

# A study of the relationships among the perception gaps of crisis situations, response strategies, expectations and the c

施秋雲、姚惠忠

E-mail: 352418@mail.dyu.edu.tw

## ABSTRACT

This research adopts the experimental approach to collect information regarding Mainland imports of Taiwan manufactured melamine tainted milk crisis as the study case, and furthermore, explores the perception gaps as well as crisis communication effects stemmed from organization and audience situation awareness, the strategies and expectation cognitions.

Crisis countermeasure strategy serves as the variable to be manipulated and there are four teams concurrently existed. Findings of this research revealed that: 1. There had been four countermeasure strategies within this research (denial, excuse, rationalization and concession) which would pose significant differences toward tester's crisis communication effect. Suppose the organization assumes "concession strategy" whereas this could turn out to be more positive in the context of crisis communication effect. Nonetheless testers would be highly susceptible to interpretation with less anger exhibition, more positive for the organization reputation and less negative image created from "word-of-mouth". Nevertheless, if it adopts "denial", "excuse" and "rationalization" strategies, then all the organization would get in return would be negative aspects from four of the crisis communication effects emanated in anger, less susceptible to interpretation, organization reputation tarnishing and negative responses from word-of-mouth. 2. In the situational awareness gap aspect, the smallest gap was found for the situational awareness gap of the testers who agreed to situational tests. 3. In the strategy cognitive gap aspect, the most significant one was the using of the concession strategy. 4. In the expectation cognitive gap aspect, the most significant one was also the using of the concession strategy.

Keywords : Melamine、 Situational awareness gap、 Strategy cognitive gap、 Expectation cognitive gap、 crisis communication effects

## Table of Contents

### 內容目錄

中文摘要.....	iii
英文摘要.....	iv
致謝辭.....	v
內容目錄.....	vi
表目錄.....	viii
圖目錄.....	x
第一章 緒論.....	1
第一節 研究背景與動機.....	1
第二節 研究目的.....	4
第二章 文獻探討.....	6
第一節 危機與危機情境.....	6
第二節 危機反應策略.....	12
第三節 期望認知缺口.....	20
第四節 危機溝通效果.....	22
第三章 研究方法.....	26
第一節 研究架構與假設.....	26
第二節 實驗設計.....	29
第三節 變數之操作性定義與衡量.....	35
第四節 資料分析方法.....	39
第四章 研究分析.....	44
第一節 描述性統計與信效度分析.....	44
第二節 操弄檢測.....	52

第三節 情境缺口與溝通效果.....	53
第四節 危機反應策略與溝通效果.....	57
第五節 策略缺口與危機溝通效果.....	60
第六節 期望缺口與危機溝通效果.....	64
第五章 結論與建議.....	68
第一節 研究結論與管理建議.....	68
第二節 研究限制與後續研究方向.....	73
參考文獻.....	76
附錄A A公司對情境的描述.....	86
附錄B A公司的策略反應.....	87
附錄C 研究問卷.....	88

## 表目錄

表2-1 Coombs(1995)危機分類表.....	9
表2-2 Bradford and Garrett情境分類.....	11
表2-3 Benoit and Pang(2008)形象修護策略.....	15
表2-4 Huang et al.(2005)形象修護策略分類與定義.....	16
表3-1 實驗設計.....	30
表3-2 問卷內容.....	30
表4-1 樣本背景資料.....	45
表4-2 各題項與構面描述性統計.....	47
表4-3 危機情境/反應策略對三類缺口統計.....	49
表4-4 危機溝通效果各構面信效度分析.....	51
表4-5 操弄檢測分析.....	52
表4-6 不同危機情境之情境缺口差異分析樣本.....	54
表4-7 情境缺口與危機溝通效果之相關分析.....	54
表4-8 情境缺口與生氣之線性迴歸分析.....	55
表4-9 情境缺口與解釋接受程度之線性迴歸分析.....	56
表4-10情境缺口與組織聲譽之線性迴歸分析.....	56
表4-11情境缺口與負面口碑之線性迴歸分析.....	57
表4-12反應策略對危機責任與溝通效果之差異分析.....	59
表4-13不同危機反應策略之策略缺口差異分析.....	60
表4-14策略缺口與危機溝通效果之相關分析.....	61
表4-15策略缺口與生氣之線性迴歸分析.....	61
表4-16策略缺口與解釋接受程度之線性迴歸分析.....	62
表4-17策略缺口與組織聲譽之線性迴歸分析.....	63
表4-18策略缺口與負面口碑之線性迴歸分析.....	63
表4-19不同危機反應策略之期望缺口差異分析.....	64
表4-20期望缺口與危機溝通效果之相關分析.....	65
表4-21期望缺口與生氣之線性迴歸分析.....	65
表4-22期望缺口與解釋接受程度之線性迴歸分析.....	66
表4-23期望缺口與組織聲譽之線性迴歸分析.....	66
表4-24期望缺口與負面口碑之線性迴歸分析.....	67

## 圖目錄

圖2-1 危機類型與溝通策略對照圖.....	13
圖2-2 組織危機情境與回應策略關係圖.....	19
圖3-1 研究架構.....	27

## REFERENCES

一、中文部份朱延智(2002), 企業危機管?, 台?市:五南出版社。朱愛群(2002), 危機管理解讀災難謎咒, 台北市:五南出版社。朱慧君(2003), 情境、形象修護策略與策略效果之關聯性研究 - 以男性政治人物性醜聞為例, 私立世新大學傳播研究所為出版知碩士論文。

李武忠(2009), 食品安全的危機處理, 2009年11月07日取自蘋果日報, 蘋果日報網址

[http://tw.nextmedia.com/applenews/article/art\\_id/20091107/IssueID/20091107](http://tw.nextmedia.com/applenews/article/art_id/20091107/IssueID/20091107)。吳宜蓁(2005), 危機傳播——公共關係與語藝觀點的論點與實證, 台北市:五南出版社。林震岩(2007), 多變量分析:SPSS的操作與應用, 台北:智勝。姚惠忠(2009), 公共關係學-理論與實務, 台北:五南圖書出版公司。姚惠忠、汪睿祥(2008), 候選人危機情境分類之探討, 選舉研究期刊, 第十五卷第二期。姚惠忠、粘淑菁(2006a), 候選人危機反應策略之探討-以胡志強競選2005年台中市長為例, 選舉評論, 1: 1-23。姚惠忠、粘淑菁(2006b), 候選人競選期間形象修護策略之研究-以2005年台北縣長候選人周錫璋為例, 關係管理研究, 4: 111-132。張依依(2007), 公共關係理論的演進與變遷, 台北市:五南圖書出版公司。陳國明, 彭文正, 葉銀嬌, 安然(2010), 傳播研究方法, 台北:威仕曼文化。蔡進雄(1998), 組織危機管理策略, 人力發展月刊, 57, 52-59。二、外文部分Barton,L.(2001). Crisis in Organization II. Cincinnati: South-Western.Benoit, W. L., & Brinson, S. L. (1994). AT and T: Apologies are not enough. *Communication Quarterly* 42: 75-88.Benoit, W. L. (1995). Accounts, excuses, and apologies: A theory of image restoration strategies. Albany: State University of New York Press.Benoit,W.L. (1997). Image repair discourse and crisis communication. *Public Relations Review* 23(2): 177-186.Benoit, W. L. (2000). Another visit to the theory of image restoration strategies. *Communication Quarterly*, 48, 40-44.Benoit, W. L. (2004). Image restoration discourse and crisis communication. In D. P. Millar & R. L. Heath (Eds.), *Responding to crisis: A rhetorical approach to crisis communication* (pp. 263- 280). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.Benoit,W. L.,& Brinson, S. L.(1999).Queen elizabeth ' s image repair discourse: Insensitive royal or compassionate queen? *Public Relations Review* 25(2): 145-156.Benoit,W. L., & Pang, A.(2008). Crisis Communication and image repair discourse.In T.L.Hansen – Horn & B.D.Neff (Eds.), *Public relations:Form theory to practice*. (pp.241-261).Boston,Massachusetts:Pearson.Benson, J. A.(1988). “ Crisis revised: An Analysis of Strategies Used by Tylenol in the second Tampering Episode. ” *Central States Speech Journal* 39: 49-66.Blumstein P. W., Carsow, K. G., Hall, J., Hawkins, B., Hoffman, R., Ishem, E., Mauer, C. P., Spens, D., Taylor, J., & Zimmerman, D. L. (1974). The honoring of account. *American Sociological Review*, 40, 551-566.Bradford, J. L., & Garrett,D.E. (1995). The effectiveness of corporate communicative responses to accusations of unethical behavior. *Journal of Business Ethics* 14: 875-892.Cooper, M. M. (1997).Working with senior management in a crisis. *Public Relations Tactics*, 4(3), 1, 12.Coombs, W. T. (1995). Choosing the right words: The development of guidelines for the selection of the ‘ appropriate ’ crisis- response strategies. *Management Communication Quarterly* 8(4): 447-476.Coombs, W. Timothy. (1998). An analytic framework for crisis situations:Better responses from a better understanding of the situation. *Journal of Public Relations Research* 10(3) : 177-191Coombs,W.T. (1999a).Information and communication in Crisis responses:atest of their effect. *Journal of Public Relations Research*,11(2),125-142.Coombs,W.T.(1999b).Ongoing crisis communication: Planning, management, and responding. CA: Sage Publications.Coombs,W.Timothy. (2004). A theoretical frame for post-crisis communication: situational crisis communication theory, in Martinko, M.J. (Ed.), *Attribution theory in the organizational sciences: Theoretical and empirical contributions*, Information Age Publishing, Greenwich, CT, pp. 275-96.Coombs,W.T. (2006). The protective powers of crisis response strategies: Managing reputational assets during a crisis. *Journal of Promotion Management* 12: 241 – 259.Coombs,W.T.(2007). “ Academic Research Protecting Organization Reputations During a Crisis: The Development and Application of Situational Crisis Communication Theory. ” *Corporate Reputation Review* 10(3), 163 – 176.Coombs,W.T, & Holladay S. J.(1996).Communication and attributions in a crisis: An experimental study in crisis communication. *Journal of Public Relations Research*, 8(4), 279-295.Coombs, W. T.,& Holladay S. J. (2002). Helping crisis managers protect reputational assets: Initial tests of the situational crisis communication theory. *Management Communication Quarterly*, 16(2): 165-186.Coombs,W.T.&Holladay S. J.(2005). Exploratory study of stakeholder emotions: Affect and crisis. In N. M. Ashkanasy, W. J. Zerbe, & C. E. J. Hartel (Eds.), *Research on emotion in organizations: The effect of affect in organizational settings* (pp. 271 – 288). New York: Elsevier.Coombs, W. T., & Holladay S. J.(2007).The negative communication dynamic: Exploring the impact of stakeholder affect on behavioral intention. *Journal of Communication Management* 11(4), 300 – 312.Coombs,W.T.,&Holladay S. J.(2008).Comparing apology to equivalent crisis response strategies: Clarifying apology ' s role and value in crisis communication. *Public Relations Review* 34(3), 252-257.Coombs, W. Timothy, and L. Schmidt. (2000). An empirical analysis of image restoration: Texaco ' s racism crisis. *Journal of Public Relations Research* 12: 163-178.Crescenzo, S. (1997). Trouble under the Golden arches: An American Icon ' s PR crisis. *Public Relations Tactics*, 4(9), 1, 24.Em Griffin,(2006), “ A First Look at Communication Theory. ” (6rd ed). New York: McGraw-Hill Companies.Fearn, K. ( 1996 ) .Crisis Communication:A Casebook Approach. New Jersey:Lawrence Erlbaum .Fombrun, C. J., & Van Riel, C. B. M. (2003). The reputational landscape. *Corporate Reputation Review*, 1(1), 5-13.Hearit, K. M.(1996).The use of counter-attack in apologetic Public Relations Crises:The case of general motors vs. Dateline NBC.Helth,R.L.(1994).Management of corporate communication:form interpersonal contacts to external affairs hillsdale. New Jersey:Laur-ence Erlbaum Association.Huang, Y. H., Y. H. Lin, & S. H. Su.(2005). “ Crisis Communicative Strategies: Category, Continuum, and Cultural Implication in Taiwan. ” *Public Relations Review*, 31: 229-238.Huang, Y. H.(2006).Crisis situation, communication strategies, and media coverage: A multicast study revisiting the communicative response model. ” *Communication Research* 33(3), 180-205.Huang, Y. H. (2008). Trust and relational commitment in corporate crises: The effects of crisis communicative strategy and form of crisis response. *Journal of Public Relations Research*, 20(2), 297-327.Hwang, S.,& Cameron, G. T.(2008). Public ' s expectation about an organization ' s stance in crisis communication based on perceived leadership and perceived severity of threats. *Public Relations Review* 34: 70-73.Jorgensen, B. K. (1996). Components of consumer reaction to companyrelated mishaps: A structural equation model approach, *Advances in Consumer Research*, 23, 346-351.Kauffman, J. (1997). NASA in crisis: The Space Agency ' s PR efforts regarding the Hubble Space Telescope. *Public Relations Review*, 23(1), 1-10.Kasunic, D. K. (1989). Issues management versus crisis management: A comparative study of their effectiveness. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Wayne State University, Detroit, Michigan.Lerbinger,O.(1997). The Crisis Manager Facing Risk and

Responsibility. NJ:Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.Liu, B. F.(2007). President Bush ' s major post-Katrina speeches: Enhancing image repair discourse theory applied to the public sector. *Public Relations Review*,33,40-48.Parasuraman,A.,Zeithaml,V.A.,& Berry,L.L.(1985).A conceptual model of service quality and its implications for future research.*Journal of Marketing*,49(3),41-50Parasuraman,A.,Zeithaml,V.A.,& Berry,L.L.(1988).SERVQUAL:A multiple-item scale for measuring consumer perceptions of service quality. *Journal of Retailing*,64(1),12-40Ray, S. J. (1999). *Strategic Communication in Crisis Management: Lessons from the Airline Industry*.Reichert, J.(2003). A theoretical exploration of expectational gaps in the corporate issue construct. *Coporate Reputation Review*,6(2),58-69Sen, F., & Egelhoff, W. G. (1991). Six years and counting: Learning from crisis management at Bhopal. *Public Relations Review*, 17(1), 69- 83.Siomkos, G. J., & Kurzbard, G.. (1994). The hidden crisis in product harm crisis management. *European Journal of Marketing*, 28(2), 30-41.Small, W. J. (1991). Exxon Valdez: How to spend billions and still get a balck eye. *Public Relations Review*, 17(1), 9-25.Sheldon, C. A., & Sallot, L. M. (2009). Image repair in politics: Testing effects of communication strategy and performance history in a faux pas, *Journal of Public Relations Research*, 21(1): 25-50.Statesman, A. (1997). Mattel ' s response to ' Cabbage ' attacks. *Public Relations Tactics*, 4(3), 1, 20.Stocker, K. P.(1997). A strategic approach to crisis management. In C. L. Caywood (ed.), *The handbook of strategic PR & integrated communications*. NY: McGraw-Hill.Sturges, D. L.(1994). " Communication through crisis: A strategy for organizational survival. " *Management Communication Quarterly* 7(3), 297-316.Ulmer, R.R., Seeger, M. W., Sellnow, T.L. (2007). Post-crisis communication and renewal: Expanding the parameters of post-crisis discourse. " *Public Relations Review* 33(2), 130-134.