

Research of Process Structure and Process Recovery in Service Failures: Qualitative Study in Retailing Service Industry

吳宥蓁、張景旭

E-mail: 9511410@mail.dyu.edu.tw

ABSTRACT

Except many constructive elemental benefits of the enterprise itself, the services provided by the enterprise is becoming the most important factor for the success of the enterprise in the future. How to reduce the deficiency of service to customer and how to compensate and rectify such deficiency or failure is also becoming the most important lesson of the people who are going to participate the service affairs. From the evaluation method of service presented by Bitner(1990),the Critical Incidents Technique(CIT) is still the main method of the scholar studies. The multiplicity of the society is changing with time ,and it also affect the thoughts of the people that make the service mode more complicated and change very quickly especially in the field of retail business. Study about deficiency or failure of service cannot only make focus on the side of service provider, the correlation of the provider aspect and the customer portion is getting more important .The Critical Incidents Technique(CIT) can explain the “ cause and effect relation ” systematically, but it just explain the result at all. It cannot present the interactive process of the customer side and the service part. It also cannot review the real facts happened. My research is based on the methods of Critical Incidents Technique Bitner(1994) and Subjective Sequential Incidents Technique Chin-Hsu Chang(2006) to focus on the quality study and explorative study. There are five types of differentiation related to the cause of deficiency of the service in my study(as following). 1. The press production type during sale promotion. 2. The controversy type. 3. The misunderstanding type caused by division of labour. 4. The accidental type caused by ill monitoring. 5. The type which is against the service ethics.

Keywords : Service encounters, Service failures, Service recovery, Critical Incidents Technique

Table of Contents

封面內頁 簽名頁 授權書.....	iii	中文摘要.....	iv	英文摘要.....	v
誌謝.....	vii	目錄.....	ix	圖目錄.....	xi
表目錄.....	xii	第一章 緒論 第一節 研究背景.....	1	第二節 研究動機.....	3
第三節 研究目的.....	5	第二章 文獻探討 第一節 服務接觸.....	6	第二節 服務疏失.....	9
第三節 服務補救.....	13	第四節 關鍵事件技術法.....	19	第五節 主觀順序事件技術分析法.....	22
第三章 研究方法 第一節 研究工具.....	25	第二節 研究流程.....	29	第三節 研究設計.....	32
第四節 資料整理與分析.....	34	第四章 關鍵事件技術分析與檢討 第一節 文字量分析.....	37	第二節 服務疏失訊息量分析.....	38
第三節 研究困擾分析.....	39	第四節 因應對策分析.....	40	第五節 建議.....	41
第五章 歷程結構分析 第一節 促銷壓力模式.....	43	第二節 爭議模式.....	47	第三節 分工造成誤會模式.....	53
第四節 意外事件管理不當模式.....	57	第五節 違反服務倫理模式.....	60	第六章 結論.....	64
參考文獻.....	65	圖目錄 圖2.1服務藍圖 8 圖2.2劇場理論組成元素 9 圖2.3服務品質模式 17 圖2.4服務補救的架構 18 圖3.1研究流程圖 31 圖5.1促銷壓力的歷程補救模型 47 圖5.2爭議的歷程補救模型 53 圖5.3分工造成誤會的歷程補救模型 57 圖5.4意料外事件的歷程補救模型 60 圖5.5違反服務倫理的歷程補救模型 63 表目錄 表1.1台灣產業結構及就業結構 2 表1.2 85-94年零售服務業營業額變動概況標題 3 表2.1國外內學者服務疏失相關文獻彙總 10 表2.2 Bitner服務失誤之分類 12 表2.3國外學者服務補救相關文獻彙總 14 表3.1關鍵事件技術法研究配對個案分析表 32 表3.2主觀順序事件技術研究情節分析表 32 表3.3受訪者基本資料 34 表3.4 B評判員配對表 35 表4.1關鍵事件法問卷及訪談文字量比較表 37 表4.2關鍵事件法訊息量分析表 38 表4.3關鍵事件法研究困擾比較表 40 表4.4研究困擾解決對策分析表 41 表5.1促銷壓力模式分析表 45 表5.2爭議模式分析表 49 表5.3分工造成誤會模式分析表 54 表5.4意外事件管理不當模式分析表 58 表5.5違反服務倫理模式分析表 61			

REFERENCES

一、中文文獻 1.行政院主計處 (2005)。國民經濟動向統計季報之產業，重要經 指標速報結構資料。 <http://www.dgbas.gov.tw>。 2.資料來源:經濟部統計處 (2005)。經濟統計資訊。 <https://2k3dmz2.moea.gov.tw>。 3.吳芝儀、廖梅花合譯 (2004)。Anselm Strausss. Juliet

Corbin 著。紮根理論研究方法。台北:濤石。4.吳兆玲(1997)。國內航空服務業服務疏失補救、疏失事件歸因與顧客滿意反應間關係之研究。國立中山大學企業管理研究所碩士論文。5.黃淑儀編輯(2002)。中華民國經濟年鑑。台北市:聯經。經濟部統計處(2005)。經濟統計資訊。6.齊力、林本炫編(2005)。質性研究方法與資料分析。台北:南華教研所。7.鄭紹成(1997)。服務業服務失誤、挽回服務與顧客反應之研究。中國文化大學國際企業管理研究所博士論文。8.潘淑滿著(2005)。質性研究。台北:心理。蔡敏玲:余曉雯譯。D.J.Clandinin、F.M. Connelly 著。9.蔡敦浩(1985)。策略決策過程之研究。國立政治大學企業管理研究所政治大學企業管理研究所博士論文。10.張景旭(2006,6月)。服務經濟轉型下的「重要事件技術」爭議與對策:「主觀順序事件技術」之提出。第三屆關係管理研討會:新世紀公共關係理論與應用;頁65-88,大葉大學,彰化。11.韓維中(2001)。服務缺失、顧客歸因與補救回復之滿意度模式。台灣大學商學研究所碩士論文。

二、英文文獻

- 1.Andreassen,T.W (2001) From Disgust to Delight Do Customers Hold a Grudge? *Journal of Service Research* , 4(1), 39-49.
- 2.Bitner , M.J,Booms,B H and Tetreault , M.S , “ The Service Encounter Diagnosing Favorable and Unfavorable Incidents , ” *Journal of Marketing*,Vol.54,1990,pp.71-84.
3. Bruner ,J (1991) The Narrative Construction of Reality. *Critical Inquiry* , 18 (1) , P1-21
- 4.Bitner,M.J., “ Servicescapes: The Impact of Physical Surroundings on Customers and Employees , ” *Journal of Marketing*,Vol.56,No.2,1992,pp.57-71.
- 5.Bitran,Gabriel and Lojo,Maureen,1993, “ A Framework for Analyzing the Quality of the Customer Interface ” , *European Management Journal*,11,pp.385-396,December.
- 6.Bitner,M.J.,Booms,B.H.and Mohr,L.A., “ Critical Service Encounters:The Employee ’ s Viewpoint , ” *Journal of Marketing*,Vol.58,1994,pp.95-106.
- 7.Bell,C.R.& Zemke,R.E.(1987).Service breakdown:The road to recovery. *Management Review*,76(10),32-35.
- 8.Bell,C.R.(1994).Turning disappointment into customer delight.Editor and Publish,127(32),48-38.
- 9.Czepiel,J.A.,Solomon,M.R.and Surprenant,C.F.,*The Service Encounter*:Institute of Retail Management,NY: Lexington Books,1985.
- 10.Colon,D.E.,& Murry,N.M.(1996).Customer perception of corporate responses to product complaints:The role of explanations.*Academy of Management Journal*,39(11), 1040-1056.
- 11.Christo,B.(1997).An experimental study of service recovery option.*International Journal of service industry management*, 8(14),110-130.
- 12.De Lisser,E. (1993), “ Today ’ s Specials Include Customer Satisfaction , ” *The Wall Street Journal*,June 7,B1.(Cited in Hoffman,K.D.,Kelley,S.W.and Rotalsky,H.M.,1995).
- 13.Denzin,Norman K./Lincoln,Yvonna S.(1994),*Handbook of qualitative research*, Sage Publications
- 14.De Coverly,Edd: Holme,Niclas O.; Keller,Amanda G.; Mattison Thompson,Frauke H.; Toyoki,Sammy (2002) , “ Service Recovery in the Airline Industry: Is it as Simple as ‘ Failed, Recovered, Satisfied ? ’ , ” *Marketing Review*, Vol.3, p.p.2137
- 15.Denzin,N.K.(1989).*Interpretive biography (Qualitative Research Methods*,17.Newbury Park,CA: Sage.
- 16.Flanagan,J.C., “ The Critical Incident Technique , ” *Psychological Bulletin*,Vol.51,pp.327-358 (July 1954).
- 17.Fornell ,C.,& Wernerfelt,B. (1987) .*Defensive marketing strategy by customer,management:A theoretical analysis*.*Journal of Marketing*,24(11),337-346.
- 18.Fisk,R.P.,S.W.Brown,and M.J.Bitner(1993),Tracking the Evolution of the Services Marketing Literature ” ,*Journal of Retailing*,69(Spring),pp.13-60.
- 19.Grove,S.J.and R.P.Fisk(1983), “ The Dramaturgy of Services Exchange: An Analytical Framework for Services Marketing , ” in L.L.Berry,and G.L.Shostack (eds.), *Emerging Perspectives on Services Marketing*,American Marketing Association,Chicago, IL.
- 20.Goffman,E.(1959),*The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*,New York:Doubleday and Co.
- 21.Gergen,K.J.(1985).The social constructionist movement in modern psychology.*American Psychology* ,40(3),266-275.
- 22.Gronroos,C.(1988).Service Quality:The Six Criteria Of Good Perceived Service Quality. *Review of Business*, 9, 10-13.
- 23.Greenberg,Jerald(1990), “ Organizational Justice: Yesterday, Today and Tomorrow , ” *Journal of Management*, 16(2),399-432.
- 24.Gronroos,C. (1990) “ Service Management and Marketing. Managing the Moments of Truth in Service Competition , ” Lexington,MA:Lexington Books,p.208.
- 25.Grove,S.J.,Fisk,R.P. & Bitner,M.J.(1992),*Dramatizing the Service Experience:A Managerial Approach*.*Advances in Services Marketing and anagement*,1,91-121.
- 26.Goodwin,C.& Ross I.(1992).Consumer Responses to Service Failures:Influence of Procedural and Interactional Fairness Perceptions. *Journal of Business Research*, 25(2), 149-163.
- 27.Grove,S.J.and Fisk,R.P.,*The Impact of Other Customers on Service Exchange: A Critical Incident Examination of ‘ Getting Along ’* , ” *Journal of Retailing*,Vol. 73,No. 1,1997,pp.63-85.
- 28.Heskett,J.L.,Sasser,W.E.,and Rotalsky H.M. (1989) , “ Service Breakthrough , ” New York:The Free Press.
- 29.Hart,C.W.L.,J.L. Heskett and W.E.Sasser Jr., “ The Profitable Art of Service Recovery , ” *Harvard Business Review*,1990,148-156.
- 30.Hamel,Jacques (1993),*Case study methods*,Sage Publications
- 31.Heskett,J.L.,Jones,T.O.,Loveman,G.W.,Sasser,W.E.,and Schlesinger,L.A.,*Putting the Service-profit Chain to Work . ” Harvard Business Review*,Vol.72,No.2,1994,pp. 164-174.
- 32.Hoffman,K.D.,S.W.Kelley and H. M. Rotalsky, “ Tracking Service Fairures and Employee Recovery Efforts , ” *Journal of Service Marketing*,Vol.9,No.2,1995,49-61.
- 33.Hoffman,K.D.and Bateson,J.E.G.,*Essentials of Service Marketing*,The Dryden Press,Orlando, FL.,1997.
- 34.Hays,J.M. and Hill, A.V. (1999) , “ The Market Share Impact of Service Failures , ” *Production and Operations Management*,Vol.8, No.3,p.p.208-220.
- 35.Johnston,T.C.& Hewa,M.A.(1997).Fixing service failures. *Industrial Marketing Management*,26(5),467-473.
- 36.Kingman-Brundage,J.,1989, “ The ABCs of Service System Blueprinting ” , *European Journal of Marketing*, 18(4), pp.36-44.
- 37.Kenney,M. J. (1995). Antecedents to customer expectations for service recovery. *Journal of Academy of Marketing Science*, 22(1),52-62.
- 38.Langeard,E.,Bateson,J.E.G.,Lovelock,C.H.and Eiglier, P., “ Service Marketing: New Insights from Consumer and Managers , ” Marketing Science Institute, 1981.
- 39.Labove,W.(1982) Speech action and reactions in personal narrative.In D.Tannen (Ed.).*Analyzing discourse: Text and talk*(PP219-241).Washington,DC:Georgetown
- 40.Lovell,C.H.,*Services Marketing*,3rd ed.,NJ: Prentice-Hall,1996.
- 41.Lieblich A.,Tuval-Mashiach R.,& Zilber T.(1998). *Narrative Research*.London:SAGE.
- 42.Miller,J.L.,Craighead,C.W.& Karwan,K.R.(2000).Service Recovery: A Framework and Empirical Investigation.*Journal of Operations Management*,18(4),387-400.
- 43.McCollough,M.A.,Berry L.L.,& Yadav,M.S.(2000).An empirical investigation of customer satisfaction after service failure and recovery. *Journal of Service Research*, 3.No.2,November,121-137
- 44.Meuter,M.L.,Ostrom,A.L.,Roundtree,R.I.and Bitner,M.J., “ Self-Service

Technologies: Understanding Customer Satisfaction with Technology-Based Service Encounters, " *Journal of Marketing*, Vol.64,2000,pp.50-64.

44. Maxham III, J. G. (2001). Service Recovery 's Influence on Consumer Satisfaction, Positive Word-of-mouth, and Purchase Intentions. *Journal of Business Research*, 54(1), 11-24.

45. Ostrom, Amy and Dawn Iacobucci (1995), " Consumer Trade-Offs and the Evaluation of Services " , *Journal of Marketing*, Vol.59, pp.17-28.

46. Oliver, R.L (1980), " A Cognitive Model of the Antecedents and Consequences of Satisfaction Decisions, " *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol.17(November),pp.460-469.

47. Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V.A. & Berry, L.L. (1985). A Conceptual Model of Service Quality and Its Implications for Future Research. *Journal of Marketing*, 49(4), 41-50.

48. Polkinghorne, D.E. (1988). Narrative knowing and the human sciences. Albany :State Univ. of New York Press.

49. Patton, M.Q., (1990) " Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods, " 2nd ed. Newbury Park: Sage

50. Power, C. , " Value Marketing: Quality, Service, Fair and Pricing are the Keys to Selling in the 90 ' s, " *Business Week*, 1991, 132-140.

51. Parasuraman, A., Berry, L.L. & Zeithaml, V.A. (1991). Understanding Customer Expectations of Service, " *Sloan Management Review*, 32(3), pp.39-48.

52. Polkinghorne, D.E. (1995). Narrative configuration in qualitative analysis. In J. A. Hatch & R. Wisniewski (Eds.) *Life history and narrative* (pp.5-23). London: The Falmer Press.

53. Richins, M.L. (1987). Loyalty-based Management. *Harvard Business Review*, 71(2), 64-73.

54. Richins, M.L. (1987). A multivariate analysis of responses to dissatisfaction. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 15(1), 24-31

55. Reichheld, F.F. and Sasser, W.E. (1990) , Zero Defection: Quality Comes to Services, " *Harvard Business Review*, Sep-Oct., p.p.301-307.

56. Shostack, G.L., " Designing Services That Deliver, " *Harvard Business Review*, Vol.62 (1), 1984, pp.134-135.

57. Solomon, M.R., Surprenant, C.F., Czepiel, J.A. and Gutman, E. G., " A Role Theory Perspective on Dyadic Interactions: The Service Encounter, " *Journal of Marketing*, Vol.51, 1985, pp. 86-96.

58. Surprenant, C.F. & Solomon, M.R. (1987). Predictability and Personalization in the Service Encounter. *Journal of Marketing*, 51, 86-96.

59. Schlesinger, L.A., & Heskett, J.L. (1991). The service- driven service company. *Harvard Business Review*, 2(1), 71-81.

60. Schlesinger, L.A., & Heskett, J.L. (1991). " Breaking the Cycle of Failure in Services, " *Sloan Management Review*, 17-28.

61. Schweikhart, S.B., Strasser, S., & Kennedy, M.R. (1993). Service recovery in healthy service organization. *Hospital & Health Services Administration*, 38(1) 3-21.

62. Sandelowski, M.C. (1994) . Narrative Knowing in Nursing. *Journal of Holistic Nursing*, 12 (1) , 23-30

63. Spreng, R.A., Harrell, G.D., & Mackoy, R.D. (1995). Service recovery: Impact on satisfaction and intentions. *Journal of Service Marketing*, 9(1), 15-23.

64. Smith, A.K., Bolton, R.N. & Wagner, J. (1999). A Model of Customer Satisfaction with Service Encounters Involving Failure and Recovery. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 36(3), 356-372.

65. Tax S.S., & Brown, S.W. (1988). Recovering and learning from service failure. *Sloan Management Review*, 3(11), 75-88.

66. Westbrook, R.A., and Oliver, R.L., " The Dimensionality of Consumer Emotion Patterns and Consumer Satisfaction, " *Journal of Consumer Research*, Vol.18, No.6, 1981, pp.84-91.

67. Webster, C. & Sundaram, D.S. (1998). Service Consumption Criticality in Failure Recovery. *Journal of Business Research*, 41(2), 153-159.

68. Yin, Robert K. (1989), *Case study research : design and methods*, Sage Publications

Zeithaml, Valarie A., A. Parasuraman and Arvind Malhotra, 2002, " Service Quality Delivery Through Web Site: A Critical Review of Extant Knowledge, " *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 30(4), pp.362-375.

69. Zikmund, William G. (1994), *Business research methods*, Dryden Press.