347). New York: Cambridge University Press. Fowler, B., & Ross, D. (1982). The comparative validities of differential placement measures for college composing courses. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 42, 1107-1115. Flower, L. (1993). *Problem-Solving Strategies for Writing* (4th ed.). Fort Worth: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich College Publishers. Flower, L., & Hayes, J.R. (1981). A cognitive process theory of writing. *College Composition and Communication*, 32, 4, 365-387. Flower, L., & Hayes, R. J. (1984). Images, plans, and prose: The representation of meaning in writing. *Written Communication*, 1 (1), 120-160. Gere, A. R. (1987). Writing groups: history, theory, and implications. Carbondale, IL: Southern Illinois University Press. Grabe, W., & Kaplan, R. B. (1996). *An Applied Linguistic Perspective. Theory and Practice of Writing*. New York: Longman. Graham, M., & Scarborough, H. (1996). Computer mediated communication and collaborative learning in an undergraduate distance education environment. *Australian Journal of Educational Technology*, 15 (1), 20-46. Harasim, L. (1990). Online education: An environment for collaboration and intellectual amplification. In Harasim, L. (Ed.), *Online Education: Perspectives on a New Environment*. Praeger, New York. Hayes, C. (1981). Exploring apprehension: composing processes of apprehensive and non-apprehensive intermediate freshman writers. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Conference on College Compositions and Communication, Dallas, Texas. Hedgcock, J., & Lefkowitz, N. (1992). Collaborative oral / aural revision in foreign language writing instruction. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 1, 255-276. Hillebrand, R. P. (1994). Control and cohesion: collaborative learning and writing. *English Journal*, 3, 7-12. Hirvela, A. (1999). Collaborative writing instruction and communities of readers and writers. *TESOL Journal*, 3, 7-12. Huang, S. (1994). Learning to critique and revise in an English-as-a-foreign-language university writing class. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 55(10), 3120-A. Hudelson, S. (1988). Writing in a second language. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 9, 210-222. Hughey, Wormuth, Heartfiel, &

Jacobs. (1983). *Teaching ESL Composition: Principles and Techniques*. Rowley, Mass: Newbury House.

Husang, H. H. (2004). *A Study of Senior High Students' Responses to Peer and Teacher Feedback on EFL Composition*. Master's Thesis. Department of English. National Taiwan Normal University.

James, M. O. (1993). *L2 writing fluency: A pilot study*. (Eric document Reproduction Service No. 335874).

Kann, C. L. (2001). *The effects of gender on Internet-assisted English writing instruction for senior high school students*. Master's thesis. National Kaohsiung Normal University.

Keller, J. M. (1983). *Motivational design of instruction*. In Reigeluth, C. M. (Ed.), *Instructional design theories and models*. New Jersey: Erlbaum.

Kolin, P.C. (2001). *Successful Writing at Work*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Kroll, B. (1990). *Second language writing*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Lannon, J. M. (1989). *The writing process* (3rd ed.). Glenview, IL: Scott, Foresman and Company.

Laurillard, D. (1993). *A framework for the effective use of educational technology: Rethinking university teaching*. Routledge, London.

Lee, S. Y. (1998). *Writing apprehension: Why some people don't perform their competence*. The Proceeding of the Seven International Symposium on English Teaching. Taipei.

Leki, I. (1990a). *Coaching from the margins: Issues in written response*. In Kroll, B. (Ed.). *Second Language Writing: Research Insights for the Classroom*, 155-177. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Leki, I. (1990b). *Potential problems with peer responding in ESL writing classes*. *CATESOL Journal*, 3, 5-19.

Lin-Martin, M. (1997). *Hesitancy working with a peer: Comparison of two studies, 1995 and 1996*. Paper presented at TESOL Convention, Orlando, FL.

Liu, J., & Hansen, J. (2002). *Peer response in second language writing classrooms*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press.

Long, M. H., & Porter, P. (1985). *Group work, interlanguage talk, and second language acquisition*. *TESOL Quarterly*, 19, 207-228.

Mangelsdorf, K. (1989). *Parells between speaking and writing in second language acquisition*. In Johnson, D. M. & Roen, D. H. (Eds.). *Richness in writing: Empowering ESL students*. New York: Longman.

Mangelsdorf, K. (1992). *Peer reviews in the ESL composition classroom: What do the students think?* *ELT Journal*, 46, 274-284.

McGuire, J., & Priestley, P. (1981). *A social skills curriculum: Life after school*. Pergamon, Oxford.

Mcleod, S. (1987). *Some thoughts about feelings: The affective domain and the writing process*. *College Composition and Communication*, 38 (4), 426-435.

Mendonca, C. O., & Johnson, K. E. (1994). *Peer review negotiations: Revision activities in ESL writing instruction*. *TESOL Quarterly*, 28, 745-769.

Mittan, R. (1989). *The peer review process: Harnessing students' communicative power*. In Johnson, D. M., & Roen, D. H. (Eds.). *Richness in writing: Empowering ESL students*. New York: Longman.

Moore, L. (1986). *Teaching students how to evaluate writing*. *TESOL Newsletter*, 20 (5), 23-24.

Morgan et. al. (1987). *Collaborative writing in the classroom*. *Bulletin of the Association for Business Communication*, 50 (3), 20-26.

Murray, D. E. (1992). *Collaborative writing as literacy event: Implications for writing instruction*. In D. Nunan (Ed.), *Collaborative language learning and teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Murphy, S. (1994). *Portfolios and curriculum reform: Patterns in practice*. *Assessing Writing*, 1, 175-206.

Nelson, G., & Murphy, J. (1992). *An L2 writing group: Task and social dimensions*. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 1, 171-193.

Nelson, G., & Murphy, J. (1993). *Peer response groups: Do L2 writers use peer comments in revising their drafts?* *TESOL Quarterly*, 27, 135-142.

Nunan, D. (Ed.). (1992). *Collaborative Language Learning and Teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge.

Nunan, D. (2000). *Developing writing skills*. *Language Teaching Methodology*. Prentice Hall International.

O'Donneld, A. M., Dansereau, D.F., Rocklin, T. R., Lambiotte, J. G., Hythecker, V. I., & Larson, C. O. (1985). *Cooperative Communication*, 2, 307-315.

Paulus, T. M. (1999). *The effect of peer and teacher feedback on student writing*. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 8, 265-289.

Reid, J. M. (1993). *Teaching ESL writing*. Prentice Hall Regents.

Raimes, A. (1983). *Techniques in teaching writing*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Rollinson, P. (1998). *Peer response and revision in ESL writing group: A case study*. Published PhD Dissertation. Universidad Autonoma de Madrid.

Selge, C. L. (1984). *The predrafting processes of four high- and four low-apprehensive writers*. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 18, 45-64.

Shuman, R. B. (1992). *Collaborative writing*. *Educational Leadership*, 49, 82.

Stanley, J. (1992). *Coaching student writers to be effective peer evaluators*. *Journal of Second Language Writing*.

Su, H. C. (1996). *A protocol analysis of the process of Chinese college students' writing in English* Thompson, M. O. (1983). *The returning student: Writing anxiety and general anxiety*. *TETYC*, 10 (1), 35-39.

Tso, W. W. (2002). *The Effectiveness of Peer Evaluation on EFL Writing*. Master's Thesis. Department of English. National Kaohsiung Normal University.

Tung, C. T. (1995). *Can dialogue journal writing help ESL students develop writing skills?* Master's Thesis, Arizon State University, Arizon.

Vallerand, R. J. (1997). *Toward a hierarchical model of intrinsic and extrinsic motivation*. *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology*, 29, 271-360.

Victori, M. (1999). *An analysis of writing knowledge in EFL composing: A case study of two effective and two less effective writers*. *System*, 27, 537-555.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in Society: The development of higher psychological processes*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Wang, S. C. (2003). *A Study of EFL Junior High Students' Perceptions on Collaborative Writing*. Master's Thesis. Department of English. National Chung Cheng University.

White, R., & Arndt, V. (1991). *Process writing*. Harlow: Longman.

Williamm, G., & Robert, B. K. (1996). *Theory and practice of writing*. New York: Longman.

Witbeck, M.C. (1976). *Peer correction procedures for intermediate and advanced ESL composition lessons*. *TESOL Quarterly*, 10, 321-326.

Zamel, V. (1982). *Writing: The process of discovering meaning*. *TESOL Quarterly*, 16, 195-209.

Zamel, V. (1983). *The composing process of advanced ESL students: Six case studies*. *TESOL Quarterly*, 17, 165-187.

Zhang, S. (1995). *Reexamining the affective advantage of peer feedback in the ESL writing class*. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 4, 209-222.