

An Exploratory Study of The Customer ' s Side of Service Failure, Service Recovery - With The Retailing Service Industry a

黃雅惠、張景旭

E-mail: 9315891@mail.dyu.edu.tw

ABSTRACT

Nowadays Service Industries play a significant role in economics as well as leads the major economic development all over the world, which reveals the importance of service management. Service Industries have actively improved their service; nevertheless, customers still complain. Most of the customers continue unsatisfied. The service amending does not change anything. The problems about the service makeup and the service processes are waiting for solutions. The study focuses on the use of depth interviews as an applied method. The respondents are customers. This research mainly studies the customer service mistake and service amending in the retail shops. In the viewpoint of the customers to discuss the whole consumption process and analyze the service problems. Further, suggestions for the service industries about how to read the behaviors of the customers and promote the service quality and satisfaction of the customers will be offered in this study. The research reports: I. The cases that " go far away " : 1. The contracts are not carried out. 2. The unsuited products are not exchangeable. 3. Requesting for refund is denied. 4. The attendants are with bad attitude, expressions, and answers. 5. The attendants ignore the customers. 6. The attendants have poor product knowledge. 7. The attendants passively serve and respond to the customers. 8. Recommended products are not suited. 9. Products do not match the expectation. 10. The attendants ask too far. 11. The attendants question customers. 12. The attendants do not treat and solve the problem in time. 13. The attendants deny forgetting to give free gifts and mis-charging. 14. The attendants show off their eloquence. 15. The attendants force the customers to purchase or sign contracts. 16. Different service attitudes before and after purchasing make customers feel utilitarian of the attendants. 17. The products are in shortage. II. " The sequent Responses " of the customers: 1. Helplessly cooperating with. 2. Continuously waiting and observing. 3. Asking for rearrangement. 4. Procrastinating. 5. Arguing. 6. Silently responding. III. " Actions " of the customers: 1. Immediately requesting or responding. 2. Being patient, oppressive, or silent. 3. Losing temper. 4. Blaming the attendants. 5. Leaving with anger. 6. Arguing furiously. 7. Refusing to purchase again. 8. Leaving the unsuited products. 9. Complaining to the others (friends or family).

Keywords : Service failure ; service recovery ; Quality research

Table of Contents

目錄 封面內頁 簽名頁 授權書.....	iii 中文摘要.....
..... v 英文摘要.....	vii 誌謝.....
..... ix 目錄.....	xii 圖目錄.....
..... xv 表目錄.....	xvi 第一章 緒論 第一節 研究背景與動機.....
.....1 第二節 研究目的.....	11 第二章 文獻探討 第一節 服務失誤.....
.....13 一、 服務失誤的定義.....	13 二、 服務失誤的類型.....
.....14 三、 服務缺失的重要性.....	24 四、 服務失誤對顧客維持的影響.....
.....27 五、 顧客對服務失誤的反應.....	28 六、 形成服務失誤的前置影響因素.....
.....30 七、 服務失誤循環.....	31 八、 服務失誤之重要文獻整理.....
.....34 第二節 服務補救.....	36 一、 服務補救之定義.....
.....36 二、 服務補救之類型.....	38 三、 服務補救之影響性與目的.....
.....46 四、 服務補救的重要性.....	48 五、 企業如何制定有效的服務補救策略.....
.....50 六、 服務補救之實證性研究.....	52 七、 服務補救之相關文獻整理.....
54 第三章 研究方法 第一節 研究設計.....	58 第二節 研究流程.....
.....73 第三節 研究問題.....	75 第四節 研究對象.....
.....75 第五節 研究前架構.....	76 第四章 研究資料分析結果 第一節 顧客端面臨服務失誤與補救之生氣歷程問題分析.....
78 第二節 研究後架構.....	117 第三節 研究分析內容之綜合探討.....
135 第五章 結論與建議 第一節 研究結論.....	147 第二節 管理意涵與建議.....
.....160 第三節 建議.....	175 參考文獻 一、 中文書目.....
.....178 二、 英文書目.....	180

圖目錄 圖 2.1 顧客抱怨行為模型.....	29	圖 2.2 顧客服務失誤循環.....	32
.....	32	圖 2.3 員工服務失誤循環.....	33
.....	39	圖 2.4 服務復原的四個階段.....	65
.....	74	圖 3.1 質性方法之研究流程圖.....	74
.....	74	圖 3.2 本研究之研究流程圖.....	81
.....	2	表目錄 表 1.1 產業結構資料.....	3
.....	2	表 1.2 就業結構資料.....	3
表 2.1 零售業服務失誤之發生原因.....	16	表 2.2 Bitner, Booms & Tetreault (1990) 服務失誤之類群.....	18
表 2.2 Hoffman, Kelly & Rotalsky (1995) 服務失誤之類群.....	19	表 2.3 國內外學者服務失誤重要文獻及相關研究之演進整理.....	34
表 2.4 零售業之服務補救方式.....	40	表 2.5 餐飲業之服務補救方式.....	41
表 2.6 國內外學者服務補救重要文獻與相關研究之演進整理.....	55	表 3.1 訪談過程及注意事項.....	69
表 3.2 本研究訪談對象樣本概述.....	76	表 3.3 研究前架構.....	77
表 4.1 研究後理論架構.....	117	表 4.2 顧客端生氣歷程各階段之「離譜事件」疏失類型.....	136
表 4.3 顧客端生氣歷程各階段之「後續歷程」之模式.....	138	表 4.4 本研究結果之「離譜事件」之常見模式.....	140
表 4.5 本研究之「離譜事件」與CIT法分類之「服務失誤」原因類型比較.....	141	表 4.6 各研究對象之顧客端生氣歷程次數.....	142
表 4.7 研究個案消費生氣經驗之各個角色.....	143	表 4.8 顧客端生氣歷程之「第一次生氣」與「後續生氣」的「連動機制」.....	145

REFERENCES

- 一、中文書目 1.行政院主計處編製(2001), 主要國家重要經社指標統計, 台北:編製者發行。 2.行政院主計處第三局(2003), 國民經濟動向統計季報之產業結構資料。 <http://www.dgbas.gov.tw/dgbas03/bs5/quarter/產業結構.xls> 3.行政院主計處第三局(2003), 重要經社指標速報。 <http://www.dgbas.gov.tw/dgbas03/bs4/analysis/econdex1.xls> 4.行政院主計處第三局(2003), 重要經社指標。 <http://www.dgbas.gov.tw/dgbas03/bs4/econdexa.xls> 5.行政院主計處第三局(2003), 主要國家重要經社指標。 http://www.dgbas.gov.tw/dgbas03/bs8/world/i_socce3.xls 6.方世榮譯(1998) 行銷管理學:分析, 計劃, 執行與控制。 Philip Kotler 原著, Marketing Management — Analysis, Planning, Implementation, and Control。 第九版, 臺北:東華。 7.Donald R. Cooper and C. William Emory 著, 古永嘉譯 (1996), 企業研究法, 台北市:華泰文化事業公司。 8.江明修 (1999), 「非營利組織政策遊說功能之研究」, 行政院國家科學委員會專題研究報告, 計畫編號NSC88 2416 H 004 026 F21。 9.朱美珍 (1992), 社會科學研究中有關質的探討, 質化研究在社會工作界的應用 - 論見彙編, 社會工作員訓練叢書之四十六, 頁64-87, 許臨高主編, 中華民國社區發展研究中心。 10.Earl Babbie 著, 李美華譯 (1998), 社會科學研究方法, 台北:時英。 11.李成嶽 (1998), 如何永遠贏得顧客 (第八刷), 中國生產力中心, 臺北, 第3-4 頁。 12.邱莉晴(2000), 服務失誤與服務補救對顧客滿意之影響, 國立中央大學企業管理研究所碩士論文。 13.Patton 原著, 吳芝儀、李奉儒譯 (1995), 質的評鑑與研究, 台北:桂冠心理學叢書, 心理學術系列。 14.胡幼慧 (1997), 質性研究:理論、方法及本土女性研究實例, 台北:巨流。 15.Strauss & Corbin 原著, 徐宗國譯 (1997), 質性研究概論, 台北:巨流圖書公司。 16.張紹勳 (2001), 研究方法, 台中市:滄海書局。 17.張景旭 (2002), 質化研究方法課堂筆記。 18.張敦智 (1996), 「醫院公共關係運作之研究 - 以中部醫院為例」, 中國醫藥學院醫務管理研究所碩士論文。 19.黃俊英 (1996), 行銷研究 - 管理與技術, 台北:華泰書局。 20.蔡敦浩 (1985), 策略決策過程之研究, 國立政治大學企業管理研究所未出版博士論文。 21.鄭紹成(1997), 服務業服務補救、挽回服務與顧客反應之研究, 私立中國文化大學國際企業管理研究所未出版之博士論文。。 22.鄭紹成(1999), 服務失誤、服務補救與購買意圖之研究, 私立東吳大學經濟商學學報, 25(6), 61-92。 23.賴其勳(1997), 消費者抱怨行為、抱怨後行為及其影響因素之研究, 國立臺灣大學商學研究所博士論文。 24.輝偉偉(1996), 顧客抱怨處理與顧客滿意關係之研究 - 綜合認知面與情感面之探討, 國立中央大學企業管理研究所碩士論文。
- 二、英文書目 1.Albrecht, K. & Zemke, R. (1985). Service America, 6-7. (轉引自方世榮譯, 1998) 2.Bitner, M. J., Boom, B. M., & Tetreault, M. S. (1990). The service encounter: Diagnosing favorable and unfavorable incidents. *Journal of Marketing*, 54(1), 71-85. 3.Boulding, W., Richard, S., & Zeithaml, V. A. (1993).A dynamic process model of service quality:From expectations to behavioral intentions. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 30(2), 7-27. 4.Bitner? M. H., Boom, B. M., & Mohr, L. A. (1994). Critical service encounter : The employee ' s viewpoint. *Journal of Marketing*, 58(3), 95-106. 5.Berry, L. (1994). On great service. New York: The Free Press. 6.Blodgett, J. G., Wakefield, K. L., & Barnes, J. H. (1995). The effects of consumer service on consumer complaining behavior.*Journal of Service Marketing*, 9(4), 31-42. 7.Brown, S. W. (1997). Service recovery through IT: Complaint hankling will differentiate firms in the future. *Marketing Management*, 6(3), 25-27. 8.Boshoff, C. (1997). An experimental study of service recovery options. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 8(2), 110-130. 9.Boshoff, C. (1999). Recover: An instrument to measure satisfaction with transaction-specific service recovery. *Journal of Service Research*, 1(3), 236-249. 10.Clark, G. L., Kaminski, P. F., & Rink, D. R. (1992). Consumer complaints: Advice on how companies should respond based on an empirical study. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 6(1), 41-50. 11.Churchill, G. A. (1995) *Marketing Research:Methodological Founddations*,6th ed, Texas:Dryden Press. 12.Cooper, D. R. and C. W. Emory (1995) ,*Business Research Methods*, Richard D. Irwin Inc. 13.Christo, B.(1997),"An Experimental Study of Service Recovery Options," *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, Vol.8, .110-130. 14.Day, R. L. and Landon, E. L., 1977a, "Collecting Comprehensive Consumer Complain Data by Survey Research" *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol.3, 263-269. 15.Day, R. L. and Landon, E. L., 1977b, "Towards a Theory of Consumer Complaining Behavior," in *Consumer and Industrial Buying Behavior*, Arch Woodside,

Jagdish Sheth, and Peter Bennett, eds. Amsterdam: North Holland Publishing Company Press, 425-432. 16. Day, R. L. (1980). Research perspectives on consumer complaining behavior. In C. Lamb, & P. Dunne (Eds.), *Theoretical developments in marketing*. Chicago: American Marketing Association. 17. Desatnick, R. L. (1988). *Managing to keep the customer*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin. 18. De Lisser, E. (1993). Today's Specials Include Customer Satisfaction, *The Wall Street Journal*, June 7, B1. (Cited in Hoffman, K. D., Kelley, S. W. & Rotalsky, H.M., 1995).

19. Etzel, M. J., & Silverman, B. I. (1988). A managerial perspective on directions for retail customer dissatisfaction research. *Journal of Retailing*, 57(4), 124-136. 20. Flanagan, J. C. (1954). "The Critical Incident Technique," *Psychological Bulletin*, Vol. 51, 327-358. 21. Folkes, V. S. (1984). Consumer reactions to product failures: An attributional approach. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 10(5), 389-409. 22. Fisk, R. P., Brown, S. W., & Bitner, M. J. (1993). Tracking the evolution of the service marketing literature. *Journal of Retailing*, 69(1), 61-103. 23. Fornell, C., & Wernerfelt, B. (1987). Defensive marketing strategy by customer management: A theoretical analysis. *Journal of Marketing*, 24(11), 337-346. 24. Firnstahl, T. W. (1989). My Employees Are My Service Guarantees. *Harvard Business Review*, 67, 4-8. 25. Gilly, M. C. (1987). Post complaint processes: From organizational response to repurchase behavior. *Journal of Consumer Affairs*, 21(2), 293-313. 26. Gronroos, C. (1988). Service quality: The six criteria of good perceived service quality. *Review of Business*, 9(4), 10-13. 27. Goodwin, Cathy and Ivan Ross, (1992), "Consumer Responses to Service Failures: Influence of Procedural and Interaction Fairness Perceptions," *Journal of Business Research*, 25(1), 149-163. 28. Heskett, J. L. (1986). *Managing in the Service Economy*, Boston, Harvard Business School Press. 29. Hart, C. W. L., Heskett, J. L., & Sasser, W. E., Jr. (1990). The profitable art of service recovery. *Harvard Business Review*, 68(4), 148-156. 30. Heskett, J. L., Jones, G. W., Loveman, W. E., Sasser, J. R., & Schlesinger, L. A. (1994). Putting the service-profit chain to work. *Harvard Business Review*, 72(1), 164-174. 31. Hoffman, K. D., Kelly, S. W. & Rotalsky, H. M. (1995), "Tracking Service Failures and Employee Recovery Efforts," *Journal of Service Marketing*, Vol. 9, No. 2, 49-61. 32. Johnston, T. C., & Hewa, M. A. (1997). Fixing service failures. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 26(5), 467-473. 33. Kotler, Philip (1991), "Marketing management: Analysis, Planning, Implementation, & Control," Englewood Cliffs, N. J. Prentice-Hall, Inc., 7th ed., 164. 34. Kurtz, D. L. and Clow, K. E. (1998), "Service Marketing," John Wiley & Sons, Inc. 35. Kelley, S. W. (1992). Developing customer orientation among service employees. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 20(1), 27-36. 36. Kelley, S. W. (1993). Discretion and the service employee. *Journal of Retailing*, 69(1), 104-126. 37. Kelley, S. W., Hoffman, K. D., & Davis, M. A. (1993). A typology of retail failures and recoveries. *Journal of Retailing*, 69(4), 429-452. 38. Kelley, S. W., & Davis, M. A. (1994). Antecedents to consumer expectation for service recovery. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 22(1), 52-61. 39. Keaveney, S. M. (1995). Customer switching behavior in service industries: An exploratory study. *Journal of Marketing*, 59(4), 71-82. 40. Lee Moonkyu and Ulgado F. M. (1997), "Consumer Evaluations of Fast-food Services: A Cross-national Comparison," *The Journal of Service Marketing*, Vol. 11, No. 1, 39-52. 41. Miller, W. L. and B. F. Crabtree (1992) Primary care research: a multimethod typology and qualitative research map. In Crabtree & Millers (eds), *Doing Qualitative Research*, Newbury Park CA: Sage 3-28. 42. McCollough, M. A., & Bharadwaj, S. G. (1992). The recovery paradox: An examination of consumer satisfaction in relation to disconfirmation, service quality, and attribution-based theories. *Marketing Theory and Application*, 65(4), 102-107. 43. Mohr, L. A., & Bitner, M. J. (1995). The role of employee effort in satisfaction with service transaction. *Journal of Business Research*, 32(3), 239-252. 44. McCollough, M. A., Berry, L. L., & Yadav, M. S. (2000). An empirical investigation of customer satisfaction after service failure and recovery. *Journal of Service Research*, 3(2), 121-137. 45. Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., & Berry, L. L. (1985). A conceptual model of service quality and its implication for future research. *Journal of Marketing*, 48(3), 41-50. 46. Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. A., & Berry, L. L. (1988). SERVQUAL: A multiple-item scale for measuring consumer perceptions of service quality. *Journal of Retailing*, 64(1), 12-40. 47. Power, C. (1991). Value marketing: Quality, service, and fair pricing are the keys to selling in the 90s. *Business Week*, 11(4), 132-140. 48. Power, C. (1992). Smart selling: How companies are winning over today's tougher customer. *Business Week*, 8(3), 45-46. 49. Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*. Newbury Park, Calif.: Sage. (轉引自胡幼慧, 1997) 50. Richins, M. L. (1987). Loyalty-based management. *Harvard Business Review*, 71(2), 64-73. 51. Richins, M. L. (1987). A multivariate analysis of responses to dissatisfaction. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 15(1), 24-31. 52. Reichheld, F. F., & Sasser, W. E. (1990). Zero defections: Quality comes to service. *Harvard Business Review*, 68(5), 105-111. 53. Reichheld, F. F. and Sasser, W. E. Jr., (1990), "Zero Defection: Quality Comes to Services," *Harvard Business Review*, Sep-Oct., 301-307. 54. Rossello, B. (1997). Customer service superstars. *ABA Banking Journal*, 89(10), 96-104. 55. Roos, I. (1999). Switching processes in customer relationships. *Journal of Service Research*, 1(8), 68-85. 56. Singh, J. (1988). Consumer complaint intentions and behavior: Definitional and taxonomical issues. *Journal of Marketing*, 52(1), 93-107. 57. Swan, J. E., and Oliver, R. L. (1989), "Post Purchase Communication by Consumers," *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 65, 516-533. 58. Singh, J. (1990). Voice, exit, and negative word-of-mouth behaviors: An investigation across three service categories. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 18(1), 1-15. 59. Singh, J. (1990). A typology of consumer dissatisfaction response style. *Journal of Retailing*, 66(1), 57-99. 60. Singh, J., & Widing, R. E. (1991). What occurs once consumers complain? *European journal of marketing*, 25(1), 30-46. 61. Schlesinger, L. A., & Heskett, J. L. (1991). The service-driven service company. *Harvard Business Review*, 2(1), 71-81. 62. Schlesinger, L. A. and J. L. Heskett (1991), "Breaking the Cycle of Failure in Services," *Sloan Management Review*, 17-28. 63. Schweikhart, S. B., Strasser, S., & Kennedy, M. R. (1993). Service recovery in healthy service organizations. *Hospital & Health Service Administration*, 38(1) 3-21. 64. Spreng, R. A., Harrell, G. D., & Mackoy, R. D. (1995). Service recovery: Impact on satisfaction and intentions. *Journal of Service Marketing*, 9(1), 15-23. 65. Singh, J., & Wilkes, R. E. (1996). When consumers complain: A path analysis of the key antecedents of consumer complaint response estimates. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 24(3), 350-365. 66. Smith, A. K., & Bolton, R. N. (1998). An experimental investigation of customer reactions to service failure and recovery encounter: Paradox or peril? *Journal of Service Research*, 36(8), 65-81. 67. Smith, A. K., Bolton, R. N., & Wagner, J. (1999). A model of

customer satisfaction with service encounters involving failure and recovery. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 36(8), 356-372. 68. Stephen, T. S. (2000). Practicing best-in-class service recovery. *Marketing Management*, 4(4), 8-9. 69. Tax, S. S., & Brown, S. W. (1998). Recovering and learning from service failure. *Sloan Management Review*, 55(4), 75-88. 70. Tax, S. S., Brown, S. W., & Chandrashekar, M. (1998). Customer evaluation of service complaint experience: Implications for relationship marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 62(4), 60-77. 71. Terrence, J. L. (2000). Service problems and recovery strategies: An experiment. *Revue canadienne des Sciences de l'administration*. *Canadian Journal of Administrative Sciences*, 3(1), 20-37. 72. Westbrook, R. A., & Oliver, R. L. (1981). The dimensionality of consumer emotion patterns and consumer satisfaction. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 18(6), 84-91. 73. Webster, C., & Sundaram, D. S. (1998). Service consumption criticality in failure recovery. *Journal of Business Research*, 41(2), 153-159. 74. Zemke, R., & Bell, C. (1990). Service recovery: Doing right in second time. *Training*, 27(6), 42-48. 75. Zeithaml, V. A., Berry, L. L., & Parasuraman, A. (1993). The nature and determinants of customer expectations of service. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 21(11), 1-12. 76. Zikmund, W. G. (1994), *Business Research Methods*, 4th ed., Texas: Dryden Press.