

The Effects of Comic Strips on EFL Learners' Reading Comprehension in Taiwan

洪歆瑜、陳建志

E-mail: 360562@mail.dyu.edu.tw

ABSTRACT

Educators in the field of English teaching have often suggested that English teachers could apply pictures or illustrations to the written texts. However, not many studies have brought the concept of comic strips into teaching English at present. Therefore, the main purpose of the present study attempts to investigate the effects of comic strips on EFL students' reading comprehension in Taiwan. 160 third-year junior high school students' English reading proficiency were estimated, and they were divided into high English reading proficiency class and low English reading proficiency class based on a placement test. The participants with different English reading proficiency class were further randomly categorized into the text only group and the comic strips group. The participants in each group were presented with easy and difficult texts only or easy and difficult comic strips. After the experiments were completed, the questionnaires were conducted to facilitate the researcher to look into the correlation between the participants' reading anxiety and reading comprehension. The findings of the study were summarized as follows: (1) The participants' reading comprehension in the comic strips group performed better than those in the text only group. (2) There was a significant interaction among English reading proficiency, reading materials, difficulty levels, and reading comprehension. (3) The students with high English reading proficiency whatever in the text only group and in the comic strips group outperformed the students with low English reading proficiency in the same groups. (4) Reading anxiety had negative relationship with EFL students' reading comprehension.

Keywords : Comic Strips、 English Reading Proficiency、 Difficulty Levels、 Vocabulary Knowledge、 Story Grammar、 Reading Anxiety

Table of Contents

English Signature Page	Signature Page	Abstractiv	
Chinese Abstractv	Acknowledgementsv	
.....vi	Table of Contentsvi		
.....vii	List of Figuresx	List of Tablesx
.....xi	Chapter I. Introductionxi		
..... 1	1.1 Background and Motivation 1	1.2 Purpose of the Research 1
..... 3	1.3 Research Questions 3	1.3 Research Questions 3
..... 3	1.4 Significance of the Research 3	1.5 Organization 4
..... 5	Chapter II. Literature Review 5		
..... 7	2.1 Reading Comprehension 7	2.1.1 7
Vocabulary Knowledge 8	2.1.2 Sentence Comprehension 8	
..... 9	2.1.3 Discourse Comprehension 9	2.2 Factor that 10
Influence Reading Comprehension 12	2.2.1 Vocabulary Size 12	
..... 12	2.2.2 Anxiety 12	2.3 Comic Strips 13
..... 14	2.3.1 The Characteristics of Comic Strips 14		
..... 15	2.3.2 Comic Strips as a Teaching Material in English Class 15	2.3.3 Comic Strips in 18
Taiwan 19	2.4 Other Studies Relating to the Present Research 19	
..... 19	2.4.1 The Impact of EFL Students' Vocabulary Breadth of Knowledge on Literal Reading Comprehension: Chen (2011) 20	2.4.2 The Effect of Story Grammar Instruction on EFL Students' Comprehension of Narrative Text: Amer (1992) 21
..... 20	2.4.3 Effects of Comic Strips on L2 Learners' Reading Comprehension: Liu (2004) 22	2.5 Summary 22
..... 23	Chapter III. Methodology 23	3.1 Hypotheses 25
..... 25	3.2 Research Design 25		
..... 26	3.3 Participants 26	3.4 26
Instruments 28	3.4.1 The Placement Test 28	

..... 28	3.4.2 Texts Only 29
3.4.3 Comic Strips 30	3.4.4 Reading Comprehension Tests
..... 31	3.4.5 Questionnaires 31
Procedure 32	3.6 Data Analysis
..... 32	3.7 The Pilot Study 32
33	Chapter VI. Results and Discussion 36
36	4.1 The Analysis of Variance among English Reading Proficiency, Reading Materials, Difficulty Levels, and Reading Comprehension 36
..... 37	4.1.1 The Interaction of English Reading Proficiency, Reading Materials, and Difficulty Levels with Reading Comprehension 37
..... 38	4.1.2 The Simple Interaction Effects of English Reading Proficiency, Reading Materials, and Difficulty Levels on Reading Comprehension 38
..... 40	4.1.3 The Simple Simple Main Effects of English Reading Proficiency, Reading Materials, and Difficulty Levels on Reading Comprehension 40
..... 49	4.2 Correlation between Reading Anxiety and Reading Comprehension 49
..... 51	4.3 Conclusion 51
..... 52	Chapter V. Conclusions 52
..... 52	5.1 General Discussion 52
..... 54	5.2 Limitations of the Study 54
..... 54	5.3 Pedagogical Implications 54
..... 55	5.4 Suggestions for Further Study 55
..... 57	References 57
..... 65	Appendix A The Young King (Text Only) 65
..... 67	Appendix B Hiding in Plain Sight: Animal Camouflage (Text Only) 67
..... 69	Appendix C The Young King (Comic Strips) 69
..... 74	Appendix D Hiding in Plain Sight: Animal Camouflage (Comic Strips) 74
..... 78	Appendix E The Young King (Reading Comprehension Test) 78
..... 82	Appendix F Hiding in Plain Sight: Animal Camouflage (Reading Comprehension Test) 82
..... 86	Appendix G Questionnaire One 86
..... 88	Appendix H Questionnaire Two 88
..... 16	List of Figures Figure 2.1 Twilight Illustrated by Young Kim (2010) 16
..... 17	Figure 2.2 Helmet Illustrated by Fabio Visntin (2003, p. 17) 17
..... 10	List of Tables Table 2.1 The Constituents of Thematic Roles 10
..... 27	Table 3.1 Reading Proficiency Distribution of the Participants 27
..... 28	Table 3.2 Text Only and Comic Strips with Difficulty Levels 28
..... 29	Table 3.3 Flesch ' s Reading Ease Scale 29
..... 34	Table 3.4 Results of Three-way ANOVA Repeated Measures of the Pilot Study 34
..... 37	Table 4.1 Results of Three-way ANOVA Repeated Measures 37
..... 38	Table 4.2 Results of Simple Interaction Effects 38
..... 41	Table 4.3 Mean and Standard Deviation of Reading Materials with Difficulty Levels in the Individual Reading Proficiency 41
..... 41	Table 4.4 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Proficiency and Reading Materials in the Easy Level 41
..... 42	Table 4.5 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Proficiency and Reading Materials in the Difficult Level 42
..... 44	Table 4.6 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Proficiency and Difficulty Levels in the Text Only Group 44
..... 45	Table 4.7 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Proficiency and Difficulty Levels in the Comic Strips Group 45
..... 47	Table 4.8 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Materials and Difficulty Levels in the High Reading Proficiency 47
..... 47	Table 4.9 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Materials and Difficulty Levels in the Low Reading Proficiency 47
..... 49	Table 4.10 Correlation between Reading Anxiety and Text Only 49
..... 50	Table 4.11 Correlation between Reading Anxiety and Comic Strips 50

REFERENCES

- Amer, A.A. (1992). The effect of story grammar instruction on EFL students ' Comprehension of narrative text. *Reading in a Foreign Language*, 8(2), 711-720.
- Anderson, J.C. (2000). *Assessing reading*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Anderson, J.R. (1990). *Cognitive psychology and its implications* (2nd ed.). New York: Freeman.
- Antoniou, F. & Souvignier, E. (2007). Strategy instruction in reading comprehension: An intervention study for students with learning disabilities. *Learning Disabilities: A Contemporary Journal*, 5(1), 41-57.
- Baleghizaden, S. & Golbin, M. (2010). The effect of vocabulary size on reading comprehension of Iranian EFL learners. *Linguistic and Literacy Broad Research and Innovation*, 1(2), 33-46.
- Bensoussan, M. (1998). Schema effects in EFL reading comprehension. *Journal of Research in Reading*, 21 p. 213-227.
- Brantmeier, C. (2005). Anxiety about L2 reading or L2 reading tasks? A study with advanced language learners. *The Reading Matrix*, 5(2), 67-84.
- Brookshire, J., Scharff, L.F.V., & Moses, L.E. (2002). The influence of illustrations on children ' s book preferences and comprehension. *Reading Psychology*, 23, 323-339.
- Brown, H.D. (2000). *Principles of language learning and teaching*. (4th ed.). New York: Longman
- Brown, H.D. (2001). *Teaching by principles: An interactive approach to language pedagogy* (2nd ed.). New York: Longman.
- Byrnes, J.P. (1996). *Cognitive development and learning in instructional contexts*. Massachusetts: Allyn and Bacon.
- Carrington, V. (2004). *Texts and literacies of the Shi Jinriu*. *British Journal of Sociology*

of Education, 25(2), 215-228. Chen, K.Y. (2011). The impact of EFL students' vocabulary breadth of knowledge on literal reading comprehension. *Asian EFL Journal*, 51, 30-40. Chomsky, N. (1965). *Aspects of the theory of syntax*. Cambridge: MIT Press. Cooper, J.P. (1986). *Improving reading comprehension*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co. Chou, P.T.M. (2011). The effects of vocabulary knowledge and background knowledge on reading comprehension of Taiwanese EFL students. *Electronic Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 8(1), 108-115. Denton, C.A & Al Otaiba, S. (2011). Teaching word identification to students with reading difficulties and disabilities. *Focus on Exceptional Children*, 43(7), 1-16. DuBay, W.H. (2007). *Unlocking language: The classic studies in readability*. North Charleston: BookSurge LLC. Flesch, R. (1949). *The art of readable writing*. New York: Harper. Firtschemann, N.S., Deshler, D.D., & Schumaker, J.B. (2007). The effects of instruction in an inference strategy on the reading comprehension skills of adolescents with disabilities. *Learning Disability Quarterly*, 30, 245-262. Fromkin, V., Rodman, R., & Hyams, N. (2003). *An introduction to languages (7th ed.)*. U.S.: Wadsworth. Glass, A.L. & Perna, J. (1986). The role of syntax in reading disability. *Journal of Learning Disability*, 19(6), 354-359. Guthrie, J.T., Wigfield, A., Humenick, N.M., Perencevich, K.C., Taboada, A., & Barbosa, P. (2006). Influences of stimulating tasks on reading motivation and comprehension. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 99(4), 232-245. Heilman, A. W., Blair, T. R., & Rupley, W. H. (2002). *Principles and Practices of Teaching Reading (10th ed.)*. New Jersey: Merrill Prentice Hall. Henley, J. (2009). Hiding in plain sight: Animal camouflage. *Landmark English*, 20-22. Hirsch, E.D. (2003). Reading comprehension requires knowledge – of words and the world: scientific insights into the fourth-grade slump and the nations' stagnant comprehension scores. *American Educator*, 27(1), 10-44. Hoiem-Tengesdal, I. (2010). Is the simple view of reading too simple? *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, 54(5), 451-469. Horwitz, E. K., Horwitz, M. B., & Cope, J. (1986). Foreign language classroom anxiety. *The Modern Language Journal*, 70(2), 125-132. Howe, D.H. (1987). *The Bottle Imp*. Oxford University Press. Hsiao, H.W. (2001). Comics literacy: A study of junior high school students. *Public Opinion Research Quarterly*, 215, 20-44. Hsueh-chao, M.H. & Nation, P. (2000). Unknown vocabulary density and reading comprehension. *Reading in a Foreign Language*, 13(1), 403-430. Huang, C.C. (2004). University students' vocabulary knowledge, content knowledge and reading comprehension. *Journal of National University of Taiwan*, 38(1), 125-153. Huang, Y.L. (2005). The effects of pictures on reading comprehension of third-year junior high school students in reading selections of American festivals. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Chen Kung, Tainan City. Jafarigohar, M. & Behrooznia, S. (2012). The effect of anxiety on reading comprehension among distance EFL learners. *International Education Studies*, 5(2), 159-174. Jean-Pierre, J.R. (2011). Does size matter? The relationship between breadth and depth. *Sophia International Review*, 33, 107-120. Jitendra, A.K., Burgess, C. & Gajria, M. (2011). Cognitive strategy instruction for improving expository text comprehension of students with learning disabilities: The quality of evidence. *Council of Exceptional Children*, 77(2), 135-159. Kao, P.C. & Craigie, P. (2010). Foreign language anxiety and English achievement in Taiwanese undergraduate English-major students: An empirical study. *Bulletin on Hungkuang Institute of Technology*, 61, 49-61. Kellogg, R.T. (2003). *Cognitive psychology (2nd ed.)*. California: Sage Publication. Kraayenoord, C.E.V., Beinicke, A., Schlagmuler, M., & Schneider, W. (2012). Word identification, metacognitive knowledge, motivation and reading comprehension: An Australian study of grade 3 and 4 pupils. *Australian Journal of Language and Literacy*, 35(1), 51-68. Krashen, S. (1981). *Second language acquisition and second language learning*. Oxford: Pergamum Press. Laufer, B. (1992). How much lexis is necessary for reading comprehension? In J. L. Arnaud & H. Bejoint (Eds.), *Vocabulary and applied linguistics* (pp. 126-132). London: MacMillan. Laufer, B. & Ravenhorst-Kalovski, G.C. (2010). Lexical threshold revisited: Lexical text coverage, learners' vocabulary size and reading comprehension. *Reading in a Foreign Language*, 22(1), 15-30. Laufer, B. & Sim, D.D. (1985). Measuring and explaining the threshold needed for English for academic purposes texts. *Foreign Language Annals*, 18(5), 405-411. Lehr, F. (1987). Story grammar. *The Reading Teacher*, 34, 261-268. Lent, J. A. (2001). *Illustrating Asia: Comics, Humor magazines, and picture books*. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon press. Levie, W.H. & Lentz, R. (1982). Effects of text illustrations: A review of research. *Education Communication and Technology Journal*, 30, 195 – 232. Levin, J.R., Anglin, G.J., & Carney, R.N. (1987). On empirically validating functions of pictures in prose. In D. M. Willows & H. A. Houghton (Eds.) *The psychology of illustration: Volume I. Basic research* (pp. 51 – 86). New York: Springer-Verlag. Liu, J. (2004). Effects of comic strips on L2 learners' reading comprehension. *TESOL Quarterly*, 38(2), 225-245. McCloud, S. (1993). *Understanding comics: The invisible art*. New York: Harper. McVicker, C.J. (2007). Comic strips as a text structure for learning to read. *The Reading Teacher*, 61(1), 85-88. Meskin, A. (2007). Defining Comics? *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 65(4), 369-379. Morrison, T.G., Bryan, G., & Chilcoat, G.W. (2002). Using student-generated comic books in the classroom. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 45(8), 758-767. Nation, I.S.P. (1990). *Teaching and learning vocabulary*. New York: Heinle. Nation, I.S.P. (2001). *Learning vocabulary in another language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. National Institute of Child Health and Human Development. (2000). *Report of the national reading panel. Teaching children to read: An evidence-based assessment of the scientific research literature on reading and its implications for reading instruction*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office. Oakley, G. (2011). The assessment of reading comprehension cognitive strategies: Practices and perceptions of Western Australian teachers. *Australian Journal of Language and Literacy*, 34(3), 279- 293. Pan, Y.C. & Pan, Y.C. (2009). The effects of pictures on the reading comprehension of low-proficiency Taiwanese English foreign language college students: An action study. *VNU Journal of Science, Foreign Language*, 25, 186-198. Parsons, J. & Smith, K. (1993). Using comic books to teach. *Education Resources Information Center*, 1- 13. Pratt, H.J. (2009). Narrative in comics. *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 67(1), 107-117. Pu, L.C. (2003). A pilot study of reading comprehension problems in English encountered by Taiwanese senior high school students. *Journal of Far East University General Education*, 20(4), 957-965. Qian, D. (2002). Investigating the relationship between vocabulary knowledge and academic reading performance: an assessment perspective. *Language Learning*, 52(3), 513-536. O'Neil, K.E. (2011). Reading pictures: developing visual literacy for greater comprehension. *The Reading Teacher*, 3(65), 214-223. Ranker, J.

(2007). Using comic books as read-alouds: Insights on reading instruction from an English as a second language classroom. *The Reading Teacher*, 61(4), 296-305. Saraceni, M. (2003). *The language of comics*. London: Routledge. Schmitt, N. (2000). *Vocabulary in language teaching*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. Schwartz, A. & Rubistein-Avila, E. (2006). Understand the manga hype: uncovering the multimodality of comic-book illiteracies. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 50, 40-49. Scott, C.M. (2009). A case for the sentence in reading comprehension. *Language, Speech, and Hearing Services in Schools*, 40, 184-191. Sedita, J. (2005). Effective vocabulary instruction. *Insights on Learning Disabilities*, 2(1), 33-45. Shen, Z. (2008). The roles of depth and breadth of vocabulary knowledge in EFL reading performance. *Asian Social Science*, 4(12), 135-137. Shih, F.Y. (2008). Reading difficulties encountered by Taiwanese senior high school students. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Tamkang, New Taipei City. Shih, P.Y. (2006). Effects of newspaper comics on English reading and writing of EFL students in vocational high school. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. National Kaohsiung Normal University, Kaohsiung City. Steinberg, D.D. (1980). *Teaching reading to nursery school children: Final report*. Washington, DC: Office of Education, US Department of Education. Steinberg, D.D. (1982). *Psycholinguistics: Language, mind and world*. London: Longman. Steinberg, D.D. & Sciarini N.V. (2006). *An introduction to psycholinguistics*. (2nd ed.). UK: Longman. Stetter, M.E. & Hughes, M.T. (2010). Using story grammar to assist students with learning difficulties and reading difficulties improve their comprehension. *Education and Treatment of Children*, 33(1), 115- 151. Tannenbaum, K.R., Torgesen, J.K., & Wagner, R.K. (2006). Relationships between word knowledge and reading comprehension in third-grade children. *Scientific Studies of Reading*, 10(4), 381-398. The Far East Book Company. (2004). *GEPT basic level reading comprehension questions*. Taipei: The Far East Book Company. Thibedeau, J. (2009). The young king. *Live Interactive English Magazine*, 10-14. Thorndyke, P.W. (1977). Cognitive structures in reading comprehension and memory of narrative discourse. *Cognitive Psychology*, 9, 77-110. Vazalwar, C. (2011). Effect of anxiety on reading comprehension in English. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 1(7), 272-278. Visitin, F. (2003). *William Shakespeare: Hamlet Prince of Denmark*. Raynes, R (Eds.). Canterbury: Black Cat. Wang, J.H.Y. & Guthrie, J.T. (2004). Modeling the effects of intrinsic motivation, extrinsic motivation, amount of reading, and past reading achievement on text comprehension between U.S. and Chinese students. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 39(2), 162-186. Wang, K.C. (2005). Vocabulary learning difficulties for Senior I students in Taiwan. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, National Chengchi University, Taipei City. Wright, A. (1989). *Pictures for language learning*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Wu, H.J. (2011). Anxiety and reading comprehension performance in English as a foreign language. *Asian EFL Journal*, 13(2), 273-307. Wu, Y.M. (2008). Junior high school low achievers' English reading comprehension difficulties in Taiwan. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, National Taiwan University of Science and Technology, Taipei City. Young, K. (2010). *Twilight: The graphic novel volume 1*. New York: Yen Press. Zhao, N. (2007). A study of high school students' English learning anxiety. *Asian EFL Journal*, 9(3), 22-34.