

Loyalty-an example of Business users of Chunghwa Telecom Co.,Ltd

陳麗華、陳建文

E-mail: 9422439@mail.dyu.edu.tw

ABSTRACT

The Customers demand more and more the communication quality and service level since the government liberalized telecommunications in recent year. The documents demonstrated that the enterprises has increased the keeping rate of customers up to 5% , which may create a profit from 25% to 85%. (Reichheld et al 1990). The telecommunications enterprises provide the various promotion program with a view to getting the profits. Besides, they take the relationship marketing method to offer service for customers. Especially, the significant operating income of every telecommunications enterprises is derived from the business users, therefore, the telecommunications enterprises send the special group to serve one by one at the business location. They expect that it will increase business users ' satisfaction and confidence in the telecommunications enterprises, and then further the maintenance of relationship each other forever in order that the business user might become a loyal customer. In this study, the business users of Chunghwa Telecom Co., Ltd. are an object of study. This study is to probe into the relationship profit concerning to the relationship quality and customers ' royalty by means of the way of questionnaire. The findings of this study showed that the relationship among them will become a direct proportion of influence, such as confidence profit and social profit to trust or satisfaction, or social profit and special treatment profit to trust or satisfaction, and trust and satisfaction to the royalty of customers, except that the confidence profit has no a clearer effect on the satisfaction and special treatment profit. As a result, the social -vbenefit has a greatest effect upon the customer royalty, consequently, the telecommunications enterprises should enhance the interaction relationship between special group and business users, and provide a convenient service to obtain the corresponding personnels confidence and reliability in order to establish a friendship of each other. It will firm the business users ' royalty to the telecommunications enterprises by this manner. The purpose of this study is to offer an establishment of a long-term relationship between telecommunications enterprises and business users, and then obtain the royal customers.

Keywords : Relationship Benefits, Relationship Quality, Loyalty

Table of Contents

第一章 緒論.....	1	1.1 研究動機與背景.....	1	1.2 研究目的.....	3	1.3 研究範圍與限制.....	3	1.4 研究流程.....	4																								
第二章 文獻探討.....	6	2.1 關係行銷相關文獻.....	6	2.1.1 關係行銷定義.....	6	2.1.2 關係行銷發展過程.....	9	2.1.3 關係行銷層級.....	11	2.1.4 關係行銷結合方式.....	13	2.2. 關係利益.....	16	2.2.1 信心利益.....	21	2.2.2 社交利益.....	24	2.2.3 特別待遇利益.....	26	2.3 關係品質定義.....	29	2.3.1 關係品質模式.....	30	2.3.2 關係品質之衡量構面.....	32	2.3.3 信任的定義與衡量構面.....	35	2.4 顧客忠誠度.....	38	2.4.1 承諾的定義與衡量構面.....	38	2.4.2 忠誠度的定義與衡量構面.....	39
第三章 研究方法.....	44	3.1 統計與分析方法.....	44	3.1.1 敘述統計分析.....	44	3.1.2 因素分析.....	45	3.1.3 信度分析.....	45	3.1.4 路徑分析.....	46	3.2 研究對象的界定.....	47	3.3 研究模型.....	47	3.4 研究假說.....	48	3.5 問卷設計.....	53														
第四章 研究結果分析.....	55	4.1 樣本資料分析.....	55	4.2 因素分析與信度分析.....	57	4.2.1 關係利益因素分析結果.....	59	4.2.2 滿意因素分析結果.....	61	4.2.3 信任的分析結果.....	61	4.2.4 顧客忠誠度分析結果.....	62	4.3 研究模型之路徑分析.....	62	4.4 研究假說結果彙整.....	67																
第五章 結論與建議.....	70	5.1 研究結論.....	70	5.2 未來研究建議.....	73																												
參考文獻.....	74	附錄 問卷.....	87																														

REFERENCES

1. 方世榮與黃美卿，（2001），銀行業關係價值-忠誠度模式之實證研究，輔仁管理評論第八卷第二期九月，頁46-70。
2. 方世榮譯，（1999），行銷學原理，東華書局。
3. 行政院，（2003），挑戰2008:國家發展重點計畫（2002-2007），行政院2003年1月6日修訂。
4. 佐藤知恭，蕭宏誠譯，（2002），顧客忠誠經營-超越CS的服務行銷管理，羿慧文化。
5. 吳明隆，(2000)，SPSS統計應用實務，松崗。
6. 吳雅琪，(2002)，影響網路書店消費者忠誠度形成因素之研究，政治大學國際貿易學系碩士論文。
7. 吳嘉慧，（2001），顧客關係利

益與忠誠度之探討—從資訊不對稱屬性分析，東吳大學企業管理學系碩士論文。 8. 呂佩庭，(2002)，服務e化對顧客關係利益影響之探討-以網路自助服務為例，元智大學企業管理學系碩士論文。 9. 周文賢，(2002)，多變量統計分析SAS/STAT使用方法，智勝。 10. 林佩蓉，(2003)，旅遊網站服務品質對顧客關係利益影響之研究，大葉大學工業關係學系碩士論文。 11. 林傑斌與劉明德，(2002)，SPSS11.0與統計模式建構，文魁資訊股份有限公司。 12. 洪嘉蓉，(2004)，服務品質、滿意度與忠誠度關係之研究-以中華電信公司寬頻網路顧客為例，大葉大學資訊管理學系 碩士論文。 13. 陳康莊，(2003)，關係品質與忠誠度關係之研究-以中華電信公司寬頻網路顧客為例，國立交通大學經營管理研究所碩士論文。 14. 陳愉翔，(2003)，關係傾向對顧客關係維續之影響-以社區寬頻網路用戶為例，逢甲大學企業管理系碩士論文。 15. 彭志宏，(2002)，關係品質對廠商忠誠度之影響 - 系統整合廠商為例，國立東華大學國際企業研究所碩士論文。 16. 劉世禮，(2003)，關係利益與關係品質對關係結果的影響 個人屬性的干擾效果，東海大學企業管理研究所碩士論文。 17. 簡競宇，(2003)，人際型服務接觸與科技型服務接觸對關係利益之影響，國立中興大學企業管理學系研究所碩士論文。 18. Andaleeb, S. S., (1996) " An Experimental Investigation of Satisfaction and Commitment in Marketing Channels: the Role of Trust and Dependence, " *Journal of Retailing*, Vol.72, No.1, p.77-93. 19. Anderson, E.W. and Weitz, B., (1992) " The Use of Pledges to Build and Sustain Commitment in Distribution Channels, " *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol. 29, p.28-34,. 20. Anderson, Eugene W. and Fornell, Claes (1994), " A Customer Satisfaction Research Prospectus, " in *Service Quality: New Directions in Theory and Practice*, R. T. Rust and R. L. Oliver, eds. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, p.241-68. 21. Anderson, J. C., and Narus J. A., (1990). " A Model of distributor Firm and Manufacturer Firm Working Partnerships? " , *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 54, p.42-58. 22. Armstrong, G. and Kotler, P., (2000), *Marketing: An Introduction*, 5th ed., New Jersey: Prentice Hall. 23. Bagozzi, R. P., (1995) " Reflections on relationship marketing in consumer markets, " *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol.23, No.4, p.272-277. 24. Barber, B., (1983) " The Logic and Limits of Trust " , New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press. 25. Barnes, James G. (1994), " The Issue of Establishing Relationships with Customers in Service Companies: When Are Relationships Feasible and What Form Should They Take? " paper presented at the Third Annual " Frontiers in Services " Conference, Owen Graduate School of Management, Vanderbilt University, Nashville, Tennessee, October p.6-8. 26. Bearden, W. O. and Teel J. E., (1983) " Selected Determinants of Consumer Satisfaction and Complaints Report, " *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol.20, p.21-28,. 27. Bearden, W.O., M.K. Malhotra and Usategui K. H., (1998), " Customer contact and the evaluation of service experience: propositions and implications for the design of services, " *Psychology and Marketing*, Vol. 15, No. 8, p.793-809. 28. Becker, Howard S., (1960) " Notes on the Concept of -76- Commitment, " *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 6, p.32-40. 29. Berry L.L., and Parasuraman A., (1991). *Marketing services: competing through quality*. New York: The Free Press. 30. Berry, Leonard L. (1983), " Relationship Marketing, " in *Emerging Perspectives on Services Marketing*, L. Berry, G. L. Shostack, and G. D. Upah, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association, p.25-28. 31. Berry, Leonard L. (1995), " Relationship Marketing of Services-Growing Interest, Emerging Perspectives " , *Journal of Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol.23, No.4, p. 236-245. 32. Bhote, Keki R., (1996) " Beyond Customer Satisfaction to Customer Loyalty- The Key To Great Profitability " , *American Management Association*, New York , p.31. 33. Bitner, Mary Jo., (1995), " Building Service Relationships: It ' s All About Promises, " *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol.23 , p.246-251. 34. Cardozo, R. M., (1965) " An experimental study of consumer effort, expectation and satisfaction, " *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol.2, No.3, p.244-249,. 35. Christy R., Oliver, G., and Penn, J., (1996) " Relationship Marketing in Consumer Markets, " *Journal of Marketing Management*, Vol.12, p.161-173. 36. Clark, Moira and Adrian Payne (1994), " Achieving Long-Term Customer Loyalty: A Strategic Approach, " working paper, Centre for Services Management, Cranfield School of Management. 37. Copulsky, J. R. and Wolf, J., (1990), " Relationship marketing: Positioning for the future, " *The Journal of Business Strategy*, Vol.11, No.4, p.16-20,. 38. Cronbach, L.J., (1951) " Coefficient alpha and the internal structure of tests " , *Psychometrika*, Vol. 16, p.297-334. 39. Crosby, L. A., Evans, K. R. and Cowles, D., (1990). *Relationship Quality in Services Selling: An Interpersonal Influence Perspective*. *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 54, p.68-81. 40. David, G., (2002) " Nurturing Clinets ' Trust to Encourage Engagement Success During the Customization of ERP Systems " , *Omega*, Vol. 30, No.4, p.287-299. 41. Dick A.S. and Basu K., (1994), ' Customer loyalty: towards an integrated framework ' , quoted in Engler, J., Blackwell, R. and Miniard, T., 1995, *Consumer Behavior* 8th edition, The Dryden Press: Fort Worth, p.57. 42. Doney, P.M., and Cannon, J.P., (1997) " In examination of the nature of trust in buyer-seller relationships, " *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 61, p.35-51,. 43. Donnelly, J. H., L. L. Berry and Thompson T. W., (1985) *Marketing Financial services - A Strategic Vision*, Homewood, IL: Dow Jones-Irwin, p.113,. 44. Dutka, A., (1994) *AMA handbook for customer satisfaction: a complete guide to research, planning and implementation*, NTC business books, p.37. 45. Dwyer F. Robert, Paul H. Schurr, and Sejo O. (1987), " Developing Buyer-Seller Relationships " , *Journal of Marketing*, Vol.51, p.11-27. 46. Evans, J. R. and Laskin R. L., (1994) " The Relationship marketing process: a conceptualization and application, " *Industrial Marketing Management*, Vol.23, No.12, p.439-452. 47. Fletcher, J. O., Simpson J. A., and Thomas, G., (2000) " The measurement of perceived relationship quality components: A confirmatory factor analytic approach, " *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, Vol. 26, No. 3, p.340-354. 48. Fornell, Claes, (1992) " A National Customer Satisfaction Barometer: The Swedish Experience, " *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 56, p.6-21,. 49. Griffin, J., (1995) " Customer Loyalty " *How to Earn It, How to Keep It*. New York, NY: Lexington Books. 50. Gronholdt, L., Martensen, A. and Kristensen, K., (2000) " The relationship between customer satisfaction and loyalty: Cross-industry differences " , *Total Quality Management*, Vol. 11, p.509-516,. 51. Gronroos, C., (1990) " Relationship Approach to Marketing in Service Context: The Marketing and Organizational Behavior Interface, " *Journal of Business Research*, Vol.20, No.1, p.3-12. -79- 52. Gummesson, E., (1998), " Implementation requires a relationship marketing paradigm, " *Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol.26, No.3, p.242-249. 53. Gummesson,(1987) " The New Marketing: Developing Long-Term Interactive Relationships, " *Long Range Planning*, Vol.20,No.4, p.10-20, 1987. 54. Gwinner, K.P., Gremler, D.D., and Bitner, M.J., (1998), " Relational

benefits in services industries: the customer's perspective," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 26, No. 2, p. 101 – 114. 55.

Hardy, K.G., and Magrath A.J., (1989), "Dealing with Cheating in Distribution," *European Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 23, No. 2, p. 123-129.

56. Hennig-Thurau, T. and Klee A., (1997), "The Impact of Customer Satisfaction and Relationship Quality on Customer Retention: A Critical Reassessment and Model Development," *Psychology & Marketing*, Vol.14, No.8, p.764-797. 57. Hennig-Thurau, Thorsten, Kevin P. Gwinner, and Dwayne D. G., (2002), "Understanding Relationship Marketing Outcomes: An Integration of Relational Benefits and Relationship Quality," *Journal of Service Research*, Vol.4, No.3, p.230-247. 58. Heskett, J. L., Sasser, W. E., and Hart, C. W. (1989), *Service Breakthrough*. New York: The Free Press. 59. Heskett, James L. and Thomas O. Jones, Gary W. Lovemen, W. Earl Sasser and Schlesinger L. A., (1994), "Putting the Service Profit Chain to Work," *Harvard Business Review*, p.164-174. 60. Hunt, H. K., (1977), "CS/D-Overview and Future Research Direction: The Conceptualization and Measurement of Consumer Satisfaction and Dissatisfaction, Cambridge," *Marketing Science Institute*, p.455-489, 61. Jackson, B. B., (1985) *Winning and Keeping Industrial Customers: The Dynamic of Customer Relationship*, Lexington, MA: Lexington Books., 62. Jones, T. O. and Sasser, W. E., (1995) "Why Satisfied Customers Defect," *Harvard Business Review*, Vol. 73, No.6, p.88-99. 63. Juttner, U. and Wehrli, H. P. (1994), "Relationship Marketing from a Value System Perspective," *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, Vol.5, No5, p.54-73. 64. Kotler P., (1991), *Marketing Management: Analysis, Planning, Implementation, and Control*, 7th ed., Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice Hall Inc., 65. Kotler P., (1994), *Marketing Management – Analysis, Planning, Implementation and Control*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall 66. Kotler P., (2000), *Marketing Management*, Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice Hall, 67. Landry, L., (1998) "Relationship Marketing: Hype or Here to Stay," *Marketing News*, Vol.32, No.14, p.4. 68. Lee, M., and Lawrence F. C. (2001), "A cost/benefit approach to understanding service loyalty," *Journal of services Marketing*, Vol. 15, No. 2, p.113-130. 69. Levins, I., (1998), "One-on-one relationship marketing comes of age," *Medical Marketing and Media*, Vol.33, No.6, p.44-52, 70. Levitt, T., (1983), "After the Sale is Over," *Harvard Business Review*, Vol.61, p.87-93. 71. Levitt, T.,(1986) "Marketing Myopia," *Harvard Business Review*, Vol.38, p.45-56. 72. Macneil, L. R., (1980), *The New Social Contract:An Inquiry Into Modern Contractual Relations*, New Haven, CT: Yale University Press. 73. McCallum, Richard J. and Harrison, W. (1985), "Interdependence in the Service Encounter." In *The Service Encounter: Managing Employee/Customer Interaction in Services Business*. Eds. John A. Czepiel, Michael R. Solomon, and Carol F. Surprenant. Lexington, MA: Lexington Books, p.35-48. 74. Mohr, J. and Spekman, P., (1994), "Characteristics of Partnership Success: Partnership attributes, communication behavior, and conflict resolution techniques," *Strategic Management Journal*, Vol. 15, No. 2, p.135-152, 75. Moorman, C., R. Deshpande and G. Zaltman, (1993) "Factors Affecting Trust in Market Research Relationships," *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 57, p.81-101. 76. Moorman, C., R. Deshpande, and G. Zaltman (1993), "Factors Affecting Trust in Market Relationships," *Journal of Marketing*, Vol.57, No.1, p.81-101. 77. Morgan, R. M. and Hunt S. D., (1994) "The commitment-trust theory of relationship marketing," *Journal of Marketing*, Vol.58. No.3, p.20-38., 78. Morgan, Robert M., Tammy N. Crutchfield, and Russell Lacey (2000), "Patronage and Loyalty Strategies: Understanding the Behavioral and Attitudinal Outcomes of Customer Retention Programs," in *Relationship Marketing: Gaining Competitive Advantage through Customer Satisfaction and Customer Retention*, Thorsten Hennig-Thurau and Ursula Hansen, eds. Berlin, Germany: Springer, p.71-87. 79. Oliver, R. L., (1981), "Measurement and evaluation of satisfaction processes in retailing setting," *Journal of Retailing*, Vol.57, No.3, p.25-48. 80. Parasuraman, A., Zeithmal, V.A., and Berry, L.L., (1996) *The Behavior Consequences of Service Quality*, *Journal of marketing*, Vol. 60, p.31-46. 81. Perrien, J. and L. Richard, (1995) "The Meaning of a Marketing Relationship: A Pilot Study," *Industrial Marketing Management*, 24, p.37-43, 82. Peterson, Robert A. (1995), "Relationship Marketing and the Consumer," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 23, p.278-281. 83. Price, Linda L., Eric J. Arnould, and Hausman, A., (1996), "Commercial Friendships: Service Provider-Client Relationship Dynamics." Presented at the *Frontiers in Services Conference*, Vanderbilt University, Nashville, TN. 84. Prus, Amanda and Brandt Randall D., (1995), "Understanding Your Customers," *Marketing Tools*, p.10-14. 85. Raphel, N. and Raphel, M. (1995), "Loyalty Ladder," Harper Collins Publishers Inc. 86. Rapp, S. and T. Collins, (1990), *The Great Marketing Trunaround*, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 87. Ravald, A. and Gronroos, C. (1996), "The value concept and relationship marketing," *European Journal of Marketing*, 30, p.19 – 30. 88. Reichheld, F. F., and Sasser, W. E. (1990), "Zero defections: Quality comes to service," *Harvard Business Review*, Vol. 68, No. 5, p.105-111. 89. Selnes, F., (1993), "An Examination of the Effect of Product Performance on Brand Reputation Satisfaction and Loyalty" *European Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 27, p.19-35. 90. Shani D. and Chalasani S., (1992), "Exploiting Niches Using Relationship Marketing," *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, No.9, p.33-42. 91. Sheth, Jadish N. and Atul Parvatiyar., (1995), "Relationship Marketing in Customer Markets: Antecedents and Consequences," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol.23, No.4, p.255-271 92. Smith, J.B., (1998), "Buyer-Seller Relationships: Similarity, Relationship Management, and Quality," *Psychology and Marketing*, Vol. 15, No.1, p.3-21, 93. Stone, M., N. Woodcock, and M. Wilson, (1996) "Managing the change from marketing planning to customer relationship management," *Long Range Planning*, Vol.29, No.5, p.675-683. 94. Tae, D. K. and P. C. Wilton (1988), "Models of consumer satisfaction formation: an extension," *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol.25, p.204-212. 95. Thorsten H. T. and M. F. Langer, (2001), "Modeling and managing student loyalty: An approach based on the concept of relationship quality," *Journal of Service Research*, Vol.3, No.4, p.331-344, 96. Ulrich, D. and J. B. Barney, (1984), "Perspectives in Organization: Resource Dependence, Efficiency, and Population," *Academy of mgt Review*, Vol. 9, p.3. 97. Westbrook, R.A. (1980), "Intrapersonal affective influences on consumer satisfaction with products," *Journal of Consumer Research*, Vol.7, p.49-54. 98. Wulf, Kristof De., Odekerken-Schroder, Gaby, and Lacobucci, Dawn, "Investments in consumer relationships: A cross-country and cross-industry exploration," *Journal of Marketing*, Chicago: Oct 2001. Vol. 65, No.4, p.33-50. 99. Zeithaml, V. A. and Bitner, M. J. (2000) *Service Marketing: Integrating*

Customer Focus Across the Firm, 2nd, New York: McGraw-Hill. 黃鵬飛 譯(2002), 「服務行銷」,台北,華泰文化事業公司,3月初版。
100.Zeithaml, V.A., L.L. Berry and A. Parasuraman (1988), "Communication and control processes in the delivery of service quality," Journal of Marketing, Vol. 52, No.2, p.35-48. 101.Zeithaml, Valerie A. and Mary Bitner J. (1996), Services Marketing. New York: McGraw-Hill. 102.交通部電信總局網站。 <http://www.dgt.gov.tw/chinese/Public-cares/>