

# Military Department 's Practice of Chief 's Managerial Ability 360 Degree Feedback Assessment – An Investigation into F

鍾永祥、賴文魁

E-mail: 9417975@mail.dyu.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

The Chief 's managerial ability system is an analytical tool for recognizing if the targeted personnel possess key managerial abilities & understand ones advantages & disadvantages over others, therefore to undertake required trainings to upgrade their competitiveness. The tool is normally carried out by using 360 degree feedback assessment, using multiple feedback method, to make analogy result more objective & all-rounded. Despite the acquired related feedback for the person being analyzed on using the 360 degree feedback assessment, the feedback is from a diversify source, therefore often resulting in speculations coming from the person being analyzed. As a result, when promoting such tool, total control of the mindsets of the targets is critical, as its influences often decide the effectiveness it will bring to the unit. Therefore by discussing the mindsets of personnel being analyzed using the 360 feedback assessment tool is the essential priority for this particular project. This case study is based on one particular department of the military, discussing chiefs such as captain level or above, their attitudes toward the following topics pointed out within the assessment: ' census variables ', ' comprehensibility towards the assessment ', ' the consistency of the multiple feedback input ', ' the quality & fairness of the critics ', ' social ability '. The results show that ' comprehensibility towards the assessment ' and ' relationships with fellow colleagues ' within the ' social ability ' part is the main factor influencing the mindsets of the tested personnel. ' Differences in self assessment & other feedbacks ' within the ' The consistency of the multiple-feedback input ', and ' trustworthiness of superiors ' within the ' The quality & fairness of the critics ' also show positive influences on the mindsets of the tested. Aside from that, the conclusion for this particular case study also brings about the effects of such tool on a real managerial environment & suggests further discussion & recommendations.

Keywords : chiefs ' managerial abilities ; 360 degree feedback ; mindsets of the analyzed personnel ; diversified feedback

## Table of Contents

封面內頁	簽名頁	授權書 iii	授權書 iv	中文摘要 v	英文摘要 vi	致謝 viii	目錄 x	圖目錄 xiv	表目錄 xv	第一章 緒論 1	1.1 研究動機 1	1.1.2 研究目的 2	1.3 研究範圍 3	1.4 研究流程 3	第二章 文獻回顧 6	2.1 主管管理才能 6	2.1.1 才能定義 6	2.1.2 才能特色 8	2.1.3 管理才能定義 10	2.1.4 主管管理才能項目 15	2.2 360度回饋 17	2.2.1 360度回饋簡介 17	2.2.2 360度回饋定義 17	2.2.3 360度回饋功能 19	2.2.4 360度回饋特色 20	2.2.5 360度回饋優點 20	2.2.6 360度回饋實施流程、要點 25	2.3 管理才能評鑑受評者態度 27	2.4 國軍績效評估方式 36	2.4.1 國軍現行軍士官考績作業規定注意事項簡介 36	2.4.2 國軍現行考績制度考核評鑑表之作業方式 39	2.4.3 國軍考績績等及獎金標準之沿革 40	2.4.4 國軍現行考績作業待改善之處 42	第三章、研究方法 43	3.1 研究架構 43	3.2 變項操作定義 45	3.3 研究假設 47	3.4 研究工具 51	3.5 研究設計 56	3.6 資料分析方式 58	第四章 資料分析與研究結果 64	4.1 樣本統計變項描述 64	4.1.1 樣本回收 64	4.1.2 基本資料分析 66	4.2 問卷信度分析 68	4.2.1 管理才能評鑑量表信度分析 69	4.2.2 對評鑑者能力知覺量表 69	4.2.3 人際關係量表信度分析 70	4.2.4 態度問卷信度分析 71	4.3 研究變項敘述統計分析 71	4.3.1 受評者對管理才能評鑑之態度 71	4.3.2 影響管理才能評鑑受評者態度之因素 73	4.4 研究變項相關分析 74	4.4.1 管理才能評鑑態度相關分析 74	4.4.2 影響因素與管理才能評鑑態度相關分析 74	4.5 T檢定與單因子變異數分析 78	4.5.1 T檢定 78	4.5.2 單因子變異數分析 80	4.6 研究變項逐步迴歸分析 86	4.6.1 共線性檢定 86	4.6.2 態度構面逐步迴歸分析 87	第五章 結論與建議 95	5.1 研究結果 95	5.1.1 研究分析 95	5.1.2 研究結果驗證 99	5.2 理論與實務意涵 102	5.2.1 理論意涵 102	5.2.2 實務意涵 105	5.3 研究限制 109	5.4 研究建議 110	參考文獻 113	附錄一 第一階段主管管理才能評鑑制度問卷：自我評估 125	附錄二 第一階段主管管理才能評鑑制度問卷：他評 132	附錄三 第二階段管理才能評鑑態度問卷 138
------	-----	---------	--------	--------	---------	---------	------	---------	--------	----------	------------	--------------	------------	------------	------------	--------------	--------------	--------------	-----------------	-------------------	---------------	-------------------	-------------------	-------------------	-------------------	-------------------	------------------------	--------------------	-----------------	------------------------------	-----------------------------	-------------------------	------------------------	-------------	-------------	---------------	-------------	-------------	-------------	---------------	------------------	-----------------	---------------	-----------------	---------------	-----------------------	---------------------	---------------------	-------------------	-------------------	------------------------	---------------------------	-----------------	-----------------------	----------------------------	---------------------	--------------	-------------------	-------------------	----------------	---------------------	--------------	-------------	---------------	-----------------	-----------------	----------------	----------------	--------------	--------------	----------	-------------------------------	-----------------------------	------------------------

## REFERENCES

- 中文部份 1. 方平煌 (2003), 高階管理者的人格特質、領導風格對內控制度執行成效之影響研究, 國立成功大學高階管理碩士在職專班, 碩士論文。 2. 李盈慧 (2003), 模糊理論運用於中階管理人員管理才能評鑑之研究, 義守大學管理科學研究所, 碩士論文。 3. 杜拉克 (Drucker, P.F.) 著, 劉毓玲譯 (2000)。21世紀的管理挑戰。台北:天下遠見出版社。 4. 村上良三著, 陳文光譯(1988), 人事考核手冊 - 制度設計與運用, 台華工商圖書出版公司, 台北。 5. 林孟宗 (1976), 特殊教育師資專業能力分析研究, 國立臺灣師範大學教育研究所, 碩士論文。 6. 林玉玲 (2000), 回饋預期一致性、程序公平、組織支持、個人特質對360度回饋態度及行為改變意圖之影響,

國立政治大學心理研究所，碩士論文。 7. 林惠雯（2000），銀行業主管人員管理能力取得管道及其決定因素之分析，國立中央大學人力資源管理研究所，碩士論文。 8. 林惠霞（1996），台北市政府主管人員管理才能發展需求評估之研究-美國聯邦管理才能架構應用於我國之分析，國立中興大學公共行政及政策研究所，碩士論文。 9. 吳秉恩（1984），管理才能發展方案實施與成效關係之研究，國立政治大學企業管理研究所，博士論文。 10. 紀原欽（2001），人力資源專業人員對專業才能評鑑多源回饋之態度影響因素探討-以電子業為例，國立中央大學人力資源管理研究所，碩士論文。 11. 原凡茹（2002），影響管理才能評鑑受評者態度之因素探討-以團隊管理者為例，國立中央大學人力資源管理研究所，碩士論文。 12. 徐正輝（2003），管理才能心理測驗、360度回饋在多元迴歸與多重切點甄選策略上之比較分析研究-以軍中連級輔導長例，國立政治大學心理學研究所，碩士論文。 13. 徐坤裕（1999），多源績效評估影響之探討，元智大學管理研究所，碩士論文。 14. 袁國森（1997），績效評估中程序公平及分配公平認知對員工對工作績效評估態度之影響-以中華電信某公司為例，國立中央大學人力資源管理研究所，碩士論文。 15. 陳玉山（1997），能力基礎途徑應用在人力資源管理之研究，國立政治大學公共行政研究所，碩士論文。 16. 陳志鈺（2001），百貨業樓面管理人員職能量表之建立-以某百貨公司為例，國立中央大學人力資源管理研究所，碩士論文。 17. 陳明璋（2000），平衡計分卡在中小企業的應用，國立台北大學企業管理學系，碩士論文。 18. 商業周刊編輯群（2002），針對國內13家大型企業的負責人進行深度訪談，第767期，96~103。 19. 許獻祺（2000），資訊科技在國軍人事管理之應用-以考績資訊系統為例，國防管理學院國防資訊研究所，碩士論文。 20. 莊朝正（1998），管理才能評鑑量表之建立-以某高科技公司為例，國立中央大學人力資源管理研究所，碩士論文。 21. 張裕隆（1997），三百六十度回饋（一）。國魂，624期，73~75。 22. 張裕隆（1997），三百六十度回饋（二）。國魂，625期，71~73。 23. 張裕隆（1998），我國「管理才能評鑑工具」發展及信效度分析研究（1）。國科會專題研究報告。 24. 鄭彩萍（2000），企業派外人員管理才能缺口、訓練與調適之研究，東吳大學國際貿易研究所，碩士論文。 25. 劉岡憬（1998），以360度回饋探討主管人員自他評一致性與領導效能關係之實證研究，國立政治大學心理研究所，碩士論文。 26. 劉麗華（2000），主管管理才能評鑑360度回饋對受評者態度之影響，國立中央大學人力資源管理研究所，碩士論文。 27. 蔡明穎（2000），團隊領導者核心才能評鑑量表之建立-以在日台式企業為例，國立中央大學人力資源管理研究所，碩士論文。 28. 蔡慶堂（2002），主管管理才能評鑑360度回饋對受評者態度之影響因素探討-以在臺某外商化工廠為例，國立中央大學管理學院高階主管企管碩士班，碩士論文。 29. 蔡耀坤（2003），我國警分局長管理才能評鑑之研究-360度回饋法之運用，中央警察大學行政警察研究所，碩士論文。 30. 謝淑芬（2003），三百六十度回饋應用於我國國中、國小教師績效評核之可行性研究，元智大學管理研究所，碩士論文。 31. 龍鳳祥（1974），管理人才發展之研究，國立政治大學企業管理研究所，碩士論文。 32. 顏月珠（2000），現代統計學，初版，三民書局。 英文部份 1. Anthony, William P.(1981). Management: Competencies and Incompetencies. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley. 2. Antonioni, D. ( 1993 ), Designing an effective 360-degree appraisal feedback process, Human Resource Management, 32, 24~38. 3. Atwater, L. & Waldman, D. ( 1998 ). 360 degree feedback and leadership development, Leadership Quarterly, 9 ( 4 ) :423~426. 4. Bannister, B. D. ( 1986 ) . Performance outcome feedback and attributional feedback: Interactive effects on recipient responses. Journal of Applied Psychology, 71 ( 2 ) : 203~210. 5. Bartlett, B. (1999). Position your personnel based on personality, Pest Control, Vol. 67: 50~53. 6. Bernardin, H.J., Dahmus, S.A. & Redmon, G ( 1993 ), Attitudes of first-line supervisors toward subordinate appraisals. Human Resource Management, 32, 315~324. 7. Boyatzis, D., ( 1982 ) . The Competence Manager: A Model For Effective Performance, N.Y. : John Wiley & Son. 8. Burke, R.J., & Wilcox, D.S. (1969). Characteristic of effective employee performance review and development interview. Personnel Psychology, 22, 291~305. 9. Braun, A. (1979). Assessing Supervisory Training Needs and Effectiveness. Training and Development Journal, Vol. 33: P4. 10. Brown, R.B. ( 1993 ) . Meta-competence: A recipe for reforming debate. Personnel Review, 22 ( 6 ) : 25~36. 11. Cascio, W. F. (1998). Applied Psychology in Personnel Management. NJ: Prentice-Hall. 12. Collins, J. 2001 Level 5 Leadership: The triumph of humility and fierce resolve, Harvard Business Review. 13. Davis, K. (1967). Human Relations at Work, New York: McGraw-Hill. 14. Doucet, K. (2000), New Competencies for Tomorrow ' s Global Leader. CMA Management, Dec./Jan., 20~24. 15. Edwards, R. Mark, & Ewen, J. Ann ( 1996 ) . 360 ° Feedback: The powerful new model for employee assessment & performance improvement. New York :AMACOM. 16. Fecteau, C. L., Fecteau, J. D., Schoel, L. C., Russell, J.A., & Poteet, M. L. (1998). Reactions of leaders to 360-degree feedback from subordinates and peers. Leadership Quarterly, 9(4): 427~448. 17. Ferris, G. R., Yates, V. L., Gilmore, D.C., & Rowland, K.M. (1985). The influence of subordinate age on performance ratings and causal attributions . Personnel Psychology. 38: 545~557. 18. Furnham, A. & Stringfield, P. ( 1998 ) , Congruence in job-performance ratings: A study of 360-degree feedback examining self, manager, peer, and consultant ratings. Human Relations, 51: 517~530. 19. Fletcher, S. ( 1992 ) , NVQs, standards and competence: A practice guide for employers, Management and Trainers, London: Kogan page. 20. Fox, J. & Klein, C. ( 1996 ) . The 360 degree evaluation. Public Management, Nov.: 20~22. 21. Ghiselli, E. (1971). Explorations in Managerial Talent, New York: McGraw-Hill Inc., P.16. 22. Gorsline, K., ( 1996 ) , A competency profile for human resource: No more Shoremaker ' s children. Human Resource Management, 35 ( 1 ) : 53~66. 23. Graen, G. B. & Cashman, J. ( 1975 ) . A role-making model of leadership in formal organizations; a developmental approach. In J. G. Hunt & L. L. Larson ( Eds. ) . Leadership frontiers ( Kent, OH; Kent State University Press. ) , 143~166. 24. Greenberg, J. ( 1986 ) . Determinants of perceived fairness of performance evaluations. Journal of Applied Psychology. 25. Hall, J. L., Leidecker, J. K., & DiMarco, C. (1996). What we know about upward appraisals of management: Facilitation the future use of UPAs. Human Resource Development Quarterly, 7(3), 209-226. 26. Hay, R. (1990) Performance Appraisal in the Training Needs Analysis Process: A Review and Critique, Public Personnel Management , Vol.19, No.3, P.254. 27. Hayes, J.L. ( 1979 ) . A new look at managerial competence: The AMA model of worthy performance. Management Review, 68 ( 11 ) :1198~1200. 28. Hazucha, J. F., Hezlett, S. A., & Schneider R. J. (1993). The impact of 360-degree feedback on management skills development. Human Resource Management, 32: 325~351. 29. House, D. (1971). How Well-Managed Organizations Develop Their Executives, Organizational Dynamics. 30. Hiltrop, J. M. (1998), Preparing People for the Future: The Next Agenda for HRM. European

Management Journal, Vol. 16, No.1, February, 70-78. 31. Hoffman, Robert ( 1995 ) , Ten reasons you should be using 360-degree feedback, HR-Magazine, April, 82~85. 32. Ilegn, D.R. , Fisher, C.A & Taylor, M.S. ( 1979 ) , Consequences of individual feedback on behavior in organization. Journal of Applied Psychology, 64, 349~371. 33. Ivancevich, John M, Donnelly James H. & Gibson, James L.(1989). Management: Principles and Function. Boston MA: Richard D. Irwin, inc. 34. Katz, R.L. ( 1955 ) . Skill of an effective administrator. Harvard Business Review, 33: 33~42. 35. Landy, F. & Farr, J ( 1980 ) . Performance Rating. Psychological Bulletin, 87, 72~107. 36. Landy, F. J., Barnes, J. L., & Murphy, K. R. (1978). Correlates of perceived fairness and accuracy of performance evaluation. Journal of Applied Psychology, 63: 751~754. 37. Ledford, G.E. Jr. ( 1995 ) . Paying for the skill, knowledge, and competencies of knowledge workers. Compensation and Benefits Review, 27 ( 4 ) : 55~62. 38. London, M., & Wohler, A. J. ( 1991 ) . Agreement between subordinates and self-ratings in upward feedback. Personnel Psychology, 44: 375~390. 39. Lowden, James S. (1988). Managerial Skills for the Entrepreneur. Management Decision, Vol.26, No.4, PP.35~37. 40. McClelland, D.C. (1973). Testing for competence review discussion: Making it constructive. Personnel Journal, 56: 508 ~511. 41. Mitchell, E. & Hyde A. (1979). Training Demand Assessment: Three Case Studies in Planning Training Programs. Public Personnel Management, P.371. 42. Moorman, R. H. (1991). Relationship between organizational justice and organizational citizenship behaviors: Do fairness perception influence employee citizenship? Journal of Applied Psychology, 76(6), 845~855. 43. Moulton, Harper W. (1993). Executive Development: Preparing for the 21th Century. New York: Oxford University Press. 44. Nathan, B.R., Mohrman, A.M., & Milliman, J.(1991). Inter-personal relations as a context for the effects of appraisal interviews: On performance and satisfaction: A longitudinal study Academy of Management Journal, 34(2):352~369. 45. O'Neal, Michael A. (1985). Managerial Skills and Values for Today and Tomorrow. Personnel, P.50. 46. Parry, B.S. ( 1998 ) . Just what is a competency? Training, 58~64. 47. Patrick, D. (1977). Determining Training Needs: Four Simple and Effective Approaches. Training and Development Journal, Vol. 31. P24. 48. Podsakoff, P. M. & Farh, J. L. (1989). Effects of feedback sign and credibility on goal setting and task performance. Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 44: 45~67. 49. Raelin, J.A. & Cooleage, A.S. ( 1995 ) . From generic to organic competencies. Human Resource Planning, 18 ( 3 ) : 24~33. 50. Sackett, P. R., DuBois, C. L. Z., & Noe, A. W. ( 1991 ) . Tokenism in performance evaluation: The effects of work group representation on male-female and white-black differences in performance ratings. Journal of Applied Psychology, 76: 263~267. 51. Seers, A. ( 1989 ) , Team-member exchange quality: A new construct for role-making research, Organizational Behavior and Human decision Process, 43: 118~135. 52. Seers, A., Petty, M. M. & Cashman, J. F. ( 1995 ) . Team-member exchange under team and traditional management. Group & Organization Management, 20 ( 1 ) : 18~38. 53. Spencer, L. & Spencer, M. ( 1993 ) . Competence At Work: Models for Superior Performance. N.Y.: John Wiley & Sons, Inc. 54. Stogdill, R. M. (1948). Personnel Factors Associated with Leadership, Journal of Applied Psychology, Vol.25, PP.35~71. 55. Tang, Thomas Li-Ping and Sarsfield-Baldwin and Linda J. (1996). Distributive and procedural justice as related to satisfaction and commitment. Advanced Management Journal, 61:25. 56. Tead, O. (1951). The Art of the Leadership, New York: McGraw-Hill Inc., P.5. 57. Tornow ( 1993 ) , W.W. ( 1993 ) . Editor ' s note : Introduction to special issue on 360-degree feedback. Human Resource Management, 32, 211~219. 58. Waldman, D.A. & Bowen , D.E. ( 1998 ) , The acceptability of 360-degree appraisals: A customer-supplier relationship perspective. Human Resource Management, 37, 117~129. 59. Walf, W. B. (1962). The Management of Personnel, California: Wadsworth Publishing Co., P340. 60. Wareham, C. (1996). Management Improvement Strategies: Linking Practitioners And Academics, Public Administration Review, Vol.51, No.3, PP.271~272. 61. Woodruffe, C. ( 1991 ) . Competence by any other name. Personnel Management, 23 ( 9 ) : 30~33. 62. Yau, W.S.L. & Sculli, D. ( 1990 ) , Managerial Traits and Skills, The Journal of Management Development, Vol.9, No.6, 32~40. 63. Yeung, A, k. ( 1996 ) . Competencies for HR professionals: An interview with Richard E. Boyatzis. Human Resource Management, 35 ( 1 ) : 119~132. 法規部份 1. 陸海空軍軍士官考績條例，總統府公報，民國六十八年。 2. 陸海空軍軍士官考績條例施行細則，國防部，民國八十一年。 3. 陸海空軍軍士官考績等級獎金及獎金標準，國防部，民國八十年。