

# Explore the Difficulty of Applying Meta-Analysis to Taiwanese Customer Satisfaction

沈益宏、劉原超；羅雁紅

E-mail: 9416148@mail.dyu.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study was using the qualitative research method to explore the difficulty of applying the Hunter meta-analysis to Taiwanese customer satisfaction based on Oliver's (1997) conceptual model of the antecedents and consequences of customer satisfaction. We obtained 28 studies matched with the key word "customer satisfaction" or "consumer satisfaction", published in 2003, B to C (business to ending user) and services from the Dissertation and Thesis Abstract System of National Central Library. Results showed that the following problems must be considered when conducting a meta-analysis in the field of customer satisfaction at service in Taiwanese business. 1. How to search generally and gather economically these studies on customer satisfaction. 2. The decision of the respectively theoretic framework of the field for the meta-analysis had a magic impact on abstracting research results. Therefore, it was necessary to adjust framework sometimes. 3. How to classify satisfaction-related variables correctly according to their labels. 4. To discover potential moderators of customer satisfaction. 5. To select referent population for adjusting range variation. 6. The different patterns of customer satisfaction and satisfaction-related variables in testing for association. 7. How to transfer these statistic values of tests (etc. t-test, X2 test) to a common scale of product-moment correlation. 8. Absence of some variables' reliability values and standard deviation values. In this study we attempted to resolve above problems. To this end, we offered several suggestions for future research. 1. What information has to be included when using Oliver's conceptual model of customer satisfaction for conducting a meta-analysis. 2. In the phase of data analysis, when one study owns more than one correlation coefficient to adjust the weighting value is necessary to avoid over estimated the contribution for general conclusion from the meta-analysis. 3. Transfer each customer satisfaction measure value into a common scale and 'meta-analyze' an indicator of Taiwanese studies of customer satisfaction. Further, compare the difference among industries.

Keywords : customer satisfaction ; consumer satisfaction ; meta-analysis

## Table of Contents

目錄封面內頁簽名頁授權書.....	iii	中文摘要.....	iii
..... v 英文摘要.....	vii	誌謝.....	vii
..... ix 目錄.....	x	圖目錄.....	x
..... xii 表目錄.....	xiii	附錄.....	xiii
..... xiv 第一章 緒論 1.1 研究動機.....	1	1.2 研究目的.....	3
..... 3 第二章 文獻探討 2.1 顧客滿意度的定義與理論.....	4	..... 4	4
2.1.1 顧客滿意度的定義.....	4	2.1.2 顧客滿意度的理論.....	8
2.2 顧客滿意度之影響因素與影響結果.....	11	2.2.1 顧客滿意度的影響因素.....	11
12 2.2.2 顧客滿意度預期變項間之關係.....	16	2.2.3 顧客滿意度的影響結果.....	17
17 2.2.4 顧客滿意度影響結果間之關係.....	19	2.3 顧客滿意度潛在調整變項.....	20
20 2.4 整合分析法之簡介.....	24	2.4.1 整合分析研究之主要步驟.....	24
24 2.4.2 整合分析計量性分析技巧.....	25	2.4.3 各研究本身研究結果的累積方式.....	29
29 2.4.4 整合分析法之批評及限制.....	30	2.4.5 主要四種整合分析法之比較.....	33
33 2.5 Hunter 整合分析法之資料處理流程.....	35	第三章 研究方法 3.1 台灣地區企業界服務顧客滿意度整合分析研究 各步驟說明.....	43
43 3.2 本研究之研究方法.....	49	3.3 本研究之抽樣方法.....	50
50 3.4 資訊擷取之輔助工具.....	51	第四章 研究結果.....	52
52 第五章 討論.....	65	第六章 結論與建議 6.1 結論.....	80
80 6.2 建議.....	84	參考文獻.....	87
87 附錄.....	97	圖目錄 圖2-1期望失驗理論模式.....	10
10 圖2-2顧客滿意度前因後果模式.....	11	圖2-3 Hunter法資料處理流程.....	35
35 圖3-1整合分析之步驟.....	43	圖3-2 整合分析研究架構.....	47
47 表目錄 表1-1國內探討顧客滿意度有關研究的博碩士論文統計表.....	2	表2-1顧客滿意度之定義彙整表.....	2

..... 5 表2-2顧客滿意度相關理論彙整.....	8 表2-3九種合併機率值方法之優點與限制.....
.....26 表2-4效應量與檢定統計量之關係.....	27 表2-5各種統計量與積差相關r值之轉換.....
..... 29 表3-1各篇研究所擷取資訊彙整（一）.....	53 表3-2各篇研究所擷取資訊彙整（二）.....
.....55 表3-3各篇研究所擷取資訊彙整（三）.....	57 表3-4各篇研究所擷取資訊彙整（四）.....
.....62 表5-1無母數統計考驗法之積差相關r值轉換.....	74 表6-1顧客滿意度整合分析擷取資訊之說明.....
.....85 附錄 附錄1. 本研究選取之論文資料冊.....	98 附錄2. 資訊擷取輔助工具.....
.....102	

## REFERENCES

- 一、中文部份
- 1.李金泉（1996）. SPSS/PC + 實務與應用統計分析（初版）。台北市:松崗。
  - 2.林邦傑（1987）. 整合分析的理論及其在國內的運用。教育與心理研究, 10, 1-38。
  - 3.林東正（2002）. 企業市場顧客滿意構面之探討:以資訊系統 委外發展為例, 國立台北大學企業管理研究所出版博士論文。
  - 4.林清山（1988）. 多變項分析統計法（五版）。台北市:台灣東華。
  - 5.林清山（1992）. 心理與教育統計學（初版）。台北市:台灣東華。
  - 6.邱皓政（2004）. 結構方程式:LISREL的理論、技術與應用（初版）。台北市:雙葉書廊。
  - 7.周泰華、黃俊英、郭德寶（1999）. 服務品質與顧客滿意評量 模式之比較研究。輔仁管理評論, 6（1）, 46。
  - 8.唐富藏（1995）. 服務業發展政策與經營策略。台灣服務業發展論文集（初版）, 李庸三編。台北市:聯經。
  - 9.楊敏翔（1997）. 員工特質、工作特性、服務氣候、與福祉氣候對員工滿意度及顧客滿意度關係之研究 以資訊服務業為例。中原大學企業管理學系未出版碩士論文。
  - 10.齊力（1999）譯. 社會研究後設分析程序（初版）。台北市:弘智文化。
  - 11.廖采如（1998）. 顧客滿意度模型之探討 - 兼論不一致性、涉入程度的影響, 國立中央大學企業管理研究所碩士論文。
  - 12.應立志、鍾燕宜（2000）. 整合分析方法與運用（初版）, 台北市:華泰文化事業。
- 二、英文部份
- 1.Anderson, E. W., Fornell, C. & Lehmann, D. R. (1994). Customer Satisfaction, Market Share, and Profitability: Findings From Sweden. *Journal of Marketing*, 58(July):53-66.
  - 2.Bearden, W. O. & Teel, J. E. (1983). Selected Determinants of Consumer Satisfaction and Complaint Reports. *Journal of Marketing Research* 20 (February) :21-28.
  - 3.Burnett, J. J. & Dunne, P. M. (1986). An Appraisal of the Use of Student Subjects in Marketing Research. *Journal of Business Research* 14:329-343.
  - 4.Callender, J. C. & Osburn, H. G. (1980). Development and Test of a New Model for Generalization of Validity. *Journal of Applied Psychology* 65:543-558.
  - 5.Cardozo, R. N. (1965). An Experimental Study of Customer Effort, Exception and Satisfaction. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 2:244-249.
  - 6.Churchill, G. A. & Suprenant C. (1982). An Investigation Into the Determinants of Customer Satisfaction. *Journal of Marketing Research* 19 (November) :491-504.
  - 7.Clemmer, E.C. (1988). The Role of Fairness in Customer Satisfaction with Services. P.h.D. dissertation. University of Maryland-College Park.
  - 8.Day, G. (1984). Modeling Choices Among Alternative Responses to Dissatisfaction. In *Advances in Consumer Research*. Ed. Thomas Kinnear. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research 496-499.
  - 9.Elashoff, J. D. (1978). Box Scores Are for Baseball. *The Behavioral and Brain Science* 3:392.
  - 10.Farley, J. U. & Lemann, D. R. (1986). *Meta-Analysis in Marketing*, Lexington Books.
  - 11.Folkes, V. S. (1984). Consumer Reactions to Product Failure: An Attribution Approach. *Journal of Consumer Research* 14 (March) : 398-409.
  - 12.Fournier, S. & Mick, D. G. (1999). Rediscovering Satisfaction. *Journal of Marketing*, 63(Oct.):5-23.
  - 13.Glass, G. V. (1978). In Defense of Generalization. *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 3:394-395.
  - 14.Glass, G. V., McGaw, B. & Smith, M. L. (1981). *Meta-Analysis in Social Research*. Beverly Hills CA: Sage.
  - 15.Gilly, M. C. & Gelb, B. D. (1982). Post-Purchase Consumer Processes and the Complaining Consumer. *Journal of Consumer Research* 9 (December) :323-328.
  - 16.Goodwin, C. & Ross, I. (1992). Consumer Responses to Service Failure: Influence of Procedural and Interactional Fairness Perception. *Journal of Business Research* 25 (September) : 149-163.
  - 17.Gronroos, C. (1982). *Strategic Management and Marketing in the Service Sector*. Helsingfors, Sweden: Swedish School of Economics and Business Administration.
  - 18.Halstead, D., Hartman, D. & Schmidt S. L. (1994). Multisource Effects on the Satisfaction Formation Process. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science* 22 (2) :114-129.
  - 19.Hirschman, A. O. (1970). *Exit, Voice, and Loyalty*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
  - 20.Howard, J. A. & Sheth, J. N. (1969). *The Theory of Buyer Behavior*. New York: John Willy and Sons.
  - 21.Hunter, J. E., Schmidt, F. L. (1990). *Methods of Meta Analysis*. Newbury Park, CA:sage.
  - 22.Hunter, J. E., Schmidt, F. L. & Jackson, G. B. (1982). *Meta-Analysis: Cumulating Research Findings Across Studies*. Sage: Beverly Hills, London.
  - 23.Johnson, M. D. (1998). *Customer Orientation and Market Action*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
  - 24.Kotler, P. (1991). *Marketing Management: Analysis, Planning, Implementation and Control*, 7th ed., Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ.:246-249.
  - 25.LaBarbera, P. A. & Mazursky D. (1983). A Longitudinal Assessment of Consumer Satisfaction / Dissatisfaction: The Dynamic Aspect of the Cognitive Process. *Journal of Marketing Research* 20 (November) :393-404.
  - 26.LaTour, S. A. & Peat, N. C. (1979). The Role of Situationally Produced Expectations, Others' Experiences, and Prior Experiences in Determining Consumer Satisfaction. In *Advances in Consumer Research Vol. 7*. Ed. Jerry C. Olson. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research 588-592.
  - 27.Mano, H. & Oliver R. (1993). Assessing the Dimensionality and Structure of the Consumption Experience: Evaluation, Feeling, and Satisfaction. *Journal of Consumer Research* 20 (December) : 451-466.
  - 28.Mayo, R. J. (1978). Statistical Considerations in Analyzing the Results of a Collection of Experiments. *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* 3:400-401.
  - 29.Mittal, V., Ross W. T. & Baldasare P. M. (1998). The Asymmetric Impact of Negative and Positive Attribute-Level Performance on Overall Satisfaction and Repurchase Intentions. *Journal of Marketing* 62 (January) :33-47.
  - 30.Muller, W (1991). Gaining Competitive Advantage Through Customer Satisfaction, *European Management Journal*:201-221.
  - 31.Nyer, P. (1999). Cathartic Complaining as a Means of Reducing Consumer Dissatisfaction. *Journal of*

Consumer Satisfaction, Dissatisfaction, and Complaining Behavior 12:15-25. 32.Oliver, R. L. ( 1980 ) . A Cognitive Model of the Antecedents and Consequences of Satisfaction Decisions. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 17(Nov.):460-469. 33.Oliver, R. L. ( 1981 ) . Measurement and Evaluation of Satisfaction Processes in Retail Settings. *Journal of Retailing* 57 ( Fall ) :25-48. 34.Oliver, R. L. ( 1981 ) . What is Customer Satisfaction ? , *Wharton Magazine*, Vol.5:36-41. 35.Oliver, R. L. ( 1989 ) . Processing of Satisfaction Response in Consumption: A Suggested Framework and Research Propositions. *Journal of Consumer Satisfaction, Dissatisfaction and Complaining Behavior*, 2:1-6. 36.Oliver, R. L. ( 1993 ) . Cognitive, Affective, and Attribute Bases of the Satisfaction Response. *Journal of Consumer Research* 20 ( December ) :418-430. 37.Oliver, R. L. ( 1997 ) . Satisfaction: A Behavioral Perspective on the Consumer, N.Y.: McGraw-Hill. 38.Oliver, R. L. & DeSarbo, W. S. ( 1988 ) . Response Determinants in Satisfaction Judgments. *Journal of Consumer Research* 14 ( March ) :495-507. 39.Oliver, R. L. & Linda, G. ( 1981 ) . Effects of Satisfaction and Its Antecedents on Consumer Preference and Intention. In *Advances in Consumer Research*. Ed. Monroe, K. B., Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research 88-93. 40.Oliver, R. L. & Swan, J. E. ( 1989 ) . Consumer Perceptions of Interpersonal Equity and Satisfaction in Transactions: A Field Survey Approach. *Journal of Marketing* 53 ( April ) :21-35. 41.Oliver, R. L. & Swan, J. E. ( 1989 ) . Equity and Disconfirmation Perceptions as Influences on Merchant and Product Satisfaction. *Journal of Consumer Research* 16 ( December ) :372-383. 42.Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml V. A. & Berry L. ( 1985 ) . A Conceptual Model of Service Quality and Its Implications for Future Research. *Journal of Marketing* 49 ( Fall ) :41-50. 43.Park, C. W. & Lessig V. P. ( 1977 ) . Students and Housewives: Differences in Susceptibility to Reference Group Influence. *Journal of Consumer Research* 4 ( September ) :102-110. 44.Richins, M. L. ( 1983 ) . Negative Word-of-Mouth by Dissatisfied Customers: A Pilot Study. *Journal of Marketing* 47 ( Winter ) 68-78. 45.Rosenthal, R. ( 1978 ) . Combining Results of Independent Studies. *Psychological Bulletin* 85:185-193. 46.Rosenthal, R. ( 1984 ) . *Meta-Analytic Procedures for Social Research*. Sage: Beverly Hills, London. 47.Sackett, P. R., Schmitt, N., Kehoe, J. & Zedeck, S. ( 1985 ) . Commentary of Forty Questions About Validity Generalization & Meta-Analysis 38. 48.Schellhase, R., Hardock, P. & Ohlwein, M. ( 1999 ) . Customer Satisfaction in Business-to-Business Marketing: The Case of Retail Organizations and their Supplier, *Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing*, 14(5/6):416-432. 49.Shostack, G.. L. ( 1977 ) .Breaking Free from Product Marketing. *Journal of Marketing* 41 (April): 73-80. 50.Strube, M. J. & Hartmann, D. P. ( 1983 ) . Meta-Analysis: Techniques, application, and Functions. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology* 51:14-27. 51.Swan, J. E. & Oliver, R. L. ( 1991 ) . An Applied Analysis of Buyer Equity Perceptions and Satisfaction With Automobile Salespeople. *Journal of Personal Selling and Sale Management* 11 ( 2 ) :15-26. 52.Swan, J. E. & Trawick, F. ( 1981 ) . Disconfirmation of Expectations and Satisfaction With a Retail Service. *Journal of Retailing* 57 ( Fall ) :49-67. 53.Sweeney, J. C., Soutar, G. N. ( 2001 ) . Consumer Perceived Value: The Development of a Multiple Item Scale. *Journal of Retailing*, 77:220-230. 54.Szymanski, D. M., Henard, D. H. ( 2001 ) . Customer Satisfaction: A Meta-Analysis of the Empirical Evidence. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 29(1):16-35. 55.Tabachnick, B. G. & Fidell, L. S. ( 1996 ) . *Using Multivariate Statistics*. 3rd ed. New York: HaperCollins. 56.Tax, S. S. & Chandrashekar, M. ( 1992 ) . Consumer Decision Making Following a Failed Service Encounter: A Pilot Study. *Journal of Consumer Satisfaction, Dissatisfaction and Complaining Behavior* 5:55-68. 57.Thibaut, J. W. & Kelley, H. H. ( 1959 ) . *The Social Psychology of Groups*. New York: John Wiely. 58.Tse, D. K. & Wilton P. C. ( 1988 ) . Models of Consumer Satisfaction Formation: An Extension. *Journal of Marketing Research* 25 ( May ) :204-212. 59.Ursic, M. L. ( 1985 ) . A model of Consumer Decision to Seek Legal Redress. *Journal of Consumer Affairs* 19 ( Summer ) :20-36. 60.Weiner, B. ( 1986 ) . *An Attributional Theory of Motivation and Emotion*. New York: Springer. 61.Weiner, B. ( 1981 ) . Sources of Consumer Satisfaction With Retail Outlets. *Journal of Retailing* 57 ( 3 ) 68-85. 62.Weiner, B. ( 1987 ) . Product/Consumption-Based Affective Responses and Postpurchase Processes. *Journal of Marketing Research* 24 ( August ) :258-270. 63.Weiner, B. & Oliver, R. L. ( 1991 ) . The Dimensionality of Consumption Emotion Patterns and Consumer Satisfaction. *Journal of Consumer Research* 18 ( June ) :84-91. 64.Yi, Y. ( 1990 ) . A Critical Review of Consumer Satisfaction. In *Review of Marketing*. Ed. Zeithaml, V. A.. Chicago: American Marketing Association. 65.Zeithaml V., Berry, L. & Parasuraman A. ( 1993 ) . The Nature and Determinants of Customer Expectations of Service. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science* 21 ( 1 ) :1-12. 66.Zeithaml, V. A. , Bitner, M. Jo. ( 2000 ) . *Services Marketing: Integrating Customer Focus Across the Firm* ( 2nd ed. ) , McGraw-Hill Inc.