

英文漫畫對台灣EFL學生閱讀理解力之效益

洪歆瑜、陳建志

E-mail: 360562@mail.dyu.edu.tw

摘要

英語教學領域的教育學家們已常建議英文老師可以運用圖片或插圖在文章上。但是，目前只有少許研究提出漫畫在英語教學上的觀點。因此，本研究之目的在於藉由漫畫來檢視英文為外語習者的台灣學生的英文閱讀理解力之影響。共有160位中台灣某國中的三年級學生參與本實驗。實驗要求受試者先寫一份能力分級試題，然後根據受試者的成績來分為高程度和低程度，接下來再隨機分成閱讀文章組和漫畫組。每位受試者皆要讀容易和困難的文章或者漫畫以及寫兩份閱讀測驗。測驗完成後，受試者要再寫一份有關閱讀焦慮感的問卷調查。本研究結論如下所述：(1) 漫畫組的閱讀測驗表現比文章組的好。(2) 三個獨立變數(英文閱讀程度、閱讀素材和難易度)與閱讀理解有顯著交互作用。(3) 高程度的學生不論讀文章或漫畫，他們的整體閱讀測驗表現皆比低程度的學生好。(4) 閱讀焦慮感與學生的閱讀理解力有顯著負相關。

關鍵詞：漫畫、英文閱讀程度、難易度、單字知識、故事結構、閱讀焦慮

目錄

English Signature Page	iv
Chinese Abstract	v Acknowledgements
.....vi Table of Contents	
....vii List of Figures	x List of Tables
.....xi Chapter I. Introduction	
.....1 1.1 Background and Motivation	1 1.2 Purpose of the Research
.....3 1.3 Research Questions	
.....3 1.4 Significance of the Research	4 1.5 Organization
.....5 Chapter II. Literature Review	
.....7 2.1 Reading Comprehension	7 2.1.1
Vocabulary Knowledge	8 2.1.2 Sentence Comprehension
.....9 2.1.3 Discourse Comprehension	10 2.2 Factor that Influence Reading Comprehension
Influence Reading Comprehension	12 2.2.1 Vocabulary Size
.....12 2.2.2 Anxiety	13 2.3 Comic Strips
.....14 2.3.1 The Characteristics of Comic Strips	
.....15 2.3.2 Comic Strips as a Teaching Material in English Class	18 2.3.3 Comic Strips in Taiwan
.....19 2.4 Other Studies Relating to the Present Research	
.....19 2.4.1 The Impact of EFL Students' Vocabulary Breadth of Knowledge on Literal Reading Comprehension: Chen (2011)	20 2.4.2 The Effect of Story Grammar Instruction on EFL Students' Comprehension of Narrative Text: Amer (1992)
.....21 2.4.3 Effects of Comic Strips on L2 Learners' Reading Comprehension: Liu (2004)	22 2.5 Summary
.....23 Chapter III. Methodology	25 3.1 Hypotheses
.....25 3.2 Research Design	
.....26 3.3 Participants	26 3.4
Instruments	28 3.4.1 The Placement Test
.....28 3.4.2 Texts Only	29
34.3 Comic Strips	30 3.4.4 Reading Comprehension Tests
.....31 3.4.5 Questionnaires	31 3.5
Procedure	32 3.6 Data Analysis
.....32 3.7 The Pilot Study	
33 Chapter VI. Results and Discussion	36 4.1 The Analysis of Variance among English Reading Proficiency, Reading Materials, Difficulty Levels, and Reading Comprehension
.....36 4.1.1 The Interaction of English Reading Proficiency, Reading Materials, and Difficulty Levels with Reading Comprehension	

..... 37 4.1.2 The Simple Interaction Effects of English Reading Proficiency, Reading Materials, and Difficulty Levels on Reading Comprehension	38
..... 4.1.3 The Simple Simple Main Effects of English Reading Proficiency, Reading Materials, and Difficulty Levels on Reading Comprehension	40
..... 4.2 Correlation between Reading Anxiety and Reading Comprehension	49
..... 4.3 Conclusion	51
..... Conclusions	52
..... 5.1 General Discussion	52
..... 5.2 Limitations of the Study	53
Pedagogical Implications	54
..... 5.4 Suggestions for Further Study	54
..... 55 References	55
57 Appendix A The Young King (Text Only)	65
..... Animal Camouflage (Text Only)	67
..... 69 Appendix D Hiding in Plain Sight: Animal Camouflage (Comic Strips)	74
..... 74 Appendix E The Young King (Reading Comprehension Test)	78
..... 78 Appendix F Hiding in Plain Sight: Animal Camouflage (Reading Comprehension Test)	82
..... 82 Appendix G Questionnaire One	86
..... 86 Appendix H Questionnaire Two	88
..... 88 List of Figures Figure 2.1 Twilight Illustrated by Young Kim (2010)	16
..... 16 Figure 2.2 Helmet Illustrated by Fabio Visntin (2003, p. 17)	17
..... 17 List of Tables Table 2.1 The Constituents of Thematic Roles	27
..... 27 Table 3.2 Text Only and Comic Strips with Difficulty Levels	28
..... 28 Table 3.3 Flesch 's Reading Ease Scale	30
..... 30 Table 3.4 Results of Three-way ANOVA Repeated Measures of the Pilot Study	34
..... 34 Table 4.1 Results of Three-way ANOVA Repeated Measures	37
..... 37 Table 4.2 Results of Simple Interaction Effects	38
..... 38 Table 4.3 Mean and Standard Deviation of Reading Materials with Difficulty Levels in the Individual Reading Proficiency	41
..... 41 Table 4.4 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Proficiency and Reading Materials in the Easy Level	41
..... 41 Table 4.5 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Proficiency and Reading Materials in the Difficult Level	42
..... 42 Table 4.6 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Proficiency and Difficulty Levels in the Text Only Group	44
..... 44 Table 4.7 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Proficiency and Difficulty Levels in the Comic Strips Group	45
..... 45 Table 4.8 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Materials and Difficulty Levels in the High Reading Proficiency	47
..... 47 Table 4.9 Summary and Posterior Comparison of Reading Materials and Difficulty Levels in the Low Reading Proficiency	47
..... 47 Table 4.10 Correlation between Reading Anxiety and Text Only	49
..... 49 Table 4.11 Correlation between Reading Anxiety and Comic Strips	50

參考文獻

- Amer, A.A. (1992). The effect of story grammar instruction on EFL students ' Comprehension of narrative text. *Reading in a Foreign Language*, 8(2), 711-720. Anderson, J.C. (2000). Assessing reading. New York: Cambridge University Press. Anderson, J.R. (1990). Cognitive psychology and its implications (2nd ed.). New York: Freeman. Antoniou, F. & Souvignier, E. (2007). Strategy instruction in reading comprehension: An intervention study for students with learning disabilities. *Learning Disabilities: A Contemporary Journal*, 5(1), 41-57. Baleghizaden, S. & Golbin, M. (2010). The effect of vocabulary size on reading comprehension of Iranian EFL learners. *Linguistic and Literacy Broad Research and Innovation*, 1(2), 33-46. Bensoussan, M. (1998). Schema effects in EFL reading comprehension. *Journal of Research in Reading*, 21 p. 213~227. Brantmeier, C. (2005). Anxiety about L2 reading or L2 reading tasks? A study with advanced language learners. *The Reading Matrix*, 5(2), 67-84. Brookshire, J., Scharff, L.F.V., & Moses, L.E. (2002). The influence of illustrations on children ' s book preferences and comprehension. *Reading Psychology*, 23, 323-339. Brown, H.D. (2000). Principles of language learning and teaching. (4th ed.). New York: Longman Brown, H.D. (2001). Teaching by principles: An interactive approach to language pedagogy (2nd ed.). New York: Longman. Byrnes, J.P. (1996). Cognitive development and learning in instructional contexts. Massachusetts: Allyn and Bacon. Carrington, V. (2004). Texts and literacies of the Shi Jinriu. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 25(2), 215-228. Chen, K.Y. (2011). The impact of EFL students ' vocabulary breadth of knowledge on literal reading comprehension. *Asian EFL Journal*, 51, 30-40. Chomsky, N. (1965). Aspects of the theory of syntax. Cambridge: MIT Press. Cooper, J.P. (1986). Improving reading comprehension. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co. Chou, P.T.M. (2011). The effects of vocabulary knowledge and background knowledge on reading comprehension of Taiwanese EFL students. *Electronic Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 8(1), 108-115. Denton, C.A & AI Otaiba, S. (2011). Teaching word identification to students with reading difficulties and disabilities. *Focus on Exceptional Children*, 43(7), 1-16. DuBay, W.H. (2007). Unlocking language: The classic studies in readability. North Charleston: BookSurge LLC. Flesch, R. (1949). The art of readable writing. New York: Harper. Firtschermann, N.S., Deshler, D.D., & Schumaker, J.B. (2007). The effects of instruction in an inference strategy on the reading comprehension skills of adolescents with disabilities. *Learning Disability Quarterly*, 30, 245-262. Fromkin, V., Rodman, R.,

- & Hyams, N. (2003). An introduction to languages (7th ed.). U.S.: Wadsworth. Glass, A.L. & Perna, J. (1986). The role of syntax in reading disability. *Journal of Learning Disability*, 19(6), 354-359. Guthrie, J.T., Wigfield, A., Humenick, N.M., Perencevich, K.C., Taboada, A., & Barbosa, P. (2006). Influences of stimulating tasks on reading motivation and comprehension. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 99(4), 232-245.
- Heilman, A. W., Blair, T. R., & Rupley, W. H. (2002). Principles and Practices of Teaching Reading (10th ed.). New Jersey: Merrill Prentice Hall.
- Henley, J. (2009). Hiding in plain sight: Animal camouflage. *Landmark English*, 20-22. Hirsch, E.D. (2003). Reading comprehension requires knowledge – of words and the world: scientific insights into the fourth-grade slump and the nations’ stagnant comprehension scores. *American Educator*, 27(1), 10-44. Hoen-Tengesdal, I. (2010). Is the simple view of reading too simple? *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, 54(5), 451-469. Horwitz, E. K., Horwitz, M. B., & Cope, J. (1986). Foreign language classroom anxiety. *The Modern Language Journal*, 70(2), 125-132.
- Howe, D.H. (1987). *The Bottle Imp*. Oxford University Press. Hsiao, H.W. (2001). Comics literacy: A study of junior high school students. *Public Opinion Research Quarterly*, 215, 20-44. Hsueh-chao, M.H. & Nation, P. (2000). Unknown vocabulary density and reading comprehension. *Reading in a Foreign Language*, 13(1), 403-430. Huang, C.C. (2004). University students’ vocabulary knowledge, content knowledge and reading comprehension. *Journal of National University of Taiwan*, 38(1), 125-153. Huang, Y.L. (2005). The effects of pictures on reading comprehension of third-year junior high school students in reading selections of American festivals. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Chen Kung, Tainan City. Jafarigohar, M. & Behrooznia, S. (2012). The effect of anxiety on reading comprehension among distance EFL learners. *International Education Studies*, 5(2), 159-174. Jean-Pierre, J.R. (2011). Does size matter? The relationship between breadth and depth. *Sophia International Review*, 33, 107-120. Jitendra, A.K., Burgess, C. & Gajria, M. (2011). Cognitive strategy instruction for improving expository text comprehension of students with learning disabilities: The quality of evidence. *Council of Exceptional Children*, 77(2), 135-159. Kao, P.C. & Craigie, P. (2010). Foreign language anxiety and English achievement in Taiwanese undergraduate English-major students: An empirical study. *Bulletin on Hungkuang Institute of Technology*, 61, 49-61. Kellogg, R.T. (2003). *Cognitive psychology* (2nd ed.). California: Sage Publication. Kraayenoord, C.E.V., Beinicke, A., Schlagmuler, M., & Schneider, W. (2012). Word identification, metacognitive knowledge, motivation and reading comprehension: An Australian study of grade 3 and 4 pupils. *Australian Journal of Language and Literacy*, 35(1), 51-68. Krashen, S. (1981). Second language acquisition and second language learning. Oxford: Pergamon Press. Laufer, B. (1992). How much lexis is necessary for reading comprehension? In J. L. Arnaud & H. Bejoint (Eds.), *Vocabulary and applied linguistics* (pp. 126-132). London: MacMillan. Laufer, B. & Ravenhorst-Kalovski, G.C. (2010). Lexical threshold revisited: Lexical text coverage, learners’ vocabulary size and reading comprehension. *Reading in a Foreign Language*, 22(1), 15-30. Laufer, B. & Sim, D.D. (1985). Measuring and explaining the threshold needed for English for academic purposes texts. *Foreign Language Annals*, 18(5), 405-411. Lehr, F. (1987). Story grammar. *The Reading Teacher*, 34, 261-268. Lent, J. A. (2001). Illustrating Asia: Comics, humor magazines, and picture books. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon press. Levie, W.H. & Lentz, R. (1982). Effects of text illustrations: A review of research. *Education Communication and Technology Journal*, 30, 195 – 232. Levin, J.R., Anglin, G.J., & Carney, R.N. (1987). On empirically validating functions of pictures in prose. In D. M. Willows & H. A. Houghton (Eds.) *The psychology of illustration: Volume I. Basic research* (pp. 51 – 86). New York: Springer-Verlag. Liu, J. (2004). Effects of comic strips on L2 learners’ reading comprehension. *TESOL Quarterly*, 38(2), 225-245. McCloud, S. (1993). *Understanding comics: The invisible art*. New York: Harper. McVicker, C.J. (2007). Comic strips as a text structure for learning to read. *The Reading Teacher*, 61(1), 85-88. Meskin, A. (2007). Defining Comics? *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 65(4), 369-379. Morrison, T.G., Bryan, G., & Chilcoat, G.W. (2002). Using student-generated comic books in the classroom. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 45(8), 758-767. Nation, I.S.P. (1990). *Teaching and learning vocabulary*. New York: Heinle. Nation, I.S.P. (2001). *Learning vocabulary in another language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. National Institute of Child Health and Human Development. (2000). Report of the national reading panel. *Teaching children to read: An evidence-based assessment of the scientific research literature on reading and its implications for reading instruction*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office. Oakley, G. (2011). The assessment of reading comprehension cognitive strategies: Practices and perceptions of Western Australian teachers. *Australian Journal of Language and Literacy*, 34(3), 279- 293. Pan, Y.C. & Pan, Y.C. (2009). The effects of pictures on the reading comprehension of low-proficiency Taiwanese English foreign language college students: An action study. *VNU Journal of Science, Foreign Language*, 25, 186-198. Parsons, J. & Smith, K. (1993). Using comic books to teach. *Education Resources Information Center*, 1- 13. Pratt, H.J. (2009). Narrative in comics. *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 67(1), 107-117. Pu, L.C. (2003). A pilot study of reading comprehension problems in English encountered by Taiwanese senior high school students. *Journal of Far East University General Education*, 20(4), 957-965. Qian, D. (2002). Investigating the relationship between vocabulary knowledge and academic reading performance: an assessment perspective. *Language Learning*, 52(3), 513-536. O’Neil, K.E. (2011). Reading pictures: developing visual literacy for greater comprehension. *The Reading Teacher*, 3(65), 214-223. Ranker, J. (2007). Using comic books as read-alouds: Insights on reading instruction from an English as a second language classroom. *The Reading Teacher*, 61(4), 296-305. Saraceni, M. (2003). *The language of comics*. London: Routledge. Schmitt, N. (2000). *Vocabulary in language teaching*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. Schwartz, A. & Rubinstein-Avila, E. (2006). Understand the manga hype: uncovering the multimodality of comic-book illiteracies. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 50, 40-49. Scott, C.M. (2009). A case for the sentence in reading comprehension. *Language, Speech, and Hearing Services in Schools*, 40, 184-191. Sedita, J. (2005). Effective vocabulary instruction. *Insights on Learning Disabilities*, 2(1), 33-45. Shen, Z. (2008). The roles of depth and breadth of vocabulary knowledge in EFL reading performance. *Asian Social Science*, 4(12), 135-137. Shih, F.Y. (2008). Reading difficulties encountered by Taiwanese senior high school students. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Tamkang, New Taipei City. Shih, P.Y. (2006). Effects of newspaper comics on English reading and writing of EFL

students in vocational high school. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. National Kaohsiung Normal University, Kaohsiung City. Steinberg, D.D. (1980). Teaching reading to nursery school children: Final report. Washington, DC: Office of Education, US Department of Education. Steinberg, D.D. (1982). Psycholinguistics: Language, mind and world. London: Longman. Steinberg, D.D. & Sciarini N.V. (2006). An introduction to psycholinguistics. (2nd ed.). UK: Longman. Stetter, M.E. & Hughes, M.T. (2010). Using story grammar to assist students with learning difficulties and reading difficulties improve their comprehension. *Education and Treatment of Children*, 33(1), 115- 151. Tannenbaum, K.R., Torgesen, J.K., & Wagner, R.K. (2006). Relationships between word knowledge and reading comprehension in third-grade children. *Scientific Studies of Reading*, 10(4), 381-398. The Far East Book Company. (2004). GEPT basic level reading comprehension questions. Taipei: The Far East Book Company. Thibedeau, J. (2009). The young king. *Live Interactive English Magazine*, 10-14. Thorndyke, P.W. (1977). Cognitive structures in reading comprehension and memory of narrative discourse. *Cognitive Psychology*, 9, 77-110. Vazalwar, C. (2011). Effect of anxiety on reading comprehension in English. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 1(7), 272-278. Visitin, F. (2003). William Shakespeare: Hamlet Prince of Denmark. Raynes, R (Eds.). Canterbury: Black Cat. Wang, J.H.Y. & Guthrie, J.T. (2004). Modeling the effects of intrinsic motivation, extrinsic motivation, amount of reading, and past reading achievement on text comprehension between U.S. and Chinese students. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 39(2), 162-186. Wang, K.C. (2005). Vocabulary learning difficulties for Senior I students in Taiwan. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, National Chengchi University, Taipei City. Wright, A. (1989). Pictures for language learning. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Wu, H.J. (2011). Anxiety and reading comprehension performance in English as a foreign language. *Asian EFL Journal*, 13(2), 273-307. Wu, Y.M. (2008). Junior high school low achievers ' English reading comprehension difficulties in Taiwan. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, National Taiwan University of Science and Technology, Taipei City. Young, K. (2010). Twilight: The graphic novel volume 1. New York: Yen Press. Zhao, N. (2007). A study of high school students ' English learning anxiety. *Asian EFL Journal*, 9(3), 22-34.